

# St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee

## Minutes

Thursday, March 25, 2021

Electronic Participation at 2:30 p.m.

### Attendance:

Dr John Bacher  
Dr David Bergen  
John Crawley  
Andrew Humeniuk  
Brian Narhi  
Holly Washuta

Councillor Carlos Garcia

### Absent:

Robert De Wolfe

### Staff Liaisons:

Michael Seaman, Heritage Planner, Planning and Building Services  
Wilrik Banda, Planning Technician, Planning and Building Services

- 
1. **Call meeting to order (Chair)**  
The Co-Chair, Brian Narhi, called the meeting to order at 2:33 pm
  2. **Recognition of Traditional Territories**  
Co-Chair, Brian Narhi acknowledged that the land on which the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee meets today is the traditional territory of the Haudenosaunee and Anishinaabe peoples.
  3. **Additions / Deletions to the Agenda**  
There were none.

4. **Motion to approve the agenda**

It was noted that in regard to item #9.5, 6 Paxon Avenue, the owners had notified staff that they would not be filing a complete application for the March 25, 2021 meeting but would instead be submitting for the May 27, 2021 meeting.

Moved by: David Bergen

"That the SChPAC ratify and adopt the Agenda for this SChPAC meeting held on March 25, 2021, copies having been previously distributed, as amended removing item 9.5 for 6 Paxton Avenue."

**CARRIED**

5. **Motion to adopt the minutes of the previous meeting**

Moved by: Holly Washuta

"That the Minutes from the SChPAC meeting of February 25, 2021, be approved."

**CARRIED**

6. **Declarations of Interest**

There were none.

7. **Presentations (invited guests)**

Michael Kemp, Owner  
Andrew Hellwig, Architectural Designer  
Mark Shoalts, Engineer, CAHP

Regarding Item 8.1

Ulrike Wiens, Owner  
Ian Graham, Rock Maple Niagara LTD., Agent

Regarding Item 9.1

Joseph & Barbara Colonna, Owner  
William Heikoop, Planner

Regarding Item 9.2  
and Item 9.3

Kim Learn, Owner  
Glen Curnock, Architect, G. Curnock and Associates  
Carla Parslow, Parslow Heritage Consulting  
Christopher Lemon, Parslow Heritage Consulting

Regarding Item 9.4

8. **Business arising from the minutes**

**8.1 29 Yates Street (Yates Street HCD)**

Owner(s): Michael Kemp, President DBK Homes Inc.

Agent(s): Megan Hobson, Heritage Consultant, CAHP

Mark Shoalts, Professional Engineer, CAHP

File No.: 21 101358 HERT

- Proposed removal and replacement of side bay window and renovations

Item 8.1 had previously been considered at the February 25, 2021 meeting of the SCHAC. The committee had recommended approval of proposed renovations to the building with the exception of the proposal to remove and replace the existing 19<sup>th</sup> Century bay window with a flat modern insert, details of which had been provided after the submission deadline for the February 25, 2021 meeting and had not been considered in the Heritage Impact Assessment. An updated HIA and details of the proposed bay window renovations were submitted for consideration.

Michael Kemp, owner of 29 Yates Street as in attendance to describe the proposed works on the bay window and explain why due to cost implications he and his partners in the renovation of this building for sale could not restore the original bay window.

Mark Shoalts, Engineer provided additional technical information. Mr. Shoalts had provided a submission on the date of the meeting describing the state of condition and deterioration of the window.

The committee also discussed with Mr. Kemp details of proposed interior renovations to the building, primarily the proposal to remove the original historic staircase from the city and replace with a modern staircase. The historic staircase is considered a masterpiece of the work of renowned local carpenter and cabinet maker Thomas McIntyre. Committee members strongly discouraged the removal of the staircase. Mr. Kemp indicated that he would take a second look at the plans for the staircase based on the commentary from the committee.

Member Bergen questioned whether measured architectural drawings of the bay-window could be provided and details maintained in the basement with other architectural artefacts so that a future owner could reintroduce the bay window. Mr. Kemp indicated that he could do this.

Member Washuta asked if there had been a costing of the proposed bay window. Mr. Kemp indicated that the restoration of the bay window would be 5 times the cost of removal and filling in the gap with a flush window.

Moved by: David Bergen

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend approval of the minor revision to the heritage permit application for 29 Yates Street as it relates to proposed renovations to the side bay window subject to:

- The owner salvaging and storing architectural elements of the bay window on site,

- Prior to demolition, the completion of measured drawings of the feature to be removed and the drawings provided to the city for archival purposed prior to removal.

**CARRIED**

**9. Business**

**a) 9.1 106 Dalhousie Avenue**

Owner(s): Ulrike Wiens

Agent(s): Ian Graham, Rock Maple Niagara Ltd.

File No: 21 101475 00 HERT

- Proposed new shed to match existing residence on property

Ian Graham, Carpenter described the proposed structure for the rear yard of 106 Dalhousie Avenue. The committee had no concerns.

Moved by: David Bergen

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend approval of the heritage permit application for 106 Dalhousie Avenue for a proposed new shed.”

**CARRIED**

**b) 9.2 8 Paxton Avenue**

Owner(s): Joseph and Barbara Colonna

Agent(s): William Heikoop, Upper Canada Consulting

- Revision to a previously approved heritage permit application related to design changes and reduction in height.

William Heikoop, Planner with Upper Canada Consultants described the proposal. It was noted that a heritage permit had previously been approved for the site a year ago and that since that time a number of changes to the design came out of the review by the committee of adjustment and a subsequent tree preservation process and discussion with neighbours mandated changes to the design. Additionally, there was a change to the driveway location and a reduction in height. The changes are believed to increase overall compatibility of the proposed dwellings an 8 and 10 Paxton Avenue.

Moved by: Holly Washuta

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend approval of the heritage permit application for 8 Paxton Avenue related to design changes and reduction in height of a proposed new dwelling”

**CARRIED**

**c) 9.3 10 Paxton Avenue**

Owner(s): Joseph and Barbara Colonna

Agent(s): William Heikoop, Upper Canada Consulting

- Revision to a previously approved heritage permit application
- related to design changes and reduction in height.

Moved by: Holly Washuta

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend approval of the heritage permit application for 10 Paxton Avenue related to design changes and reduction in height of a proposed new dwelling”

**CARRIED**

**d) 9.4 9 Shelley Avenue**

Owner(s): Kim Learn

Agent(s): Carla Parslow, Senior Cultural Resource Specialist

Christopher Lemon, Cultural Heritage Specialist

Glen Curnock, Architect, G. Curnock and Associates

The committee considered a proposal from Ms. Kim Learn, property owner at 9 Shelley Avenue to remove the existing dwelling on the property (retaining the foundation) and to build a new cottage structure. A heritage Impact Assessment was prepared for the project by Parslow Heritage Consulting. Carla Parslow and Chris Lemon were in attendance to describe the project and the heritage impact assessment that was prepared.

Ms. Parslow indicated that the structure is located within the cottage enclave of the Port Dalhousie Heritage Conservation District, however, in the opinion of the consultant it does not reflect the character of the district or cottage enclave and has been altered. Slides were presented illustrating the home.

Ms. Parslow also described the proposed new residence which is intended to be reflective of the historic cottage character of the area.

The committee indicated that it would be reviewing the proposed demolition first and then the merits of the new construction of the home.

It was noted that committee members would like to see the site and existing building and that the provision of a structural assessment of the building would be beneficial to understand the merits of the proposed demolition.

Member Bergen indicated that many of the older historic homes in the Port Dalhousie Heritage Conservation District are simple, smaller homes built to earlier building standards and techniques. Property owners work within the constraints of smaller, unique old homes with the benefit of maintaining a unique and historical character for the neighbourhood.

Ms. Learn gave a presentation of images of the house indicated that structural issues with the house had been identified and that the house was subject to unsympathetic alterations and limited maintenance in recent years which contribute to the finding that demolition should be considered.

Committee members discussed undertaking a future site visit to the property at 9 Shelley Avenue.

Moved by: David Bergen

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend deferral of consideration of the proposed demolition of the house at 9 Shelley Avenue be deferred to the April 29, 2021 meeting of the SCHPAC to allow for the committee to undertake a site visit to the home and consideration of a structural assessment of the home prepared by a qualified structural engineer to be provided by the property owner.”

**CARRIED**

**10. Items of Correspondence**

- a) Sub-Item 1 – Supporting information for 29 Yates Street
- b) Sub-Item 2 – Supporting information for 106 Dalhousie Avenue
- c) Sub-Item 3 – Supporting information for 8 Paxton Avenue
- d) Sub-Item 4 – Supporting information for 10 Paxton Avenue
- e) Sub-Item 5 – Supporting information for 9 Shelley Avenue

Moved by: Brian Narhi

That Supporting information for Sub-Items 1 through 5 be received.

**CARRIED**

**11. Date of next meeting**

- April 29, 2021

12. **Motion to Adjourn**

Moved by: Holly Washuta

“That the SChPAC meeting be adjourned at 4:30 p.m.

**CARRIED**