

St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee

Minutes

Thursday, October 28, 2021

Electronic Participation at 2:30 pm

Members:

John Crawley
Andrew Humeniuk
Holly Washuta
Robert De Wolfe
Dr. John Bacher
Brian Narhi
Dr. David Bergen

Absent:

None

Staff Liaison:

James Neilson, Heritage Planner, Planning and Building Services

Council:

Councillor Ward 6, Carlos Garcia

Guests:

John Hoar, Owner, 45 Lock Street
Nick Howes, Owner, 169 Dalhousie Avenue
Chris Venditti, Architect/Agent, 169 Dalhousie

1. **Call meeting to order (Chair)**

Chair Robert De Wolfe called the meeting to order at 2:32 p.m.

2. **Recognition of Traditional Territories**

Chair Robert De Wolfe acknowledged that the land which we call St. Catharines, and the Niagara region is the ancestral territory of Haudenosaunee and Anishinaabe peoples, many of whom continue to live and work here today. This Land is covered by the Upper Canada Treaties and the Dish with One Spoon Wampum agreement. Today this Land is home to many First Nations, Metis, and

Inuit Peoples – who share the land with us. This Land Acknowledgement is a statement that reminds us that our standard of living is directly related to the resources and friendship of Indigenous people over many generations.

3. Additions / Deletions to the Agenda

- Heritage Planner James Neilson added two items to the Agenda
 - o Update on the Welland House
 - o Rescheduling of the December 30 2021 meeting
- John Bacher added one item related to his application for the removal of his garage at 134 Church Street

4. Motion to approve the agenda

Moved by: Holly Washuta

“That the SChPAC adopt the agenda for this SChPAC meeting held on Thursday, October 28, 2021 as amended, copies having been previously distributed.”

Carried as amended

5. Motion to adopt the minutes of the previous meeting

Moved by: Holly Washuta

“That the SChPAC approve the minutes of the SChPAC meeting held on Thursday, September 30, 2021 as amended.

Carried

6. Declarations of Interest

- John Bacher recused himself from Item 9.5 as he was the applicant for this item regarding the removal of a garage on his property.

7. Presentations (invited guests)

John Hoar

Regarding Item 9.1

Owner, 45 Lock Street

Nick Howes

Regarding Item 9.2

Owner, 169 Dalhousie Avenue

Chris Venditti, Architect

8. Business arising from the minutes

None

9. Business

a) **9.1 45 Lock Street**

Owner(s): John Hoar

File No: 21 118917 HERT

Request to alter a Part V property in the Port Dalhousie HCD

John Hoar began his presentation describing the proposed work that will be done to the residence. He had previously received a heritage permit for one elevation of his residence and was seeking a heritage permit for alterations to the remainder of the house. He outlined what had been previously approved and the ongoing construction progress. His application involves changes to the windows and the creation of new windows on the secondary elevations. Mr. Hoar fielded questions on where the steel roof will be located and the designs of the three pane windows. Members of the Committee voiced their approval of the design.

Moved by: John Bacher

“That the SChPAC Approve the permit for 45 Lock Street”.

Carried

b) **9.2 169 Dalhousie Avenue**

Owner(s): Nick Howes

Agent(s): Chris Venditti, Architect

File No: 21 118912 HERT

Request to alter a Part V property in the Port Dalhousie HCD

Nick Howes introduced the project. Nick describes the preliminary concept plans for alterations to the residence which are proposed to be partially demolished, (dependent on permits) and rebuilt into a new two-storey detached dwelling. Holly Washuta and Robert De Wolfe raised questions on how a partial demolition would occur, and what would be retained. Chris Venditti, the architect was able to join the meeting at this point and provided some clarity on this topic. Councillor Garcia brought up the Port Dalhousie demolition permit policy within the Heritage District and James Neilson outlined that homes built after 1950 are not considered contributing heritage buildings according to the Heritage District Guidelines. Discussion took place about the setback of the residence and its height in comparison to the neighbours. The owner and architect confirmed that additional zoning inquiries including building height and setbacks were made and confirmed. Committee members agreed that the garage should be recessed a foot or two back from the front wall of the home to break up the massing of the residence, and that the railings that were omitted from the rendering should be shown. The applicant agreed with these comments and offered to make the required changes. A discussion followed regarding whether this project would be classified as an alteration or a demolition, and ultimately a decision was made to refer to the item as a partial demolition.

Moved by: David Bergen

“That the SChPAC approves the partial demolition of the residence at 169 Dalhousie Ave involving the retention of a majority of the existing exterior wall and foundation.

And that the SChPAC approves the proposed new building conditional upon the creation of a setback of the proposed new garage and addition of porch railings as outlined in new plans to be provided by the applicant and circulated by the Committee.”

Carried

c) **9.3 Welland House Update**
James Neilson, Heritage Planner

James Neilson provided an update about the Welland House. Work on site will begin to sort through some of the rubble with staff permission. No rubble can be taken off site without a demolition permit. Holly Washuta asked about the security guard that is seen within close proximity of the site.

Moved by: Brian Narhi

“That the SChPAC receives the information from James”

Carried

d) **9.4 Rescheduling of December 30, 2021 Meeting**
James Neilson

James Neilson noted that the City prefers to avoid scheduling meetings during the Christmas holiday season and that the meeting date for the December meeting should be moved to accommodate the holiday season. The committee came to an agreement that December 16th would work as an alternate date.

No motion was made.

e) **9.5 Removal of the Garage at 134 Church Street**
Owner: John Bacher

John Bacher presented to the Committee that he was renovating his garage and had to halt construction due to Covid-19. Months later the garage had caught fire and now needs a full demolition permit. John will put up a fence to secure the rest of the property at a future date.

Moved by: John Crawley

“That the SChPAC approves the removal of the garage from the property at 134 Church Street, conditional upon the payment of the heritage permit.”

Carried

John Bacher previously declared a conflict of interest for item 9.5 (see item 6) and did not vote on the item.

10. **Items of Correspondence**

None

11. **Date of next meeting**

Thursday, November 25, 2021

12. **Motion to Adjourn**

Moved by: Andrew Humeniuk

“That the SCHAC meeting be adjourned at 4:09 pm.”

Carried