

St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee

Minutes

Thursday, November 25, 2021

Electronic Participation at 2:30 pm

Members:

John Crawley
Holly Washuta
Robert De Wolfe
Dr. John Bacher
Brian Narhi
Dr. David Bergen

Absent:

Andrew Humeniuk

Staff Liaison:

James Neilson, Heritage Planner, Planning and Building Services

Council:

Councillor Ward 6, Carlos Garcia

Guests:

Vanessa Hicks – Morningstar Mill
Leo Marcantonio – 109 St. Paul Crescent (Rodman Hall)
Nino Donatelli – 109 St. Paul Crescent (Rodman Hall)
Anthony Adam – 91 Queen Street
Andrew Potter – 91 Queen Street
Dan Currie – 26-30 Ontario Street (Welland House)

-
1. **Call meeting to order (Chair)**
Chair Brian Narhi called the meeting to order at 2:36 p.m.
 2. **Recognition of Traditional Territories**

Chair Brian Narhi acknowledged that the land which we call St. Catharines, and the Niagara region is the ancestral territory of Haudenosaunee and Anishinaabe peoples, many of whom continue to live and work here today. This Land is covered by the Upper Canada Treaties and the Dish with One Spoon Wampum agreement. Today this Land is home to many First Nations, Metis, and Inuit Peoples – who share the land with us. This Land Acknowledgement is a statement that reminds us that our standard of living is directly related to the resources and friendship of Indigenous people over many generations.

3. **Additions / Deletions to the Agenda**

None

4. **Motion to approve the agenda**

Moved by: Dr. John Bacher

“That the SCHPAC adopt the agenda for this SCHPAC meeting held on Thursday, November 25, 2021, copies having been previously distributed.”

Carried

5. **Motion to adopt the minutes of the previous meeting**

Moved by: Holly Washuta

“That the SCHPAC approve the minutes of the SCHPAC meeting held on Thursday, October 28, 2021 as amended.

Carried

6. **Declarations of Interest**

None

7. **Presentations (invited guests)**

Vanessa Hicks

Regarding Item 9.1

Heritage Consultant, Morningstar Mill - 2714 Decew Road

Anthony Adams

Regarding Item 9.2

Owner, 91 Queen Street

Andrew

Window Installer, AP Glass

Nino Donatelli, Lou Marc Antonio

Regarding Item 9.3

Owner, Rodman Hall

Dan Currie

Regarding Item 9.4

8. **Business arising from the minutes**

None

9. **Business**

a) **9.1 Morningstar Mill**

Vanessa Hicks (MHBC Heritage Consultant)

Vanessa Hicks, heritage consultant for the project provided the Committee with an overview of an upcoming heritage permit application for the Morningstar Mill. The presentation began with an overview of the site, and it was noted that no decision was to be made during this committee meeting, but they will be back next month for a permit for the alterations to the property. The goal of the project is to address safety issues, introduce accessibility, restore, preserve, and stabilize elements of the mill to conserve original elements, as well as integrate new elements which are compatible with the site. An overview of the property and the proposed alterations was provided to the Committee for information purposes. Vanessa answered questions on the historical significance of the property and noted that a heritage impact assessment will be completed for the proposed alterations.

Moved by: John Bacher

“That the SCHPAC receive the information from Vanessa Hicks, MHBC, regarding the upcoming heritage permit application for the Morningstar Mill”.

Carried

b) **9.2 91 Queen Street**

Owner(s): Anthony Adams

Window Installer: Andrew Potter

Request to replace and improve windows.

Anthony Adams provided information to the Committee about his proposed window alterations. He explained how the existing windowpanes have deteriorated, letting in cold air and therefore causing increased expenses. The proposal involves the capping of the existing wooden window frames with aluminum caps and black vinyl which will be visible from the exterior. Andrew Potter who will be doing the work on the windows provided information to the

Committee and noted that the Murphy Building in Port Dalhousie is an example of similar work conducted in the area. Holly Washuta asked if the house would be painted to match the color of the new windows, but the applicant expressed that there were no plans to do so. John Crawley noted that he would like to see the existing stained-glass windows be preserved and that this project was more of a retrofit than an outright replacement. Councillor Carlos Garcia also noted the heritage redevelopment guidelines discourage the use of metal framing. Brian Narhi asked if the alterations were reversible and Andrew Potter noted that that was indeed the case. When asked about dry rot by Robert De Wolfe, Potter also noted that they have not had any issues with dry rot in similar installations elsewhere.

Moved by: John Crawley

“That the SChPAC approve the proposed window application for 91 Queen Street in the Queen Street Heritage Conservation District with the condition that the stained glass be retained and/or stored”

Carried

c) 9.3 Rodman Hall Alterations

Owner(s): Nino Donatelli, Lou Marc Antonio

Request to alter windows as part of an application to convert the building to hotel use.

The applicants began the presentation by outlining that new washrooms were required to accommodate guests as part of a new plan to convert Rodman Hall into a Hotel. Existing washrooms also required updating. To accommodate the new washrooms, vents will be required. The applicants noted that venting would occur through the roof, or through louvers installed in existing windows on secondary elevations. These vents will replace parts of some windows where glass or plywood currently exist in the window frames. Brian Narhi noted that if original glass is to be removed, he would like to see it preserved.

Moved by: Brian Narhi

“That the SChPAC approves the alterations to 109 St. Paul Crescent (Rodman Hall)”

Carried

d) **9.4 Welland House Hotel**

Owner(s): Dan Currie (MHBC Consultant)

Request to demolish the remaining building, clean up the site and implement the Documentation and Salvage Strategy.

Dan Currie, heritage consultant for the property, provided a presentation describing the building and historic importance and the overall strategy for documenting and salvaging significant heritage materials from the property after the fire that took place in July 2021. The intention of the Documentation and Salvage Strategy is to retain brick and stone from the rubble pile that have been determined to be in good condition and not contaminated by asbestos and other contaminants. Dan outlined the process for retrieving, cleaning and storing the items. The preserved materials would be reused for the redevelopment of the site either as part of a new development or as part of a commemoration strategy. Brian Narhi noted other items that the committee would like to see preserved including lamps from Casa Loma and the original bathing pools. Dan Currie agreed with Brian and would be open to preserving as much as possible though the quantity and quality of items is unknown, and it was uncertain that the pools could be salvaged but that they may be able to be documented as part of the redevelopment. Holly Washuta asked about whether a demolition contractor had been chosen by the owners and how the items will be salvaged by the contractor. She also asked whether the heritage committee can enter the site to assist in the process? Dan Currie provided the name of the demolition contractor and outlined the strategy for how the contractor will be informed about how and what to look for. He also noted that the site is restricted due to it being a construction site and a contaminated site and that the heritage consulting team will be on site to advise where possible. Robert ask if the consultant intended on videotaping the salvaging process. Dan Currie wanted to know the intent of the videotaping and noted the documentation report will be provided and outlines the contents of the report. James Neilson also noted that the proposed process is typical for the salvaging of materials and that videotaping is not a typical requirement.

Moved by: Robert De Wolfe

“That the SChPAC approves of the proposed Documentation and Salvage Strategy for 26-30 Ontario Street (Welland House) outlined in the Documentation and Salvage Report written by MHBC (dated November 2021)

And that the SChPAC recommends to St. Catharines City Council that Council should approve the heritage permit, which will result in the documentation and salvage of debris on the property and allow

for the long-term commemoration of the property as part of a future development”

Carried

10. **Items of Correspondence**

None

11. **Date of next meeting**

Thursday, December 16, 2021

12. **Motion to Adjourn**

Moved by: Robert De Wolfe

“That the SCHAC meeting be adjourned at 3:58 pm.”

Carried