

St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee

Minutes

Thursday, May 27, 2021

Electronic Participation at 2:30 p.m.

Attendance:

Dr John Bacher
Dr David Bergen
John Crawley
Andrew Humeniuk
Brian Narhi
Holly Washuta
John Crawley

Councillor Carlos Garcia

Regrets:

Robert De Wolfe

Staff Liaisons:

Michael Seaman, Senior Project Manager, Planning and Building Services
Wilrik Banda, Planning Technician, Planning and Building Services

-
1. **Call meeting to order (Chair)**
The Co-Chair, Brian Narhi, called the meeting to order at 2:33 pm
 2. **Recognition of Traditional Territories**
Co-Chair, Brian Narhi acknowledged that the land on which the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee meets today is the traditional territory of the Haudenosaunee and Anishinaabe peoples.
 3. **Additions / Deletions to the Agenda**
There were none.

4. Motion to approve the agenda

Moved by: Dr. John Bacher

“That the SChPAC ratify and adopt the Agenda for this SChPAC meeting held on May 27, 2021, copies having been previously distributed.”

CARRIED

5. Motion to adopt the minutes of the previous meeting

Moved by: David Bergen

“That the Minutes from the SChPAC meeting of March 25, 2021, be approved.”

CARRIED

6. Declarations of Interest

There were none.

7. Presentations (invited guests)

Kim Learn, Owner
Glen Curnock, Architect, G. Curnock and Associates

Glen Curnock, Architect, G. Curnock and Assoc. Regarding Item 9.1
Brian Cory Boisselle and Zinnia Crawford, Owners

Michael Mirynech, 2M Architects Inc. Agent Regarding Item 9.2
Salvadore Baio, Owner

Steve Greenwood, Maxwell Homes Inc. Regarding Item 9.3
Ivo Petrov, Owner

8. Business arising from the minutes

8.1 9 Shelley Avenue (Port Dalhousie HCD)

Owner(s): Kim Learn

Agent(s): Glen Curnock, Architect

File No.: 21 102597 HERT

- Proposed removal of existing house and replacement with new Proposed Simple one storey house 1800 sq ft with front porch, exterior dark colored Board Batten. Note: Revised design for the new house.

Item 8.1 had previously been considered at the March 25, 2021 meeting of the SCHAC at which the following recommendation was passed:

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend deferral of consideration of the proposed demolition of the house at 9 Shelley Avenue be deferred to the April 29, 2021 meeting of the SChPAC to allow for the committee to undertake a site visit to the home and consideration of a structural assessment of the home prepared by a qualified structural engineer to be provided by the property owner.”

A site visit was undertaken by members of the committee on March 30, 2021. An engineer’s report was provided on May 27, 2021 stating deficiencies in the meeting. It was noted that the applicant had chosen to change the plan and go to a bungalow style design with a side wing.

Member Washuta asked about the applicant’s proposal of taking the building down to the foundation.

Mr. Curnock noted that the existing structure has experienced numerous alterations over the years and noted that the existing structure needs major repairs to bring it up-to-date and that the cost of repairing the existing vs replacing is significant. It was noted that they explored retaining the floor system as a cost saving measure, but it was determined that it was not practical to do so.

The Chair asked if there was a motion to approve the demolition. There was not a mover for this motion.

Member Humeniuk indicated that a compelling case for the demolition had not been brought forward and brought forward a motion that the proposed demolition not be supported.

Moved by: Andrew Humeniuk

Seconded by: David Bergen

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend that the proposed demolition of 9 Shelley Avenue not be supported”.

CARRIED

The Chair asked if it was possible to entertain a motion regarding the proposed design. Mr. Curnock indicated that in his opinion it was possible to bring forward a motion to modify the building, as an architect he would need to modify the structural plans to accommodate retention of the existing structure.

Member Bergen indicated that modification of the existing building, retaining primary floors and walls, but taking off the roof and rear addition to achieve an updated design as proposed was possible. The Senior Project Manager indicated that it was possible to approve the proposed design, subject to retention of the primary walls and floors.

Member Humeniuk indicated concerns that it would be possible to retain the existing building within the proposed design.

The Senior Project manager indicated that the recommendation could include a requirement that staff review the building permit drawings to verify that the historic fabric of the building would be maintained.

Moved by: David Bergen

Seconded by: Dr. John Bacher

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend approval of the heritage permit application for 9 Shelley Avenue for modifications to the existing structure as proposed on the site subject to review of the building permit drawings by the Senior Project Manager to confirm retention of the floor and primary exterior walls.”

CARRIED

9. Business

a) 9.1 2 Norris Place (Yates Street HCD)

Owner(s): Brian Cory Boiselle and Zinnia Crawford

Agent(s): Glen Cumock, Architect.

File No: 21 104854 HERT

- Addition to Rear of property will follow existing building with matching roof line. The existing enclosed porch was open at one time, so owners are proposing to open up 1/2 of space leaving existing roof and moving stairs over

Glen Curnock, Architect for the owners of 2 Norris Place gave a presentation about the proposed addition and renovations to the property. It was noted that the applicants are not going to open up the loft space at this point.

Chair Narhi asked about salvaging of brickwork from the removal of the wall in the vicinity of the porch. Mr. Curnock indicated that this was an important consideration as they planned to reuse the brick elsewhere in the renovation.

Moved by: Dr. John Bacher

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend approval of the heritage permit application for 2 Norris Place for a proposed addition to the rear of the property and alterations to the porch.”

CARRIED

b) 9.2 73 Dalhousie Avenue (Port Dalhousie HCD)

Owner(s): Salvadore Baio

Agent(s): Michael Mirynech, 2M Architects Inc

File no: 21 10400800HERT

- Construction of a new two storey rear addition (atop former porch) and construction of a new two storey rear covered porch.

Michael Mirynech, Architect gave a presentation about the proposed works at 73 Dalhousie Avenue. Members of the committee were supportive of the proposal.

Moved by: Holly Washuta

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend approval of the heritage permit application for 73 Dalhousie Avenue related to construction of a new two storey rear addition (atop former porch) and construction of a new two storey rear covered porch.”

CARRIED

c) 9.3 40 Lock Street

Owner(s): Ivo Petrov

Agent(s): Steve Greenwood, Maxwell Homes Inc.

File No: 21 103762 HERT

Proposed work to include renovation of existing rear addition with a connection to the back of the existing garage effectively increasing depth of garage

Steve Greenwood, Agent for the owner gave a visual presentation describing the proposed works on the house. Members of the committee were supportive of the proposal.

Moved by: Dr. John Bacher

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend approval of the heritage permit application for 40 Lock Street related to removal and replacement of the existing rear addition and construction of a connection to the back of the existing garage”

CARRIED

10. Items of Correspondence

- a) Sub-Item 1 – Supporting information for 9 Shelley Avenue
- b) Sub-Item 2 – Supporting information for 2 Norris Place
- c) Sub-Item 3 – Supporting information for 73 Dalhousie Avenue
- d) Sub-Item 4 – Supporting information for 40 Lock Street

Moved by: Andrew Humeniuk

That Supporting information for Sub-Items 1 through 4 be received.

CARRIED

11. Date of next meeting

- June 24, 2021

12. Motion to Adjourn

Moved by: John Bacher

“That the SChPAC meeting be adjourned at 3:37 p.m.

CARRIED