



CITY OF
ST. CATHARINES

Corporate Report

Report from Planning and Development Services, Planning Services

Date of Report: April 29, 2013

Date of Meeting: May 13, 2013

Report Number: PDS-128-2013

File: 10.64.99

Subject: Recommendation of Port Dalhousie Heritage District Advisory Committee
Regarding Proposed Demolition of Second Dwelling at 147 Main Street

Recommendation

That staff be directed to process the Heritage Permit application to demolish the second dwelling at 147 Main Street. FORTHWITH

Summary

The purpose of this application is to enable the demolition of the existing one storey, second dwelling at 147 Main Street. The proposal requires a demolition permit and, as such, a Heritage Permit from Council as well. The property is located on the south side of Main Street, between Johnston Street and Christie Street (Appendix "1"). Staff recommends that the application be approved.

Background

In December 2003, the Port Dalhousie Heritage District designation received final approval from the Ontario Municipal Board. The District is one of the largest heritage districts in Ontario. The District has the natural boundaries of Lake Ontario and Martindale Pond, and the south western boundary runs variously along Corbett Avenue, Johnston Street and Shelley Avenue.

The Ontario Heritage Act (OHA) requires that Council approval be obtained for new construction, additions to existing structures, and demolition within a Heritage District. On reviewing an application, Council may: consent to the application; consent to the application with conditions; or refuse the application. The Port Dalhousie Heritage District Advisory Committee (PDHDAC) has been appointed to review applications and provide advice to Council in order to facilitate this process.

By-law 2004-277 delegated the approval of heritage permits to the Director of Planning and Development Services, but this authorization does not include the approval of demolitions as is being proposed through this application.

In accordance with the Ontario Heritage Amendment Act, 2005 when a heritage permit, including demolition, is applied for, Council may give the applicant:

- (a) the permit applied for;
- (b) notice that the Council is refusing the application for the permit; or
- (c) the permit applied for, with terms and conditions attached.

If Council refuses the permit applied for or approves the permit with conditions attached, the owner of the property may appeal to the Ontario Municipal Board.

Report

On April 25, 2013, the Port Dalhousie Heritage District Advisory Committee (PDHDAC) considered an application to demolish the existing one storey second dwelling (closest to Martindale Pond, at the rear of the property) at 147 Main Street (Appendix "1"). Photos of the second dwelling are included as Appendix "2". The applicant wishes to demolish the second dwelling to capitalize on the views of Martindale Pond from the main dwelling, which are currently obstructed by the second dwelling. No changes are proposed to the main dwelling at this time, and a second Heritage Permit application will be required should alterations to the main dwelling be proposed.

Preceding the April 25, 2013 meeting, members of the PDHDAC inspected the premises with the applicant on April 1, 2013. Based on the inspection and information from a home inspector's report submitted with the application, the second dwelling was likely constructed in the 1940s. The home inspector's report (dated March 9, 2013) noted several areas of deterioration, including stucco siding, wood trim, windows and roof. The report also indicated several areas of the dwelling that could not be inspected due to lack of visibility or access.

On reviewing the proposal, the PDHDAC was supportive of the request to demolish the buildings based upon information provided, obtained, and inspection of the premises. The site visit by the PDHDAC members confirmed the information provided in the home inspector's report. The Committee considered the age, physical attributes (condition, architectural significance / integrity, potential for adaptive re-use), spatial attributes (landmark status, streetscape / compatibility, site integrity), and social (historical significance / linkages to events, historical trends, and persons or groups of importance) and determined that the building could be considered for demolition. Overall, the dwelling has no known historical associations or architectural significance or landmark value. Application of the Rating System for Demolitions resulted in a score of 35.3 out of 100, which means demolition may be considered. At the meeting of April 25, 2013, the PDHDAC passed the following motion: *"That the demolition of the second dwelling (closest to Martindale Pond, at the rear of the property) may be considered."*

Financial Implications

Not Applicable.

Conclusion

The Ontario Heritage Act requires that the respective heritage advisory committee be consulted prior to Council making a decision on a demolition permit application in a heritage district. In this regard, the PDHDAC has been consulted with respect to the

application to demolish the second dwelling at 147 Main Street and advises that the demolition can be considered. Staff concur, and recommend that the Heritage Permit application to demolish the second dwelling be approved.

Notification

It is in order to notify Gino Vendittelli.

Submitted by:

Judy Pihach, MCIP, RPP
Manager of Planning Services

Prepared by:

Britney Williamson
Planner I

Approved by:

James N. Riddell, MPI, MCIP, RPP
Director of Planning and Development Services

LOCATION MAP

*SUBJECT LANDS KNOWN AS
147 MAIN STREET
FILE 10.64.144 H4*







