

# St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee

## Minutes

**Thursday, January 30, 2020**

**Burgoyne Woods Room at 4:30pm**

### **Attendance:**

David Bergen  
John Crawley  
Robert De Wolfe  
Andrew Humeniuk  
Brian Narhi  
Holly Washuta

### **Regrets:**

Dr. John Bacher

### **Absent:**

Peter Connolly

### **Staff Liaison:**

Chloe Richer, Heritage Planner, Planning and Building Services  
Connor Wright, Planning Co-op Student, Planning and Building Services

### **Council:**

Councillor Carlos Garcia

---

#### **1. Call meeting to order (Chair)**

Robert De Wolfe called the meeting to order at 4:34pm

#### **2. Recognition of Traditional Territories**

#### **3. Additions / Deletions to the Agenda**

None.

#### **4. Motion to approve the agenda**

Moved by: Brian Narhi

“That the SCHPAC ratify and adopt the Agenda for this SCHPAC meeting held on January 30, 2020, copies having been previously distributed.”

**CARRIED**

**5. Motion to adopt the minutes of the previous meeting**

Moved by: Holly Washuta

“That the Minutes from the SCHPAC meeting of December 19, 2019, and the and the Demolitions Rating System Sub-Committee Minutes from December 5, 2019, be approved.”

**CARRIED**

**6. Presentations (invited guests)**

- Vincent Covatta, Project Supervisor, City of St. Catharines, and Mark Shoalts, P. Eng., Shoalts Engineering, Regarding Item 8.1
- Tim Sinke, Regarding Item 8.2
- Joseph Colonna, Regarding Item 8.3
- Ashley Given, Regarding Item 8.4

**7. Business arising from the minutes**

None.

**8. Business**

**8.1 Montebello Park Bandshell (Queen Street HCD)**

Owner(s): City of St. Catharines

Agent(s): Vincent Covatta, Project Supervisor, City of St. Catharines

File No.: N/A

- Maintenance of bandshell, including replacing decking, structural repairs to floor, replacing column covers with more historically appropriate material, repairs and painting of soffit and fascia, and repainting railing.

Mr. Covatta gave overview of the maintenance projects proposed for the Montebello Park Bandshell. Mr. Shoalts provided further detail from his Condition Assessment on the structure and explained that due to the City's budget, PVC is proposed to replace the existing synthetic material surrounding the columns, though more appropriate materials are to be used elsewhere (e.g., when replacing the existing plywood decking).

Moved by: Brian Narhi

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee receive the Condition Assessment and presentation on the Montebello Park Bandshell proposed maintenance projects.”

**CARRIED**

**8.2** 7 Shelley Avenue (Port Dalhousie HCD)

Owner(s): Up 21 Enterprises

Agent(s): Tim Sinke

File No.: 19 115260 HERT

- Proposed partial demolition of front porch and rear addition, new two-storey rear addition and relocation on site.

Tim Sinke provided some background information on the property, including that a previous application for demolition was recommended to be denied by the Committee and ultimately denied by Council.

Mr. Sinke provided an overview of the current proposal to the Committee. He advised that the new addition would be easy to differentiate from the existing house. The cladding would be different on the new addition while the existing house would be refaced with cladding similar to original. The building would be moved forward on site. The Committee did not feel that the addition is subordinate to the original structure. One member expressed their opinion that the addition is not sympathetic. The Committee largely disagreed with Mr. Sinke that the roofline of the new addition was appropriate. Mr. Sinke referenced the Port Dalhousie Heritage Conservation District Guidelines for Conservation and Change, as contemporary additions may be appropriate. Additionally, he referenced a similar yet larger addition at 7 Abbey Avenue. Chloe Richer provided the specific language used in the Guidelines regarding additions that interpret historically derived styles versus use contemporary design.

Moved by: David Bergen

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee request a revision to the design of the addition submitted that is more sympathetic to the existing cottage structure, specifically:

1. An alternate roof type; and
2. Cladding of the original structure that replicates the original cladding (pebble-dash).”

**CARRIED**

**8.3** 8 Paxton Avenue (Port Dalhousie HCD)

Owner(s): Joseph & Barbara Colonna

Agent(s): N/A

File No.: 20 100222 HERT

- Proposed construction of two new residential buildings pending a severance. A heritage permit application for the demolition of the existing building was previously approved.

Mr. Colonna summarized the proposals, and advised there are two proposals due to feedback from the Design Review Panel regarding the potential for a future road widening on Paxton Avenue. Chloe Richer clarified that there is no road widening currently planned. The Committee was generally supportive of both proposals and had few concerns.

The Committee discussed the roof height and the requirement for approval of a severance. The members agreed that they have no issue with the proposed height as long as the proposal is approved by the Committee of Adjustment.

Moved by: Holly Washuta

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend approval of the heritage permit application for 8 Paxton Avenue, for the construction of two new residential buildings pending Committee of Adjustment approvals (e.g., a severance).”

**CARRIED**

#### **8.4 18 Shelley Avenue (Port Dalhousie HCD)**

Owner(s): Peter and Ashley Given

Agent(s): N/A

File No.: 20 100388 HERT

- Proposed addition of second storey and covered wood front porch to c. 1965 dwelling. Demolition of existing garage and rear porch. Proposed materials include the original brick, aluminum siding and stone.

Ashley Given summarized the proposal. The building footprint will remain the same. A Committee member confirmed the existing house does not contribute to the heritage character of the surrounding area, as per the Port Dalhousie Heritage Conservation District Guidelines for Conservation and Change. Chloe Richer explained that there are different guidelines for additions to heritage buildings (pre-1950), non-heritage buildings and new construction in Port Dalhousie.

This was understood by the Committee and as such, the Committee was supportive of the proposed addition.

Moved by: Holly Washuta

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend approval of the heritage permit application for 18 Shelley Avenue, for the demolition of the existing garage and rear porch, and the addition of a second storey and covered wood front porch to the circa 1965 dwelling.”

**CARRIED**

**9. Information/Correspondence**

- Supporting information for Montebello Park Bandshell (Queen Street HCD).
- Supporting information for 7 Shelley Avenue.
- Supporting information for 8 Paxton Avenue.
- Supporting information for 18 Shelley Avenue.

**10. Date of next meeting**

Thursday, February 27, 2020

**11. Motion to Adjourn**

The meeting adjourned at 6:20pm

Committee Members should advise Chloe Richer (905-688-5601 ext. 1710) or [cricher@stcatharines.ca](mailto:cricher@stcatharines.ca) if they are unable to attend the meeting or did not receive the item(s) noted in the agenda.

# **Appendix A: Sub-Committee Minutes**

## Demolitions Rating System Sub-Committee

### **Minutes**

**Thursday, January 30, 2020**

**Atrium Room at 3:30pm**

#### **Attendance:**

Brian Narhi  
David Bergen

#### **Absent:**

Peter Connolly

#### **Staff Liaison:**

Chloe Richer, Heritage Planner, Planning and Building Services  
Connor Wright, Student Planner, Planning and Building Services

---

**1. Call meeting to order (Staff Liaison)**

3:36pm

**2. Recognition of Traditional Territories**

**3. Additions / Deletions to the Agenda**

None.

**4. Motion to approve the agenda**

Moved by: David Bergen

“That the Demolitions Rating System Sub-Committee ratify and adopt the agenda for this Demolitions Rating System Sub-Committee meeting held on Thursday, January 30<sup>th</sup>, 2020, copies having been previously distributed.”

**CARRIED**

**5. Motion to adopt the minutes of the previous meeting**

Moved by: Brian Narhi

“That the Minutes from the Demolitions Rating System Sub-Committee meeting of December 5, 2019, be approved.”

**CARRIED**

## **6. Business**

### **6.1 Appointment of Sub-Committee Chair**

Moved by: Brian Narhi

“That the Demolitions Rating System Sub-Committee appoint David Bergen as Chair for the 2020 to 2022 term.”

**CARRIED**

### **6.2 Appointment of Sub-Committee Vice-Chair**

Moved by: David Bergen

“That the Demolitions Rating System Sub-Committee appoint Brian Narhi as Vice-Chair for the 2020 to 2022 term.”

**CARRIED**

### **6.3 Review and update of the Demolitions Rating System**

Chloe Richer briefly summarized the proposed Demolitions Rating System, incorporating suggestions made at the December 2019 Sub-Committee meeting. Sub-Committee members discussed various changes to the Rating System, recorded by Ms. Richer to revise prior to the next Sub-Committee meeting. The Sub-Committee discussed potentially electing a designate to fill out the form for any given property. Members felt that the whole Committee should complete the forms instead, rather than one designate.

Members agreed to test two versions of the Rating System on several heritage houses previously proposed for demolition to gain a sense of their accuracy and viability. The Sub-Committee may then vote on the superior version of the system and make a recommendation to the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee.

Moved by: David Bergen

“That the Demolitions Rating System Sub-Committee receive the revised Demolitions Rating System.”

**CARRIED**

7. **Date of next meeting**

Thursday, February 27<sup>th</sup>, 2020

8. **Motion to Adjourn**

Moved by: Brian Narhi

“That the Demolitions Rating System Sub-Committee meeting be adjourned at 4:23pm.”

**CARRIED**