

# St. Catharines Heritage Advisory Committee

## Minutes

Thursday, April 08, 2021

Electronic Participation at 2:30 pm

### Members:

Gail Benjafield  
Robert Speck  
Brian Narhi  
Justin Nicholls  
Andrew Humeniuk  
Mark Hoerd  
Lorraine Giroux

### Staff Liaison:

Tami Kitay, Director of Planning and Building Services  
Margaret Josipovic, Manager of Planning Services

### Council:

Councillor Ward 6, Carlos Garcia

### Guests:

Kathleen Powell, Supervisor of Historical Services and Curator, St. Catharine's Museum  
Olivia Hope, Culture Coordinator, St. Catharine's Museum  
Andrea La Plante, EA Coordinator, Associated Engineering (Ont.) Ltd  
John Sleath, Cultural heritage Specialist, ASI Heritage

---

#### 1. **Call meeting to order (Chair)**

Chair Narhi called the meeting to order at 2:31 p.m.

#### 2. **Recognition of Traditional Territories**

Chair Narhi read the land acknowledgement, noting that the land on which the St. Catharines Heritage Advisory Committee meets is the traditional territory of the Haudenosaunee and Anishinaabe peoples.

#### 3. **Additions / Deletions to the Agenda**

Chair Narhi requested that the correspondents about the BME Church be discussed under information and correspondence.

4. **Motion to approve the agenda**

Moved by: Robert Speck

“That the SCHAC ratify and adopt the agenda for this SCHAC meeting held on Thursday, April 8th, 2021 as amended, copies having been previously distributed.”

**CARRIED AS AMENDED**

5. **Motion to adopt the minutes of the previous meeting**

Member Benjafield would like to amend section 9.2 of the March 11, 2021 minutes to state that she agreed to assist with the research for 37 Henrietta St.

Moved by: Gail Benjafield

“That the SCHAC approve the minutes of the SCHAC meeting held on Thursday, March 11, 2021 as amended.

**CARRIED AS AMENDED**

6. **Declarations of Interest**

None

7. **Presentations (invited guests)**

Kathleen Powell and Olivia Hope, St. Catharine's Museum - Private Watson Statue  
Andrea La Plante, Associated Engineering (Ont) Ltd – Lake Street Road Improvements

8. **Business arising from the minutes**

**8.1 Private Watson Statue Update**

Discussion Regarding Possible Relocation

Kathleen Watson, Supervisor of Historical Services and Curator,  
St. Catharine's Museum

Olivia Hope, Culture Coordinator,  
St. Catharine's Museum

Committee guest Kathleen Powell presented to the Committee about the history of the Private Watson Memorial. The monument was erected to commemorate Private Alexander Watson who fought with the 90<sup>th</sup> Winnipeg Battery Rifles Canadian Volunteers in a conflict called the North West Rebellion. Private Watson passed away on May 12<sup>th</sup>, 1885 in the final conflict the Battle of Batoche. The statue was also intended to represent all volunteers that fell in the North West resistance. The man on top of the statue is not private Watson but is a Canadian volunteer in the at ease position. The monument was previously placed in front of the original City Hall and was

later moved in 1936 from its original location to its current location on the James Street side of the new City Hall.

The statue was marked as at risk for deterioration as early as 1971. In 1982 the statue was cleaned, and mortar and epoxy glue bonding agents were placed on the statue to try and preserve the condition of the statue. This past technique is now showing its age and has begun to peel away from the limestone monument. In 2009, another report was published regarding War Memorial and Outdoor Art Condition Assessments, which outlined that the Private Watson monument had urgent deterioration issues that must be addressed. As part of the 2018 Memorandum of Understanding with the Niagara Regional Native Centre, staff are directed to consult with various groups on the relocation of the statue of Private Watson from the lawn of City Hall. One group of which is the Heritage Advisory Committee.

**Question one asks the Committee what their opinion is on the Private Watson Memorial either being removed or staying at city hall?**

Chair Narhi and Member Nicholls state that the statue should stay at the corner of City Hall if it is able to be stabilized and restored. The main argument for this is that it has been a part of this cultural heritage landscape since the 1880s and plays an important role in educating the City on the history of indigenous issues. Member Giroux recommends that the statue be restored and is placed back to its original location with a plaque representing indigenous history. Member Humeniuk states that the monument staying in its original location at City Hall may enhance the opportunity for truth and reconciliation. Moving it to a lesser site may reduce the symbolic impact and educational opportunity it may have. Member Hoerdt, member Humeniuk and member Giroux then agree that to inform their decision properly, they need the opinion of indigenous communities.

**Question two asks the Committee if the monument is relocated, where should it be relocated to?**

Chair Narhi expresses concern about the reasonableness to store the statue indoors. Committee member Speck suggests that if the statue needs to be relocated at all, it could be relocated to St. Paul Street West as there are already monuments there, and Remembrance Day ceremonies are held there. Member Humeniuk suggests the location of Victoria Lawn as this was the original location of the monument and presents the possibility of making Victoria Lawn a heritage site.

**Question three asks the Committee if the City of St. Catharine's should restore this monument?**

Member Giroux suggests that only a portion of the statue be restored if it is not reasonable to restore the entire statue. Chair Narhi and member Giroux agree that the cost of restoration is an important player in the decision to restore the statue or not and that restoring a portion of this statue may be a possibility if it reduces the cost of restoration to a reasonable amount. Member Benjafield is of the opinion that the restoration of the statue is going to be too costly. Member Hoerdts explains that products used in restoration have improved substantially since the statue was restored in 1982, which could make the project more salvageable.

**Question four asks the Committee if they see the monument contributing to the City's story?**

Chair Narhi suggests that one of the main contributions that the statue has made is in honoring the soldiers who made a sacrifice in the wars. He suggests that if the statue cannot be maintained, then interpretive plaques take its place.

**Question five asks in what ways does this project contribute towards the recommendations of the Truth and Reconciliation Report?**

Member Giroux believes that the statue plays a key role in educating people on the indigenous history of the area. Member Giroux emphasizes that indigenous people need to be honored and we need to correct the past impression of the war being an uprising. Both Chair Narhi and member Humeniuk strongly agree with Lorrain's perspective, stating that this is a great opportunity for the city to properly represent indigenous people.

A study by Brock University's faculty Russel Johnston and Mike Ripmeester was conducted. City Staff has offered to circulate the study to the Committee.

Moved by: Brian Narhi

Seconded by: Andrew Humeniuk

"That the SCHAC has received the presentation on the Private Watson Statue presented by Kathleen Powell and Olivia Hope."

**CARRIED**

**8.2** Pony Mini Mart – 321 St. Paul Street  
Margaret Josipovic, Heritage Planner and Staff Liaison  
- Nothing to report – deferred to the May 13, 2021 meeting

**8.3** St. Catharines Museum WordPress – Heritage Committee Articles  
Margaret Josipovic, Heritage Planner and Staff Liaison

- Nothing to report – deferred to the May 13, 2021 meeting

## 9. Business

- a) **9.1** Lake Street Road Improvements  
Environmental Assessment  
P18-062 Heritage Implications  
Andrea La Plante, EA Coordinator  
Associated Engineering (Ont.) Ltd.  
John Sleath, Cultural heritage Specialist,  
ASI Heritage

Associated Engineering (Ont) Ltd has been retained to complete an environmental assessment on the Lake Street Road Improvements. The study is investigating any needs and improvements along Lake Street between Welland Avenue and Ontario Street. This road is considered a transitional road from the downtown core providing access to primarily residential and commercial properties and a portion of the study corridor is adjacent to the Queen Street Heritage District. The City has identified the need to replace the existing watermain and portions of the sanitary sewer and make improvements to the existing storm sewer system. While doing these upgrades, the City has initiated this Municipal Class Environmental Assessment (MCEA) study to develop and evaluate a variety of road improvement alternatives which will consider components such as active transportation, safety and operation improvements, parking, and heritage requirements.

The study has broken down the corridor into three separate segments, as each segment has different characteristics. Segment 1 is Welland Avenue to Wellington Street, segment 2 is Wellington Street to Queen Street, and segment 3 is Queen Street to Ontario Street. The Cultural Heritage Assessment as part of the MCEA identified a total of 8 known Built Heritage Resources (BHR) and Cultural Heritage Landscapes (CHL) and an additional 30 potential BHR and CHLs. ASI also completed a stage 1 Archeological Assessment, which identified that the entire study area had been disturbed and does not retain archeological potential meaning no further stages of Archeological Assessment will be required. Four study alternatives were identified, developed, and evaluated for the study area which include: do nothing, maintain two-way functionality, convert to one-way functionality, or one-way and two-way functionality hybrid. Based on the analysis, the recommended and preferred alternative is to maintain two-way functionality but with the outlined upgrades. These upgrades will include sidewalk improvements, inclusion of a sidewalk along Montebello Park, the removal of on-street parking along the west side of Lake Street (along Montebello Park) and inclusion of pedestrian crossing from William Street to Montebello Park.

As a result of this analysis, the next steps include an updated Cultural Heritage Report which will be prepared by ASI to review the impacts the proposed undertaking will have

on the BHR and CHLs identified within the study area and this report will recommend appropriate mitigation measures. An online Public Information Centre (PIC) is scheduled from April 8, 2021 to April 22, 2021 on engage STC, and the feedback received from the online PIC will be used to confirm the preferred solution. The Project File Report which documents the MCEA process will be prepared and filed for 30-day public review, and once the MCEA study is finalized the City will transition to detailed design of the preferred solution.

Member Giroux suggests that signage be put up to direct drivers to the nearby parking garage where 12 parking spaces will be lost along Montebello Park, as Montebello Park is often used for public events and festivals. Chair Narhi asks guest Sleath from ASI if there will be any in depth research into the buildings identified in the Cultural Heritage Assessment. Guest Sleath states that if there is no anticipated impact to the heritage resources, then they would not recommend any further research. However, this impact will be identified further in the preliminary impact assessment which will identify the preferred alternative and any impacts that it will have on the cultural heritage resources that have been identified.

Moved by: Brian Narhi

Seconded by: Gail Benjafield

“That the SCHAC has received the presentation on the Lake Street Road Improvements presented by Andrea La Plante and are in favor of alternative two which is to maintain two-way functionality.”

**CARRIED**

#### **10. Items of Correspondence**

Chair Narhi notes that the British Methodist Episcopal Church has been visited and pictures have been taken of the substandard workmanship completed by the contractor. Chair Narhi explains that the church pews had been lifted up to put down new flooring and were placed in in-correct order. The BME will now be removing the church pews to have them placed in the correct order by a new contractor. Member Humeniuk also notes that the workmanship is shocking, and that the selection and supervision of the contractor was lacking.

Staff liaison Kitay notes that staff liaison Josipovic will be temporarily taking on the tasks of the Heritage Planner until the vacancy is filled.

#### **11. Date of next meeting** Thursday, May 13, 2021

#### **12. Motion to Adjourn**

Moved by: Andrew Humeniuk

“That the SCHAC meeting be adjourned at 4:15 pm.”

**CARRIED**