

St. Catharines Heritage Advisory Committee

Minutes

Thursday, September 09, 2021

Electronic Participation at 2:30 pm

Members:

Brian Narhi
Gail Benjafield
Robert Speck
Andrew Humeniuk
Holly Washuta
John Crawley
Lorraine Giroux
Justin Nicholls
Mark Hoerd

Regrets:

None

Staff Liaison:

James Neilson, Heritage Planner, Planning and Building Services
Michael Seaman, Senior Project Manager, Planning and Building Services

Council:

Councilor Ward 6, Carlos Garcia

1. **Call meeting to order (Chair)**

Chair Narhi called the meeting to order at 2:30 p.m.

2. **Recognition of Traditional Territories**

Chair Narhi acknowledged that the land which we call St. Catharines and the Niagara region is the ancestral territory of Haudenosaunee and Anishinaabe peoples, many of whom continue to live and work here today. This Land is covered by the Upper Canada Treaties and the Dish with One Spoon Wampum agreement. Today this Land is home to many First Nations, Metis, and Inuit Peoples – who share the land with us. This Land Acknowledgement is a

statement that reminds us that our standard of living is directly related to the resources and friendship of Indigenous people over many generations.

3. **Additions / Deletions to the Agenda**

No Additions or Deletions

4. **Motion to approve the agenda**

Moved by: Loraine Giroux

“That the SCHAC adopt the agenda for this SCHAC meeting held on Thursday, September 9, 2021, copies having been previously distributed.”

CARRIED

5. **Motion to adopt the minutes of the previous meeting**

Gail Benjafield noted that there was an error in naming Brock students instead of Brock professors in the previous meeting's minutes.

Motion to approve August 12th minutes

Moved by: Gail Benjafield

6. **Declarations of Interest**

Mark Hoerdts - Knifeworks presentation

7. **Presentations (invited guests)**

See associated item number for discussion

Item 8.1

- Michael Graveline, Knifeworks

Item 8.2

- Glen Bates, Kiwanis Club

Item 8.3

- James Neilson, Heritage Planner, City of St. Catharines

8. Business arising from the minutes

8.1 Knifeworks Presentation

Item was deferred due to applicant not being able to attend.

8.2 Renaming of Fairview Park

Len Bates of the Kiwanis Club presented his case to rename Fairview Park. During the presentation, Bates noted the intention to rename the park to Kiwanis Echo Park, and that it will not interfere with John Page Park which is in proximity. Kiwanis Club has pledged to contribute \$5,000 to the development of the park and will undergo fundraising efforts. The club is working with Land Group on preliminary plans for the park and outlines what the park will entail.

Bates responded to questions from the Committee regarding:

How far he has gotten working with City staff?

The cost of the project and where that money will go?

Where the park will be accessed from?

The prevalence of Kiwanis parks in other municipalities?

Possibility of sharing the name if a community member opposes?

Moved By: Gail Benjafield

"That the Heritage Advisory Committee receive the report from Len Bates;

And that the Committee supports the renaming of Fairview park to Kiwanis Echo Park"

CARRIED

8.3 Private Watson Monument

James Neilson provided the Committee with an update regarding the Private Watson Monument and noted that Cultural Services is seeking stakeholder endorsement to move the monument to Victoria Lawn Cemetery. The options put forward by Cultural Services included:

1. Committee Supports the motion
2. Committee does not support the motion
3. Abstain.

The committee outlined their concerns about the lack of transparency on this project and that absent more information, it cannot support to motion put forward by Cultural Services. The major concerns are outlined in the motion to abstain.

Gail Benjafield noted that this has been a long-discussed issue and that it should come to a conclusion. Andrew Humeniuk noted the process should be more transparent and focus on the stories and comments around the monument. Lorraine Giroux agreed and wants to focus on reconciliation by displaying the statue along with a plaque with more recent historical facts. Gail Benjafield agreed as well but wants more information from the city, along with other council members. Brian Narhi noted that the statue in its current condition may not last a long time. He also noted that this project could exceed the \$80,000 cost. James Neilson noted that a report will be made available at a later date from the City regarding meetings with indigenous groups on this topic, but currently that information is confidential.

Moved by: Andrew Humeniuk

“That the SCHAC is recommending abstention from making a motion as requested on the grounds of:

- The need for a plan to reframe the conversation in a manner that tells a more complete and inclusive truth and in doing so satisfies the goals of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission, including the consideration of the option of retaining the monument in situ with a robust interpretation strategy that helps inform the public.
- The need for a detailed plan for how the statue will be moved, stored, restored, and interpreted and the associated cost.
- The need of information about the feedback of the Indigenous groups and the other stakeholder groups who were consulted.”

CARRIED

9. **Business**

9.1 Heritage Tree Inventory

James Neilson noted that while a Heritage Tree Inventory could be useful, the Heritage Register is top priority as of now. Brian Narhi noted that a survey was sent out a decade ago and the data was sent to a group for collection.

James Neilson was asked if this can be revisited later instead of being thrown to the side.

Moved by: Gail Benjafield

“That the Heritage Advisory Committee receive the update from James Neilson.”

CARRIED

9.2 Pony Mini Mart

James Neilson provided the Committee with an update regarding the Pony Mini Mart.

Moved by: Gail Benjafield

“That the Heritage Advisory Committee receive the update from James Neilson.”

CARRIED

9.3 Welland House

James Neilson provided an update regarding the fire at the Welland House. He noted that City staff have requested a Documentation and Salvage Report and that the Consultant for the property owner is working on this report.

Moved by: Andrew Humeniuk

“That the Heritage Advisory Committee receive the update from James Neilson.”

CARRIED

10. Updates from Sub-Committees

10.1 Designations, Plaquing and Ceremonies

No new comments

10.2 Public Outreach and Education (POE)

No new comments

10.3 Research and Inventory (R & I)

Andrew Humeniuk would like to get more information on inventory updates, and criteria to registering heritage buildings. Michael Seaman noted that a meeting should be set up with the sub-committee to create a template for the information needed.

11. Date of next meeting

Thursday, October 14, 2021

12. Motion to Adjourn

Moved by Justin Nicholls

“That the SCHAC meeting be adjourned at 4:28 pm.”

CARRIED