

# St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee & St. Catharines Heritage Advisory Committee

## Minutes

**Thursday, February 27, 2020**

**Burgoyne Woods Room at 4:30pm**

### **Attendance:**

Dr. John Bacher (SCHPAC)  
David Bergen (SCHPAC)  
John Crawley (SCHPAC)  
Lorraine Giroux (SCHAC)  
Andrew Humeniuk (SCHPAC & SCHAC)  
Brian Narhi (SCHPAC & SCHAC)  
Robert Speck (SCHAC)  
Holly Washuta (SCHPAC)

### **Regrets:**

Gail Benjafield (SCHAC)  
Justin Nicholls (SCHAC)  
Peter Wing (SCHAC)

### **Absent:**

Peter Connolly (SCHPAC)  
Robert De Wolfe (SCHPAC)  
Marty Mako (SCHAC)  
Mark Hoerdts (SCHAC)

### **Staff Liaison:**

Chloe Richer, Heritage Planner, Planning and Building Services  
Connor Wright, Planning Co-op Student, Planning and Building Services

### **Council:**

Councillor Carlos Garcia

---

#### **1. Call meeting to order (Chair)**

Brian Narhi called the meeting to order at 4:35pm

**2. Recognition of Traditional Territories**

**3. Additions / Deletions to the Agenda**

None.

**4. Motion to approve the agenda**

Moved by: John Crawley

“That the SChPAC ratify and adopt the Agenda for this joint SChPAC and SCHAC meeting held on February 27, 2020, copies having been previously distributed.”

**CARRIED**

**5. Motion to adopt the minutes of the previous meeting**

Moved by: David Bergen

“That the Minutes from the SChPAC meeting of January 30, 2020, and the Demolitions Rating System Sub-Committee Minutes from January 30, 2020, be approved.”

**CARRIED**

**6. Presentations (invited guests)**

- Sheldon D. Rosen, Bruce Hall and Jason Fung, Regarding Item 8.1
- Tim Sinke, Regarding Item 8.2

**7. Business arising from the minutes**

None.

**8. Business**

**8.1** 57A, 61, and 63 Lakeport Road (Port Dalhousie HCD)

Owner(s): Port Dalhousie Harbour Group Inc.

Agent(s): Bruce Hall, The Planning Partnership

File No.: 19 113656 000 00 HERT

- Proposed demolition of the former Pier 61 building at 61 Lakeport Road and review of the Commemoration Plan.

Bruce Hall gave a presentation on the Commemoration Plan for the Lincoln Fabrics building. He discussed the process of developing options for proposed plaques. There will be three plaques, one exterior and two in the interior. Mr. Hall displayed the draft plaques for the Committee’s feedback. The location of the

plaques will be decided in consultation with Heritage Planning staff. The 'Power Wheel' will be moved on site to be easily displayed to the public. The SCHAC did not meet quorum, however, the SCHPAC indicated their support for the Commemoration Plan. The presenters will return to the March 12<sup>th</sup> SCHAC meeting to present to the SCHAC and answer any questions of the remaining SCHAC members.

Jason Fung gave a presentation on the proposed Demolition Plan for 61 Lakeport Road (the Pier 61 building). The location would become parklands. The SCHPAC had no concerns as the building to be demolished does not contribute to the heritage value of the Port Dalhousie Heritage Conservation District.

Moved by: Holly Washuta

"That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee receive the Commemoration Plan on the former Maple Leaf Rubber Company / Lincoln Fabrics building (61 – 63 Lakeport Road)."

**CARRIED**

Moved by: Andrew Humeniuk

"That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee support the recommendations of the Commemoration Plan on the former Maple Leaf Rubber Company / Lincoln Fabrics building (61 – 63 Lakeport Road) regarding the chosen plaque options (Constructing the Maple Leaf Rubber Company Building – exterior, Power Generation in the Rubber Company Building – interior and Goods Produced in the Building - interior) as well as using modern technology to provide additional commemorative information on the City's website."

**CARRIED**

Moved by: Holly Washuta

"That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend approval of the heritage permit application for 57A, 61, and 63 Lakeport Road, for the demolition of the former Pier 61 building at 61 Lakeport Road."

**CARRIED**

- 8.2** 7 Shelley Avenue (Port Dalhousie HCD)  
Owner(s): Up 21 Enterprises  
Agent(s): Tim Sinke

File No.: 19 115260 HERT

- Proposed partial demolition of front porch and rear addition, new two-storey rear addition and relocation on site – revised application.

Tim Sinke presented the revised proposal incorporating the SCHPAC's recommendations from the previous Committee meeting. The revised proposal contains a more traditional style roof and stucco cladding on the existing dwelling, as requested. Mr. Sinke explained the porch is not known to be original and removal is necessary to facilitate the moving of the house. The new proposal loses volume but maintains square footage.

The Committee was generally supportive of the new proposal, though the addition is not subordinate in size or height to the original dwelling.

Moved by: John Crawley

"That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend approval of the heritage permit application for 7 Shelley Avenue for the partial demolition of front porch and rear addition, new two-storey rear addition and relocation on site."

**CARRIED**

**8.3** 45 Lock Street (Port Dalhousie HCD)

Owner(s): John & Karen Hoar

Agent(s): N/A

File No.: 20 101274 HERT

- Proposed alterations to the Dalhousie Street façade: the addition of a covered porch, new door and window openings, an overhanging roof above the existing door adjacent to the garage, an imitation widow's walk installed over the garage and the replacement of the existing double car garage door with two single doors.

John Hoar gave a brief overview of the existing conditions of the house and the proposed additions, including a covered porch, new door, window openings, an overhanging roof, widow's walk, and replacement of the existing double car garage door with two single doors. The Committee was generally supportive of the proposed additions.

Moved by: David Bergen

"That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend approval of the heritage permit application for 45 Lock Street, for the

addition of a covered porch, new door and window openings, an overhanging roof above the existing door adjacent to the garage, an imitation widow's walk installed over the garage and the replacement of the existing double car garage door with two single doors."

**CARRIED**

**9. Information/Correspondence**

- Guidelines for St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee Site Visits.
- Supporting information for 57A, 61, and 63 Lakeport Road.
- Supporting information for 7 Shelley Avenue.
- Supporting information for 45 Lock Street.

**10. Date of next meeting**

Thursday, March 26, 2020

**11. Motion to Adjourn**

Moved by: John Bacher

"That the SChPAC meeting be adjourned at 5:34pm."

Committee Members should advise Chloe Richer (905-688-5601 ext. 1710) or [cricher@stcatharines.ca](mailto:cricher@stcatharines.ca) if they are unable to attend the meeting or did not receive the item(s) noted in the agenda.

# **Appendix A: Sub-Committee Minutes**

## Demolitions Rating System Sub-Committee

### **Minutes**

**Thursday, February 27, 2020**

**Burgoyne Woods Room at 3:30pm**

#### **Attendance:**

Brian Narhi  
David Bergen

#### **Absent:**

Peter Connolly

#### **Staff Liaison:**

Chloe Richer, Heritage Planner, Planning and Building Services  
Connor Wright, Student Planner, Planning and Building Services

---

#### **1. Call meeting to order (Chair)**

David Bergen called the meeting to order at 3:33pm

#### **2. Recognition of Traditional Territories**

#### **3. Additions / Deletions to the Agenda**

None.

#### **4. Motion to approve the agenda**

Moved by: Brian Narhi

“That the Demolitions Rating System Sub-Committee ratify and adopt the agenda for this Demolitions Rating System Sub-Committee meeting held on Thursday, February 27<sup>th</sup>, 2020, copies having been previously distributed.”

**CARRIED**

#### **5. Business**

##### **5.1 Review and update of the Demolitions Rating System**

The Sub-Committee tested two versions of the Rating System on example heritage houses previously proposed for demolition to gain a sense of the systems' accuracy.

The Sub-Committee preferred the numerical system to the alphabetical system to be used going forward. The Sub-Committee recommended minor changes to this rating system. Chloe Richer recorded and will incorporate these changes.

At the next Sub-Committee meeting, the Sub-Committee will continue developing the evaluation system.

Moved by: Brian Narhi

"That the Demolitions Rating System Sub-Committee receive the revised Demolitions Rating System and recommend the Numerical Rating System be implemented by the SCHPAC when considering demolition requests for designated heritage properties."

**CARRIED**

6. **Date of next meeting**  
Thursday, March 26<sup>th</sup>, 2020

7. **Motion to Adjourn**

Moved by: Brian Narhi

"That the Demolitions Rating System Sub-Committee meeting be adjourned at 4:09pm."

**CARRIED**