

St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee & St. Catharines Heritage Advisory Committee

Minutes

Thursday, September 24, 2020

Electronic Participation at 2:30 pm

Attendance:

Dr. John Bacher (SCHPAC)
John Crawley (SCHPAC)
Robert De Wolfe (SCHPAC)
Lorraine Giroux (SCHAC)
Andrew Humeniuk (SCHPAC & SCHAC)
Marty Mako (SCHAC)
Brian Narhi (SCHPAC & SCHAC)
Robert Speck (SCHAC)
Holly Washuta (SCHPAC)

Regrets:

Justin Nichols (SCHAC)
David Bergen (SCHPAC)
Gail Benjafield (SCHAC)
Marty Mako (SCHAC)
Mark Hoerdts (SCHAC)
Peter Wing (SCHAC)

Staff Liaison:

Chloe Richer, Heritage Planner, Planning and Building Services
Michael Seaman, Heritage Planner, Planning and Building Services
Elaine Munro, Committee Secretary and Planning Technician, Planning and Building Services

1. Call meeting to order (Chair)

The Co-Chair, Brian Narhi, called the meeting to order at 2:30 p.m.

2. Recognition of Traditional Territories

Co-Chair, Brian Narhi acknowledged that the land on which the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee and the St. Catharines Heritage Advisory Committee meets today is the traditional territory of the Haudenosaunee and Anishinaabe peoples, many of whom continue to live and work here today. This

territory is covered by the Upper Canada Treaties and is within the land protected by the Dish with One Spoon Wampum agreement. Today this gathering place is home to many First Nations, Metis, and Inuit Peoples. Acknowledging this is a reminder that our great standard of living is directly related to the resources and friendship of Indigenous people.

3. Amendments to the Agenda

There were none.

4. Motion to approve the agenda

Moved by: Holly Washuta (SCHPAC)

Seconded by: John Crawley (SCHPAC)

That the SCHPAC ratify and adopt the Agenda for this SCHPAC meeting held on September 24, 2020, copies having been previously distributed.

Carried

5. Motion to adopt the minutes of the previous meeting

Moved by: Robert De Wolfe

Seconded by: John Crawley

That the Minutes from the SCHPAC meeting of August 27, 2020, be approved.

Carried

6. Introductions

Chloe Richer, Heritage Planner introduced Michael Seaman, Heritage Planner who will be assuming the duties of Heritage Planner for the next 18 months. Michael Seaman gave a description of his work, education and volunteerism in the field of heritage conservation. He is currently the Chair of the Board of the National Trust for Canada. Committee members introduced themselves following.

7. Presentations (invited guests)

- Jason Boland, PMP, Senior Project Technologist, Fisheries and Oceans Canada, Government of Canada, Regarding Item 8.1
- Michael Miryneck, 2M Architects Inc., Regarding Item 8.2

8. Business arising from the minutes

There was none.

9. Business

- a. **9.1** 4 Welland Canals Parkway (Port Weller Coast Guard Base) Update

Owner(s): Government of Canada

Agent(s): Jason Boland, PMP, Senior Project Technologist,
Fisheries and Oceans Canada, Real Property Group Government
of Canada

File No.: N/A

Mr. Boland gave an update on planned interventions to the Federal Heritage Buildings at the Canadian Coast Guard (CCG) titled Port Weller Search and Rescue (SAR) Station Redevelopment Project Update the SCHAC and SCHPAC were previously consulted on June 15, 2017.

Mr. Boland noted that the station, located at the northern terminus of the Welland Canal has been in existence since 1931 when the Department of Marine built a lighthouse (now demolished), lighthouse keepers dwelling and foghorn building to serve the navigational needs of Lakers, pleasure craft, passenger ships and salties. In 1953 a new lighthouse keepers' residence was built. The lighthouse was replaced with automatic lights in 1969. The site became a base for search and rescue operations in 1971. In 1989, the Federal Heritage Building Review Office (FHBRO) assess the heritage value of the Port Weller site and designated three buildings as federally recognized heritage buildings. The 1931 Former Lighthouse Keeper's Dwelling the 1931 Former Foghorn Building and the 1953 Residence Building. The man-made woods located in the vicinity of the buildings are also significant.

In 2016, the Department of Fisheries and Oceans (DFO) began a review of the facilities located at Port Weller to determine their ability to meet current needs and standards. Conservation architecture firm Taylor Hazel were engaged by the Federal government to assist in this review. While the heritage value of the site was confirmed a number of functional, accessibility and other deficiencies with the site were identified. A number of options were considered by DFO; however, it was determined that the preferred course of action was to modernize the facility while retaining and reusing the most significant heritage buildings from the 1931 period. Construction is anticipated to begin the next fiscal year. While no municipal heritage approvals are required, DFO were bringing this to the City of St. Catharines Municipal Heritage Advisory Committee as part of its normal consultation process. As part of the proposed plan, DFO has decided to demolish the existing 1953 residence and replace with a modern structure, which in the opinion of DFO is to be more complimentary in architectural style to the buildings of the 1931 period. The redevelopment includes restoration and return of a number of lost features of the 1931 Art Deco buildings including heritage reproduction windows, based on architectural evidence.

Chair Brian Nahri thanked Mr Boland for his presentation. A number of comments and questions were received from the committee to the presenter and staff. Member Giroux asked about public access to the site. Mr. Boland noted that the St. Lawrence Seaway Authority needs to keep the facility secured. He noted that the facility is visible from the water from Lake Ontario and from the publicly accessible east breakwater. Member Washuta asked if there could be a plaque outlining the history of the site installed on the east breakwater to interpret the facility. Mr. Boland indicated that he would speak to senior staff in his office about the possibility of providing a plaque.

Chloe Richer, Heritage Planner asked if the 1953 residences building would be documented prior to demolition. Mr. Boland indicated that there are plans in place to make a record. Member Andrew Hume asked if consideration could be given to making elements from the 1953 building for reuse. Chair Narhi asked if there were any artefacts of historical significance from the 1953 building if they could be donated to the Lock 3 Museum. Mr. Boland indicated that while there is a federal process that needs to be followed for the disposition of assets, that he would make inquiries within DFO about the possibility of accommodating these requests. Chair Narhi asked if any new openings were to be made in the south side of the 1931 building to accommodate this work. Mr. Boland indicated no, they would be using the existing openings.

Moved by: John Crawley (SHPAC)

Seconded by: Robert De Wolfe (SHPAC)

That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee receive the presentation by Jason Boland, PMP, Senior Project Technologist, regarding Item 9.1, 4 Welland Canals Parkway (Port Weller Coast Guard Base) Update.

Carried

Moved by: Holly Washuta (SHPAC)

Seconded by: Robert De Wolfe (SHPAC)

That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee support the proposed redevelopment of 4 Welland Canals Parkway (Port Weller Coast Guard Base), including demolition of the 1953 residence, and recommend the following cultural heritage study be provided:

- Documentation and Salvage Report for the Search and Rescue Office Building (to be completely demolished).

The St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee further recommends any significant artifacts that are found be donated to the St. Catharines Museum and Welland Canals Centre.

Carried

All Members of the Heritage Advisory Committee left the meeting at this point.

b. **9.2** 178 Main Street (Port Dalhousie HCD)

Owner(s): Bart and Paula Van Vaaster

Agent(s): 2M Architects Inc.

File No.: 20 113982 HERT

- Revised plans for the proposed two-storey addition at the rear of the house.

Michael Mirynech and Lou Marcantonio, Co- 2M Architects were in attendance to discuss the project. Mr. Mirynech gave a presentation. He noted that he gave a presentation at an earlier meeting about the proposed rear addition and that the main concern expressed was related to height. He noted that the proposed addition is located to the rear of the original building. He noted that the existing rear addition is 12 inches taller than the main roof. Originally the rear addition was almost 5 feet higher than the original house. On the resubmission the rear addition has been revised to that the rear addition is 2'5 higher than the original building. It was noted that given that the proposed addition is located at the rear of the original house, the perception of the difference in height from the public realm would be negligible. Perspective drawings were shown to illustrate this. Member De Wolfe expressed his satisfaction with the change made. Member Hume expressed his continuing concern with the perceived bulk of the addition and noted that he would not be in support. Member Washuta asked about the interior ceiling height. Mr. Mirynech noted that the ceiling height in the second storey of the addition ranged from 6' to 8'-8".

Moved by: Robert De Wolfe

Seconded by: John Crawley

That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend approval of the heritage permit application for 178 Main Street, for the demolition of the existing garage and construction of a replacement garage, to be attached to the building; a two-storey addition at the rear of the dwelling; and an extension of the front porch across the width of the house.

Carried

10. Date of next meeting

Thursday, October 29, 2020

11. Other business

Member Washuta asked for an update about the Montebello Park Pavilion. Chloe Richer indicated that she had brought this to the attention of staff in the Parks and Department. An update would be provided at a future meeting.

Member Washuta noted that she has seen a nice mural of a peacock on the side of the Murphy Building in Port Dalhousie.

Members thanked Chloe Richer for her outstanding service and expressed their best wishes.

12. Motion to Adjourn

Moved by: John Bacher

Seconded by: Holly Washuta

“That the SChPAC meeting be adjourned at 3:26 p.m.”

Committee members should advise Michael Seaman (905-688-5601 ext. 1790) or mseaman@stcatharines.ca if they are unable to attend the meeting or did not receive the items(s) noted in the agenda.