

St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee

Minutes

Thursday, February 24, 2022

Electronic Participation at 2:30pm

Members:

Brian Narhi
Holly Washuta
John Bacher
David Bergen

Regrets:

John Crawley
Andrew Humeniuk
Robert De Wolfe

Staff Liaison:

James Neilson, Heritage Planner, Planning and Building Services

Council:

Councilor Ward 6, Carlos Garcia

1. **Call meeting to order (Chair)**

Chair Brian Narhi called the meeting to order at 2:30 p.m.

2. **Recognition of Traditional Territories**

Chair Brian Narhi acknowledged that the land which we call St. Catharines and the Niagara region is the ancestral territory of Haudenosaunee and Anishinaabe peoples, many of whom continue to live and work here today. This Land is covered by the Upper Canada Treaties and the Dish with One Spoon Wampum agreement. Today this Land is home to many First Nations, Metis, and Inuit Peoples – who share the land with us. This Land Acknowledgement is a statement that reminds us that our standard of living is directly related to the resources and friendship of Indigenous peoples.

3. **Additions / Deletions to the Agenda**

James Neilson added Item 9.2 for a presentation going over the 2022 work plan and 2021 statistics about the accomplishments that were presented to the Cultural Sustainability Committee.

4. **Motion to approve the agenda**

Moved by: Holly Washuta

“That the SChPAC adopt the agenda for this SChPAC meeting held on Thursday, February 24th, 2022, copies having been previously distributed.”

CARRIED

5. **Motion to adopt the minutes of the previous meeting**

Moved by: Holly Washuta

“That the SChPAC adopt the meetings of the SChPAC meeting held on January 27, 2022 copies having been previously distributed.”

CARRIED

6. **Declarations of Interest**

None

7. **Presentations (invited guests)**

1. Tom Mazzone, Owner, 46 Canal Street
Michael Mirynech, 2M Architects

8. **Business arising from the minutes**

- None

9. **Business**

9.1 46 Canal Street

Michael Mirynech began the presentation by going over the existing site and proposed additions to the residence. He stated that there is no resemblance to the original building which was altered prior to the implementation of the Heritage District and that it has been completely refaced with a second storey added to it.

Brian asked about the existing outbuilding at the rear of the property proposed for removal, and Michael responded that it has one central window at the front and door on the side and a very little street presence because of the mature landscaping. Councilor Carlos Garcia shared some history about the property stating that it was previously owned by a young builder named David Funk who had built the garage in question, and that it was likely built no earlier than 1990. Councilor Garcia added that Mr. Funk had sold the house and the whole house was redone in 2001 with a second story was added. Brian commented that the construction in 2001 was likely around the time when the HCD was being created and that maybe committees were not as vigilant about things. Councilor Garcia noted that the heritage committee was not formed until 2004. Michael added that from a design perspective, heritage guidelines require a distinction to be made between an addition and an original structure. After the second-floor addition they kept the addition looking like the existing and did not make that aesthetic separation between the two since there was no original heritage fabric remaining. Holly Washuta asked if the area above the proposed garage was intended to be an apartment or part of the rest of the house. Tom responded that it was part of the house. Michael added that it is a bonus room above and there is access off the existing stairwell.

Motion By: Holly Washuta

“That the SChPAC recommends approval of the proposed alterations to the property at 46 Canal Street

And that the SChPAC recommends approval of the proposed demolition of the existing accessory building.”

CARRIED

9.2 2022 Workplan Update and 2021 Accomplishments

James Neilson gave a presentation outlining what the committee did last year. Brian asked if the 2022 work plan is to carry on the status quo. James responded that there nothing new to add to the work plan for this year.

Motion By: John Bacher

“Motion to receive the report by James Neilson.”

CARRIED

10. Items of Correspondence

David Bergen added that a few years ago they turned down a demolition on a house on Simcoe Street that was built in 1840 and had many issues with it. David added that the homeowner had done an excellent job restoring the house and the person that was going to move it wanted to tear it down and rebuild. David suggested that the committee do a house visit and look at the house that did not get demolished despite it having many inconveniences.

John Bacher suggested giving a report to council about being less skeptical when requests for demolition are turned down by the committee.

James Neilson informed the committee that Michael Seaman is no longer at the city and is now at the City of Toronto. James noted that he is now reporting to Margaret Josipovic and Tami Kitay.

Councilor Garcia shared with the committee that the report recommending addition to the heritage registry is on Council's agenda for Monday and is under the consent agenda meaning that it will not be discussed unless someone pulls it but hopefully it will go through as expected.

Referring to Item 9.2, Holly asked if the Committee had voted on the Welland House Hotel in 2021 and what section of the statistics that would have fallen under. James responded that it would have been included as a demolition of the Part IV Designated property.

Holly asked if we ever considered expanding our heritage districts like a Queen Mary Woodrow District, Western Hill, St Paul West District or having separate districts for downtown. James stated that there have been past discussions about this, but it is not in the work plan at the moment, and they are not actively pursuing it. Brian added that they have been talking about doing something downtown in partnership with the Downtown BIA to create a downtown heritage district for the past five to six years and considered doing something in-house. However, at the time it would have been a lot of work for the committee. James noted that around 20 downtown properties have been added to the heritage register so far in 2022, which will help to add a layer of protection.

John Bacher asked if there are any secondary plans in the area it could be complimented by a heritage plan. Director Tami Kitay added that secondary plan kicking off this year is the Ontario Street corridor secondary plan which captures Ontario Street between the QEW and Welland Avenue but predominantly focuses on the Ontario Street 282 and 285 properties. Staff are working on the terms of reference for the secondary plan which will be brought to Council for their endorsement in Q2 of this year. Tami stated that they would be unable to take on any other additional secondary plan processes right now due to limited resources but agreed that heritage would be a component into any secondary plan and that the downtown is on the radar.

John asked if it were possible for updates from the heritage advisory committee to be available to the permit committee as there are members who are not on both committees. James responded that he could provide updates as necessary such as a monthly overview. Brian added that the advisory committee should also know what the permits committee is up to.

11. Date of next meeting

Thursday March 31st, 2022

12. Motion to Adjourn

Moved by: John Bacher

“That the SChPAC meeting be adjourned at 3:03 pm.”

CARRIED