

St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee

Minutes

Thursday, August 27, 2020

Electronic Participation at 2:30pm

Attendance:

David Bergen
John Crawley
Robert De Wolfe
Andrew Humeniuk
Brian Narhi
Holly Washuta

Regrets:

Dr. John Bacher

Staff Liaison:

Chloe Richer, Heritage Planner, Planning and Building Services
Wilrik Banda, Planning Technician, Planning and Building Services

Council:

Councillor Carlos Garcia

1. Call meeting to order (Chair)

The Co-Chair, Brian Narhi, called the meeting to order at 2:30 pm

2. Recognition of Traditional Territories

3. Additions / Deletions to the Agenda

None.

4. Motion to approve the agenda

Moved by: Andrew Humeniuk

Seconded by: John Crawley

“That the SChPAC ratify and adopt the Agenda for this SChPAC meeting held on August 27, 2020, copies having been previously distributed.”

CARRIED

5. Motion to adopt the minutes of the previous meeting

Moved by: Holly Washuta
Seconded by: John Crawley

“That the Minutes from the SCHPAC meeting of July 17, 2020, be approved.”

CARRIED

6. Presentations (invited guests)

- Michael Otter, Design & Construction Engineer, City of St. Catharines, Regarding Item 8.1
- Luigi Marcantonio, 2M Architects Inc., Regarding Item 8.2
- Jessica Button, Project and Development Planner, and Amanda Knutson, Planner II, City of St. Catharines, and Jim Frank, Rankin Construction Inc., Regarding Item 8.3

7. Business arising from the minutes

None.

8. Business

8.1 23 Brock Street (Port Dalhousie HCD – Library)

Owner(s): City of St. Catharines

Agent(s): Michael Otter, Design & Construction Engineer

File No.: 20 114764 HERT

- Demolition of existing concrete ramp (c. 1980s/1990s) and replacement with a sloping concrete walkway. Removal and replacement of the existing door (c. 1980s/1990s) with a new, wider door to suit accessibility purposes.

Mr. Otter discussed the proposal, which is considered to be a walkway as the slope is minor enough that handrails are not required. One side of the door will be widened to install the new, wider door that has accessible components. The height of the door remains unchanged. He also noted that the relocation of a telephone box on site is deemed to be too costly and will remain in place. As a result, the project is slightly revised to take this into consideration.

Mr. Otter noted that there are a number of standard options available for door designs to make it look more compatible with the heritage character of the building and these have been included for Committee input, as

custom doors are far more costly and do not fit within the proposed budget.

Councillor Garcia asked whether staff have investigated the possibility of incorporating accessibility to the Port Dalhousie Older Adult Centre next door.

Mr. Otter noted that it had been investigated since the last discussion. A number of items would need to be addressed in order to make this option comply. However, this would impact the overall budget, which is not sufficient to cover these additional changes.

Councillor Garcia noted that the building is the original Town Hall for Port Dalhousie and suggested that the new door should reflect the heritage value and context of the building.

The majority of members concurred that door #2 is most suitable and sympathetic with the heritage character.

Moved by: Robert de Wolfe

Seconded by: Andrew Humeniuk

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend approval of the heritage permit application for 23 Brock Street (Port Dalhousie Library), for the demolition of the existing concrete ramp (c. 1980s/1990s) and replacement with a sloping concrete walkway, and the removal and replacement of the existing door (c. 1980s/1990s) with a new, wider door to suit accessibility purposes. The preferred door option is option #2.”

CARRIED

8.2 178 Main Street (Port Dalhousie HCD)

Owner(s): Bart and Paula Van Vaaster

Agent(s): 2M Architects Inc.

File No.: 20 113982 HERT

- Demolition of existing garage and construction of replacement garage, to be attached to the building. Proposed two-storey addition at the rear of the house. Extension of the front porch across the width of the house.

Mr. Lou Marcantonio, Agent, outlined the proposal that sees the existing enclosed porch to be opened and widened across the front façade, keep the existing gables, with an addition of a sunroom in the rear and to add a full second storey, with a mud room and attached garage. The proposed addition would be taller than the existing home and would be located at

the rear of the dwelling. Mr. Marcantonio stated it would not directly impact the façade.

A Committee member requested confirmation of the difference between the existing and proposed height. Mr. Marcantonio noted that the difference is only 5-6 feet from ridge to ridge and relatively minimal. Councillor Garcia noted a similar concern with the height difference, and reminded the Committee that the addition should be subordinate to the heritage building as per the 2001 District Guidelines. He felt the current proposal does not look subordinate.

Mr. Marcantonio mentioned that they were attempting to follow the slope of the existing roof and was not sure if a flat roof had been considered. Councillor Garcia suggested that the owners could come back with alternative options and was seeking clarification on the location of the current and proposed garage. Mr. Marcantonio noted that the new garage is generally near the back of the existing garage and will be about 10 feet closer to the road. Councillor Garcia further noted that the garage looks old and may have heritage value.

Ms. Richer commented that she had discussions with the applicant's agent in a pre-submission meeting regarding the proposed design and concerns over height, as per the District Guidelines. As a result, streetscape context and sightline drawings were submitted along with the standard design drawings (e.g., building elevations).

A Committee member noted the garage may date to the 1930's-1940's and while representative of garages in Port Dalhousie, may have little architectural merit. Demolishing the garage would not be a major concern. Ms. Richer advised that while the Heritage Resource Inventory for Port Dalhousie often contains construction dates for residential dwellings, garages can be difficult to date. Committee members concurred with the notion of the garage being removed.

A Committee member asked if the rear addition could be lowered. Mr. Marcantonio commented that the ground and second floor are the same and a step-down approach may be considered. He further noted that if the 5-6' increase is too tall, the plan would have to be redesigned.

It was suggested that changing the roof line to a hip roof may soften the look of the structure. Mr. Marcantonio confirmed that his firm would be able to return to a SChPAC meeting with revised drawings.

A Committee member made the observation that you can't see the rear addition from the street and it disappears completely when standing directly in front of the house.

Councillor Garcia reiterated that the height of additions is an ongoing concern as it conflicts with the District Guidelines.

Moved by: David Bergen

Seconded by: Robert de Wolfe

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend conditional approval of the heritage permit application for 178 Main Street, for the demolition of the existing garage and construction of a replacement garage, to be attached to the building; and an extension of the front porch across the width of the house.

The SCHPAC request that the applicant provide alternative option(s) for the rear addition with a lower or different type of roofline to reduce the visual impact of the addition.”

CARRIED

8.3 3 Lakeport Road (Port Dalhousie HCD)

Owner(s): Public Works Canada

Agent(s): Jessica Button, Project and Development Planner, City of St. Catharines

File No.: 20 115231 HERT

- New steel gazebo (24' x 20'-9 3/8") to be located in the north end of Lockhart Point Park. Proposed frame colour: surrey beige; proposed roof colour: evergreen. Blue may also be considered as an alternate roof colour.

Ms. Button outlined the context and proposal which sees green space connections and overall improvements to Lockhart Point Park that increase public use. Ms. Richer noted that a Landscape Plan for Lockhart Point Park came to the SCHPAC last year as part of the heritage permit application for 57 Lakeport Road, however, the details on the gazebo were not included in that submission.

A Committee member liked the use of the native plants and had concerns with the depth of the proposed concrete base as the area is in the vicinity of the Second Welland Canal and has potential for archaeological resources. Ms. Button outlined the site plan process and that the Region typically includes conditions regarding archaeological resources.

Amanda Knutson, Planner II with the City of St. Catharines, outlined further details of the site plan agreement. The northern part of the

driveway is owned by Department of Fisheries and Oceans and leased to the City. The site plan is binding for the overall development of the property and both property owners are bound by the same site plan agreement and the clauses that are included in this agreement recognize the archeological potential of the area and lay out the steps that need to be followed should archaeological resources be found.

Councillor Garcia asked who proposed the gazebo. Ms. Button advised that Community, Recreation and Cultural Services (CRCS) made the request for the gazebo to increase the use of this area for the public. Rankin Construction agreed to make the gazebo part of their site plan agreement.

Councillor Garcia asked whether steel is in keeping with the heritage character of the area. A Committee member noted that wood is more appropriate. Ms. Button responded that wood has a higher maintenance cost and reduced lifespan, and thus does not meet CRCS's standards for parks. Ms. Richer outlined some of the 2018 District Plan policies relating to this project to the Committee and highlighted that materials are not specified for accessory structures related to tourism.

Councillor Garcia feels that the gazebo should be in keeping with the heritage of Port Dalhousie, particularly as it is located near the Second Welland Canal. He was also concerned that building the parking lot would raise the area and drop the walkway about 10-12 feet. The location of the gazebo would be located at a higher elevation. Councillor Garcia asked whether there be stairs to access the gazebo from the walkway. Ms. Knutson advised that anything beyond the north wall of the parking structure would be lower than the parking structure and there would be a retaining wall. All pedestrian connections are all accessible according to the City's Accessibility Guidelines and no stairs are included.

Councillor Garcia requested further clarification of the accessibility of the area. Ms. Knutson noted that it would be a seamless grade without any stairs.

Members were concerned with the all steel proposal as they felt the steel is not compatible with the heritage character of the area. Wood structures would have to last at least 10-15 years. A member noted that if steel is the only option as per CRCS's comments, the design would have to be more

compatible with the heritage character of the area. Ms. Richer reminded the Committee that this specific area in Port Dalhousie has a utilitarian character as per the 2018 District Plan, but a more appropriate heritage treatment of the gazebo would be part of the discussion.

It was suggested a commemorative plaque regarding the location of the Second Welland Canal be located on or around the gazebo.

Some Committee members were more concerned with the design rather than the material. The industrial look of the roof could be softened by using steel shingles. Ms. Button asked the Committee if a different colour selection would assist in addressing the concerns. Members noted that it was not the colour but the shape that is the issue and were seeking more information on the purpose of the structure. Ms. Button explained that all parks have a goal to be used by the public. Shade is the most frequent request from the public. The vision is a destination along the waterfront for residents to enjoy the area.

Members requested alternate designs and noted that the structure looked flimsy and simplistic. A suggestion was larger sized posts and perhaps the steel or wooden shingles could make the difference in terms of heritage compatibility. Ms. Richer reminded the Committee that this specifically area in Port Dalhousie is historically industrial and wood shingles may not be the most compatible option. A member suggested a cut or faux stone treatment along the base of the posts as an alternate option.

Councillor Garcia agreed with the suggestion for alternative designs and noted that cedar shake roofs can last up to 50 years. He noted that he still prefers a wood structure.

A Committee member asked if the proposal is time sensitive. Ms. Knutson noted that the site plan agreement is almost finalized and close to being registered. Returning to the SCHPAC in one month's time would not be a realistic option and it was suggested the Committee's recommendations be put forth in a motion.

A Member suggested a local company supply the gazebo instead of an American vendor.

Jim Frank advised that Rankin Construction is financing the construction of the gazebo and is open to a revised design of the gazebo.

A Member reiterated that materials and design are to be consistent with the area, incorporating stone and wood with the steel. A Member suggested that gingerbread trim could work for both wood and steel. It was also noted that the potential vendor has numerous models available and the gazebo could be approved conditionally while the design could be modified.

A Committee member asked whether Rankin Construction could construct the gazebo. Ms. Knutson noted that Rankin Construction does not have a contract for the construction but is paying for the structure. Mr. Frank explained that Rankin has the construction capabilities, however, the prefabricated model was proposed through the direction of CRCS staff. While it is possible to source local and construct in wood, CRCS would recommend a steel structure for longevity purposes.

Councillor Garcia left the meeting circa 4 pm.

Moved by: David Bergen

Seconded by: Robert de Wolfe

"That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend conditional approval of the heritage permit application for 3 Lakeport Road (Lockhart Point Park), for the construction of a new gazebo (24' x 20'-9 3/8"), with a design revised in a minor fashion to include elements sympathetic to the heritage character of Port Dalhousie (e.g., the SCHPAC recommends including wood as a material and masonry elements at the base."

CARRIED

9. Information/Correspondence

- Supporting information for 23 Brock Street.
- Supporting information for 178 Main Street.
- Supporting information for 3 Lakeport Road.
- A Member had a concern about the Montebello Park band shell as tall vegetation is blocking the view of the structure. Ms. Richer made a note of the concern and mentioned that COVID-19 may have caused delays in landscaping maintenance. A Member noted that he believes landscaping is scheduled after maintenance work on the structure is complete.

10. Date of next meeting

Thursday, September 24, 2020

11. Motion to Adjourn

Moved by: Holly Washuta

Seconded by: Robert De Wolfe

“That the SChPAC meeting be adjourned at 4:07 pm.”

Committee Members should advise Chloe Richer (905-688-5601 ext. 1710) or criche@stcatharines.ca if they are unable to attend the meeting or did not receive the item(s) noted in the agenda.

DRAFT