

St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee

Minutes

Thursday, April 28, 2022

Electronic Participation at 2:30 pm

Members:

Brian Narhi
Holly Washuta
Andrew Humeniuk
David Bergen
John Bacher

Regrets:

John Crawley
Robert De Wolfe

Staff Liaison:

James Neilson, Heritage Planner, Planning and Building Services
Margaret Josipovic, Manager, Planning and Building Services

Council:

Councilor Ward 6, Carlos Garcia

1. **Call meeting to order (Chair)**
Chair Narhi called the meeting to order at 2:31p.m.
2. **Recognition of Traditional Territories**
Chair Narhi acknowledged that the land which we call St. Catharines and the Niagara region is the ancestral territory of Haudenosaunee and Anishinaabe peoples, many of whom continue to live and work here today. This Land is covered by the Upper Canada Treaties and the Dish with One Spoon Wampum agreement. Today this Land is home to many First Nations, Metis, and Inuit Peoples – who share the land with us. This Land Acknowledgement is a statement that reminds us that our standard of living is directly related to the resources and friendship of Indigenous people over many generations.
3. **Additions / Deletions to the Agenda**

Item 9.1 was added to the agenda regarding the application for 21 Verdun Avenue

4. **Motion to approve the agenda**

Moved by: John Bacher

“That the SChPAC adopt the agenda for this SCPAC meeting held on Thursday, April 28th, 2022, copies having been previously distributed.”

CARRIED

5. **Motion to adopt the minutes of the previous meeting**

Moved by: Holly Washuta

“That the SChPAC adopt the minutes of the previous meeting on Thursday, March 31th, 2021, as amended.”

6. **Declarations of Interest**

No Declarations of Interest

7. **Presentations (invited guests)**

1. Regarding Item 9.1

Debbie Inglis, Owner, 21 Verdun Avenue

Michael Miryneck, Architect

2. Regarding Item 9.2

Jonathan Kiam-Pupu and Pastor Dayo Adeyemo, RCCG Royal House

Sonia Portillo and Raul Lovo, R&S Roofing and Renovation Company

3. Regarding Item 9.3

Jim Prendergast, owner, 132 Main Street

Dev Bingham, Architect

8. **Business arising from the minutes**

No Business arising from the minutes

9. Business

9.1. 21 Verdun Avenue

The proposed new residence in the Port Dalhousie Heritage Conservation District, 21 Verdun Avenue, was presented by the applicant's architect Michael Mirynech. Michael provided an overview of the design of the residence and noted that the purpose of this design was to keep the scale and size of the house sympathetic to the street and the character of the area.

Councilor Garcia had a question about whether the garage has an entrance to the house and whether there were any stairs required to access it. Michael Mirynech responded that there would be a step due to the grade heights and also that the offset is required due to carbon monoxide concerns and the building code. Brian Narhi asked about the setback distance of the garage from the front façade. Michael Mirynech responded that zoning requires one metre setback from the face of the building to the front of the garage. Michael explained that the illusion of garage setback is more significant due to the porch extending significantly from the front façade. Holly Washuta liked the design and is in support of this design.

Motion By: Holly Washuta

"That the SChPAC recommends approval of the proposed residence at 21 Verdun Avenue"

CARRIED

9.2. 95 Church Street (Former First United Church)

Dr. Dayo Adeyemo, the pastor at the church at 95 Church Street, spoke about the proposed alteration to the Former First United Church on 95 Church Street. The proposal is to remove the slate roof which is in significant disrepair and causing damage to the building's interior, and to replace the slate with a fiberglass shingle that mimics the existing roof. Staff originally suggested repairing the existing slates, but the church hired a roofing contractor whose investigation showed that it is costly and beyond a state of feasible repair. Two options for colours were proposed: a solid dark colour or a mixed of dark shades. The committee believed that a solid colour roof option was preferred in order to match the existing roof. Holly Washuta asked Dr. Adeyemo if they had looked into metal roofing for a longer lifespan. He responded that the metal roofing would change the aesthetics of the building significantly. James Neilson said that the

church was designated, and the slate was an attribute; that's why approval was required. Andrew asked if there was any consideration for salvaging some of the slate and using the old slate for fundraising purposes or reselling as it has some retained value. Dr. Adeyemo was open to this idea.

Motion By: David Begen

"That the SCHPA recommends approval of the proposed alterations to 95 Church Street using a fiberglass shingle that is consistent in solid dark color with the existing church roof today.

And that if feasible, the SCHPAC recommends the salvage of the slate roof materials for fundraising or reuse."

CARRIED

9.3. 132 Main Street

The owners Jim and Christine Prendergast and his architect Dev Bingham spoke about the proposed demolition of 132 Main Street due to problems with the foundation. The property on 132 Main Street was previously before the Committee, and approved by both the Committee and the Committee of Adjustment. Unfortunately, upon further investigation, they discovered that the current foundation would not be able to support extra weight from the proposed addition to the house. The applicant is looking at rebuilding with the same fundamental design that the heritage committee previously approved but with a new foundation and structural components that can only be completed with the existing house removed.

Bran Narhi asked if the concrete deterioration was just on one wall. Dev responded that deterioration happened on each wall, and two engineers inspected the walls and came to the same conclusion. In addition, there are problems with plumbing and the backups from previous renovations of the last owners, which makes the existing basic conditions not suitable for the property owners to move into. David Bergen asked about the feasibility of lifting the house to build a new foundation and then putting it back. Dev Bingham responded that the cost to remedy the situation as is around \$140,000, and additional costs would be beyond the means of the owners. Also, the house would need to be stripped back to the studs because of the existing electrical and plumbing conditions, cost-effectiveness, and framing quality. Councilor Carlos Garcia asked about the need for the addition. The owners said the current space lacks an upstairs bathroom which is a need for aging-in-place and that they would like to have space to accommodate their family when they visit. Brian asked if there would be any interior features or if anything is salvageable that could be incorporated into a new build. Dev said they would try to retain items that are deemed significant. Holly Washuta asked if they were going to build it exactly as it was. Dev said the plan is to keep the front façade

the same, but we extended the roofline back to pick up the rare edition to gain the additional space.

James Neilson summarized the applicant's proposal and explained how it relates to the heritage district. James noted that the committee already approved the proposed plans but that due to extenuating circumstances, the “bones” of the building would need to be replaced. Ultimately the aesthetics of the building will remain, which is an important part of the goals of the heritage conservation district.

Motion: Brian Narhi

“That the SChPAC recommends approval of the proposed demolition of 132 Main Street

And that the SChPA recommends approval of the proposed new residence, which will match the residence approved by committee in December 2021, with minor changes as noted in the April 2022 application submission, and which will reuse interior materials and architectural elements where feasible.”

CARRIED

9.4. 16 Lock Street

The proposed demolition of a Part V property in the Port Dalhousie Heritage Conservation District, 16 Lock Street (Sales Centre), was presented by James Neilson. The Sales Center was built in 2012, but because it is in the Port Dalhousie Heritage Conservation District, the demolition requires Council approval. James noted the building is not a heritage structure and has no redeeming features.

Motion: Holly Washuta

“That the SChPAC approve demolition for Sales Center on 16 Lock Street”

CARRIED

9.5. Heritage Committee Update

James Neilson provided an update regarding the April Heritage Committee.

Motion: John Bacher

“That the SChPAC receive the update from James Neilson regarding the Heritage Committee Updates”

CARRIED

10. Items of Correspondence

No Items of Correspondence

11. Date of next meeting

May 26th, 2022

12. Motion to Adjourn

Moved by John Bacher

“That the SChPAC meeting be adjourned at 3:28 pm.”

CARRIED