

St. Catharines Heritage Advisory Committee

Minutes

Thursday, October 14, 2021

Electronic Participation at 2:30 pm

Members:

Brian Narhi
Gail Benjafield
Robert Speck
Andrew Humeniuk
Holly Washuta
John Crawley
Lorraine Giroux
Justin Nicholls
Mark Hoerd

Regrets:

Staff Liaison:

James Neilson, Heritage Planner, Planning and Building Services
Michael Seaman, Senior Project Manager, Planning and Building Services

Council:

Councilor Ward 6, Carlos Garcia

1. **Call meeting to order (Chair)**

Chair Narhi called the meeting to order at 2:30 p.m.

2. **Recognition of Traditional Territories**

Chair Narhi acknowledged that the land which we call St. Catharines and the Niagara region is the ancestral territory of Haudenosaunee and Anishinaabe peoples, many of whom continue to live and work here today. This Land is covered by the Upper Canada Treaties and the Dish with One Spoon Wampum agreement. Today this Land is home to many First Nations, Metis, and Inuit Peoples – who share the land with us. This Land Acknowledgement is a

statement that reminds us that our standard of living is directly related to the resources and friendship of Indigenous people over many generations.

3. **Additions / Deletions to the Agenda**

No Additions or Deletions

4. **Motion to approve the agenda**

Moved by: Holly Washuta

“That the SCHAC adopt the agenda for this SCHAC meeting held on Thursday, October 14, 2021, copies having been previously distributed.”

CARRIED

5. **Motion to adopt the minutes of the previous meeting**

The minutes of the September 9th meeting required the following changes:

- The motion for Item 8.3 was made by Lorraine Giroux, not Andrew Humeniuk

Moved by: Robert Speck

Motion to approve September 9th minutes as amended

CARRIED AS AMENDED

6. **Declarations of Interest**

Mark Hoerdt recused himself from the Knifeworks discussion as he is involved with the skatepark group.

Gail Benjafeld noted that she makes personal donations to the Salem Chapel and offered to make a declaration of interest on this item.

7. **Presentations (invited guests)**

Item 8.1

- Michael Graveline, Knifeworks

Item 8.2

- Noora Rizvi, Private Watson Statue

8. **Business arising from the minutes**

8.1 Private Watson Statue

Noora Rizvi, Culture Supervisor at the City of St. Catharines provided a synopsis on this issue and provided an update regarding Council's discussion about this item at the previous City Council meeting. Rizvi explained that stakeholder consultation was held with many groups, with the initial consensus being to move the statue to the Victoria Lawn Cemetery and add an indigenous perspective. Cost for the full relocation would have been \$100,000 to undertake. There was a split vote at council, and staff have been redirected to talk with the Niagara Military Museum, who were in support of taking in the monument, splitting the cost of relocation and taking responsibility for the upkeep. Plaques can be added to City Hall to recognize the statue and Private Watson.

Rizvi responded to questions from the Committee regarding:

Whose names are on the bottom of the statue?

What parts of the statue would be separated for relocation?

Will the context surrounding the statue and its relocation, as well as input from indigenous groups be provided to the public?

Moved by: Gail Benjafield

"Motion to receive the information regarding Private Watson's Statue"

CARRIED

9. **Business**

9.1 Knifeworks

Michael Graveline was intending to speak on this item, but did not show up to the meeting. The item was deferred to a future meeting.

9.2 Harriet Tubman Statue

James Neilson, Heritage Planner, provided some comments regarding the recent vandalism of the Harriet Tubman Statue at the Salem Church. The bust was pushed off its podium and damaged, with its nose completely removed. The bust needs to be completely replaced. The Church intends to fundraise for a new bust. James and Michael Seaman want to use heritage funds to help support the

church, through updating the designation bylaw to accommodate heritage attributes.

Councillor Carlos Garcia brought up the idea of repairing the statue instead of replacement. Michael Seaman noted it may be an option, as it is more cost effective. Holly Washuta questioned if we could contact the original maker of the statue in Italy, and his thoughts on the best way to proceed with either repairing or replacing the statue.

Robert Speck outlined that the committee should keep in mind the fundraising campaign is currently underway and is very successful so far.

Moved by: John Crawley

“Motion to receive the information from James Neilson and that the Heritage Committee shows its support to the Salem Chapel BME with regard to assistance to the future endeavors to replace or repair the statue as necessary.”

CARRIED

10. Updates from Sub-Committees

10.1 Designations, Plaquing and Ceremonies

No new updates

10.2 Public Outreach and Education (POE)

Lorraine Giroux outlined a specific project of the sub-committee which was to update and transfer old blog articles to the museum's website. Lorraine let the Committee know that this item will not be a priority for the group as there is a preference to focus on the heritage Register. Lorraine had three requests:

1. Gail would like her articles back for personal use
2. Brian would like recognition for his work, if they are to be used again
3. Any other authors should be recognized should the articles ever get used in the future

James noted that the museum did not want to publish the articles without updates to each of the articles and that he would check with the museum regarding the questions posed by Lorraine.

Moved by: Brian Narhi

“Motion to receive Lorraine's update”

CARRIED

10.3 Research and Inventory (R & I)

Brian noted a new data sheet created by James Neilson and liked the new survey. James noted that we should add properties on a monthly basis instead of one large batch of properties. Some confusion arose surrounding the old list of properties and if that will be used going forward to allocate properties to reduce the chance of duplication, and if the list will be updated. Andrew Humeniuk forwarded an email with the list of properties that had previously been allocated to each member. Michael Seaman noted that it does not hurt to add properties you are interested in or worried about even if they're not on the list.

Moved by: Lorraine Giroux

"Motion to receive Brian's update"

CARRIED

11. Information and Correspondence

Lorraine Giroux has additional comments regarding the work on the Welland Canals near the Merritt Trail. The citizens in the area are concerned about the impact on Lock Fourteen and damage to it. The Chestnut Street Extension is also a concern. Excavation work in the area as a part of rehabilitation of the Merritt Trail may also be an issue and citizens in the area hope that this work will not affect the heritage sites. James Neilson noted that environmental assessment projects have a heritage and archaeological component. They may also have a public meeting component. Lock 15 is also a concern for the committee. The members discussed the potential for adding Locks or Collier Sawmill to the heritage registry.

Gail asked for consistency with the SCHAC titles for Zoom meetings. James has noted this and will work to correct the issue.

12. Date of next meeting

November 11th, 2021

13. Motion to Adjourn

Moved by Mark Hoerd

"That the SCHAC meeting be adjourned at 4:10pm."

CARRIED