

# St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee

## Minutes

**Thursday, December 19, 2019**

**Burgoyne Woods Room at 4:30pm**

### **Attendance:**

Dr. John Bacher  
Peter Connolly  
John Crawley  
Brian Narhi  
Holly Washuta

### **Regrets:**

David Bergen  
Robert De Wolfe  
Andrew Humeniuk

### **Staff Liaison:**

Chloe Richer, Heritage Planner, Planning and Building Services  
Sydney Ditomasso, Planning Co-op Student, Planning and Building Services

---

#### **1. Call meeting to order (Chair)**

Brian Narhi called the meeting to order at 4:33pm

#### **2. Recognition of Traditional Territories**

#### **3. Additions / Deletions to the Agenda**

None.

#### **4. Motion to approve the agenda**

Moved by: John Crawley

“That the SCHPAC ratify and adopt the Agenda for this SCHPAC meeting held on December 19, 2019, copies having been previously distributed.”

**CARRIED**

**5. Motion to adopt the minutes of the previous meeting**

Moved by: Holly Washuta

“That the Minutes from the SChPAC meeting of November 28, 2019, be approved.”

**CARRIED**

**6. Presentations (invited guests)**

None.

**7. Business arising from the minutes**

None.

**8. Business**

**8.1 Designing a New Addition to a Heritage Building**

Chloe Richer, Heritage Planner (Staff Liaison)

- Presentation on the design elements of compatible additions to heritage buildings.

Chloe Richer presented design elements of compatible additions to heritage buildings. Ms. Richer discusses various heritage policies as they apply to additions, the compatibility of additions, and best practices when designing additions. Ms. Richer also shared a number of compatible and incompatible examples with the Committee. A member inquired about any guidelines for new construction adjacent to a heritage building.

Moved by: John Bacher

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee receive the presentation on Designing a New Addition to a Heritage Building.”

**CARRIED**

**8.2 Review of Heritage Conservation District Plans and Guidelines**

Chloe Richer, Heritage Planner (Staff Liaison)

- Review of applicable policies and guidelines in the City of Catharines' Heritage Conservation District (HCD) Plans and Guidelines for the four HCDs.

Chloe Richer presented high level conservation objectives, principles, and built heritage guidelines for each of the four Heritage Conservation District, as per the respective Plans or Guidelines. A member emphasized the importance of the streetscape when considering an alteration.

Moved by: John Bacher

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee receive the presentations on applicable policies and guidelines in the City of Catharines’ Heritage Conservation District (HCD) Plans and Guidelines for the four HCDs.”

**CARRIED**

**8.3 2019 SChPAC Overview**

Chloe Richer, Heritage Planner (Staff Liaison)

- High level overview of heritage permit application recommendations in 2019 and Committee accomplishments.

Chloe Richer summarized all of the heritage permits applied for in 2019. The Committee reflected on the year and discussed projects/opportunities such as the fall 2019 Heritage Training Workshop and the work to date of the Demolitions Rating System Sub-Committee.

Moved by: Holly Washuta

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee receive the presentation on 2019 SChPAC heritage permit application recommendations and accomplishments.”

**CARRIED**

**9. Information/Correspondence**

- [City of St. Catharines Heritage Conservation Districts page](#)

**10. Date of next meeting**

Thursday, January 30, 2020

**11. Motion to Adjourn**

The meeting adjourned at 5:30pm

Committee Members should advise Chloe Richer (905-688-5601 ext. 1710) or [cricher@stcatharines.ca](mailto:cricher@stcatharines.ca) if they are unable to attend the meeting or did not receive the item(s) noted in the agenda.

# Appendix A: Sub-Committee Minutes

## Demolitions Rating System Sub-Committee

### Minutes

**Thursday, December 05, 2019**

**Burgoyne Woods Room at 3:00pm**

#### **Attendance:**

Brian Narhi  
David Bergen  
Peter Connolly

#### **Staff Liaison:**

Chloe Richer, Heritage Planner, Planning and Building Services  
Sydney DiTomaso, Student Planner, Planning and Building Services

---

1. **Call meeting to order (Staff Liaison)**  
3:05pm
2. **Recognition of Traditional Territories**
3. **Additions / Deletions to the Agenda**  
None.
4. **Motion to approve the agenda**  
None.
5. **Motion to adopt the minutes of the previous meeting**  
None.
6. **Business**
  - 6.1 Review of Demolitions Rating Systems Versions 1-4

Member Comments on the Rating System Preamble:

- The Preamble should begin with what it means for a property to be designated under Parts IV and/or V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, and how demolition is discouraged.

Member Comments on Rating Systems:

- Option 1: Numerical format (On. Reg. 9/06 criteria)

- Favoured by two members in combination with the ABCD format (structural assessment) example from the City of London; see Option 3.
- Option 2: ABCD format (On. Reg. 9/06 criteria)
  - Members felt indifferent towards this option.
- Option 3: ABCD format (structural assessment)
  - City of London example.
  - Favoured by one member who suggested changing the following:
    - A Ranking: Rather than a built heritage resource having “any combination of the following attributes”, it has “2 or more of the following attributes”; and
    - B Ranking: Rather than a built heritage resource having “any combination of the following attributes”, it has “1 or 2 or more of the following attributes”.
- Option 4: Contributing vs. Non-contributing format (On. Reg. 9/06 criteria)
  - Members felt this format would be difficult to understand.
  - Members felt it is too subjective and would not assist well in making decisions regarding demolitions; note, the criteria are the same as with Options 1 and 2.
  - Chloe Richer noted this is the system currently used in the City’s most recently approved Heritage Conservation District Plan and feedback from municipal heritage planners has suggested it is a superior approach to a numerical or ABCD system.

**7. Date of next meeting**  
TBD.

**8. Motion to Adjourn**  
None.