

St. Catharines Heritage Advisory Committee

Minutes

Thursday, November 14, 2019

Burgoyne Woods Room at 4:30pm

Members:

Gail Benjafield
Andrew Humeniuk
Brian Narhi
Robert Speck
Peter Wing
Lorraine Giroux
Mark Hoerd
Justin Nicholls

Staff Liaison:

Chloe Richer, Heritage Planner, Planning and Building Services
Sydney Ditomasso, Student Planner, Planning and Building Services

Council:

Councillor Carlos Garcia

Public:

Graham Forrester and Chris Riou, Willowbank School of Restoration Arts
Dennis Gannon
Jessica Schroeder

1. Call meeting to order (Chair)

Brian Narhi called the meeting to order at 4:31pm

2. Recognition of Traditional Territories

3. Additions/Deletions to the agenda

- Resignation of SCHAC member David Donnelly (10. Information/Correspondence).

4. Motion to approve the agenda

Moved by: Andrew Humeniuk

“That the SCHAC ratify and adopt the agenda for this SCHAC meeting held on Thursday, November 14, 2019, copies having been previously distributed.”

CARRIED

5. Motion to approve the Minutes of the previous meeting

Moved by: Gail Benjafield

“That the SCHAC approve the minutes of the SCHAC meeting held on Thursday, October 10 and Wednesday, October 16, 2019, copies having been previously distributed.”

CARRIED

6. Presentations (Invited Guests)

Willowbank School of Restoration Arts Students, Regarding Item 8.1

Willowbank students Graham Forrester and Chris Riou shared findings on the Lord and Burnham greenhouse at Malcolmson Eco-Park.

- Mr. Forrester gave an overview of the location and reviewed the timeline of the greenhouse.
- The greenhouse was designed as a nursery for three decades, then was leased to the City of St. Catharines.
- In 1992, the Friends of Malcolmson Eco-Park were endorsed as stewards, who have been taking care of the park on a voluntary basis.
- The greenhouse is no longer visible from the road and is missing panes of glass, but much of the original structure is intact.
- A condition assessment was completed in a full report.
- Findings concluded that the structure is sound and can be reused if desired, however, there is currently no efficient way of heating it.
- Future courses of action:
 - Mothball;
 - Prioritized repair;
 - Relocate (generally a last resort);
 - Designate and develop (recommended); and/or
 - Rehabilitate and revitalized – (preferred option, but has significant costs association with the proposal):
 - Improving the visibility from Lakeshore Road;
 - Reorganizing the visitor amenities;
 - Community engagement; and

- Rehabilitating the greenhouse and potting shed.

The Committee showed interest in rehabilitation of the greenhouse while students from Willowbank expressed concern regarding its exposure to the elements and vandalism by the public. Two members of the Friends group were in attendance and clarified the location of a water trail for the Committee. They expressed interest in the rehabilitation option and advised that it could stand as a great heritage piece. A member of the Committee stressed the importance of the financial considerations of rehabilitation. A member of the Committee asked about potential investors, to which there have been none. The Willowbank students made a suggestion of using the greenhouse as a nursery (as it once was). A member of the Committee suggested approaching the St. Catharines Horticulture Society and/or Niagara Parks.

Moved by: Robert Speck

“That the presentation by Willowbank School of Restoration Arts students regarding the Lord and Burnham Greenhouse (at Malcolmson Eco-Park, 325 Lakeshore Road) Historic Structure Report be received.”

CARRIED

7. Business arising from the Minutes

7.1 26/30 Ontario Street (Welland House) Update Chloe Richer, Heritage Planner and Staff Liaison

Update provided regarding Welland House, 26/30 Ontario Street.

Chloe Richer updated the Committee regarding 26/30 Ontario Street (Welland House). Colleagues in Property Standards are investigating the site and Orders to Comply have been issued. The building is not completely secured and Fire and Emergency Services is involved. Senior Leadership is also aware of the concerns. The Committee expressed interest in a potential designation of the property and Chloe outlined the designation process. Brian Narhi, Andrew Humeniuk and Mark Hoerdts expressed interest in being involved in the research process.

Moved by: Peter Wing

“That research be compiled by the SCHAC on Welland House (26/30 Ontario Street) towards a possible future heritage designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. The draft research should be completed by Brian Narhi, Andrew Humeniuk and Mark Hoerdts by the end of February, 2020.”

CARRIED

8. Business

- 8.1** Historic Structure Report on the Greenhouse at Malcolmson Eco-Park
325 Lakeshore Road
Willowbank School of Restoration Arts
Willowbank students to share the findings and recommendations from their Historic Structure Report on the greenhouse at Malcolmson Eco-Park.

Refer to Section 6.

- 8.2** NS&T Railway Plaques
Paul Chapman, Niagara Division of Canadian Railroad Historical Association
Presentation of draft commemorative plaque, to be located near an area of significance to the NS&T Railway.

Paul Chapman discussed the progression of the proposed plaque's content and photographs.

Mr. Chapman introduced three proposed locations of the plaque at 191 Welland Avenue:

1. Located at the corner of Welland Avenue and Geneva Street;
2. Located by the easterly façade; and
3. Located on the boulevard by the bus stop at the easterly lot line.

Mr. Chapman reviewed the location of the former terminal and suggested the historical photograph taken at the Welland-Geneva intersection provides construction details. Mr. Chapman reviewed the former rail line patterns and emphasizes the importance of the lost infrastructure.

Chloe Richer received feedback from the Region of Niagara, who has expressed concerns regarding visibility of the first proposed location. The City of St. Catharines Transportation Services, Engineering, Facilities and Environmental Services is willing to examine Location 3 in greater detail. A member of the Committee suggested that Location 1 would be unsafe due to the current nature of the intersection and also suggested the plaque be of an appropriate word count (as to avoid wordiness). Another member believes that if the plaque is located at Welland Avenue and Geneva Street, people might vandalize it. The surface of the plaque is generally designed to ensure graffiti can be cleaned easily.

Moved by: Lorraine Giroux

“That the SCHAC supports the draft text and photographs to be included in the first NS&T Railway plaque and the proposed Location 2 as the preferred option or Location 3 as an alternate option at 191 Welland Avenue, and requests the design of the plaque be shared with the SCHAC for final feedback once the graphic design work is completed.”

CARRIED

9. Updates from Sub-Committees

9.1 Designations, Plaquing and Ceremonies

None.

9.2 Public Outreach and Education (POE)

- Discussed Brian Narhi’s downtown walking tour.
- Discussed the new Designated Property Grant Program Guidelines and brochure.
- Library display work will start in the New Year.
- Doors Open Ontario: participating in the 2021 event may be an option pending 2020 budget approvals.
- Discussed the significant individuals list – the Sub-Committee will review and refine it.
- Brian recently gave a talk on how to research your property, in which a Guide may be created as a future project.
- Mike Britton expressed interest in a Facer Street plaque.

Moved by: Gail Benjafield

“That the update from the Public Outreach and Education (POE) Sub-Committee be received.”

CARRIED

9.3 Research and Inventory (R & I)

- Reviewed the presentation of potential properties to list on the Municipal Heritage Register as non-designated properties of cultural heritage value or interest.
- Discussed how to approach properties with extensive alterations.

- Some properties were changed from a recommendation of not listing the property to listing with a lower priority as per the Sub-Committee's feedback.
- Chloe Richer will present the properties in December once the recommendations are finalized.
- Chloe Richer explained how the process will unfold following the next Committee meeting.

Moved by: Robert Speck

"That the update from the Research and Inventory (R & I) Sub-Committee be received."

CARRIED

10. Information/Correspondence

- Historic Structure Report on Greenhouse at Malcolmson Eco-Park, 325 Lakeshore Road
- Draft of NS&T Railway Plaque (proposed Welland and Geneva location)
- [The Search for A Lost Pioneer Cemetery: The Brown Burial Ground Discovery Walk](#)
- Resignation of SCHAC member David Donnelly.
- John Brown House (1317 Pelham Road) de-designation and re-designation notices were published in The Standard on November 7th and November 8th, 2019.
- Brian Narhi shared posters of historical doors in the Yates Street and Queen Street Heritage Conservation Districts.
- Lorraine Giroux reminded Committee members of an upcoming event with Toronto Star reporter Tanya Talaga, author of Seven Fallen Feathers.

10. Date of next meeting

Thursday, December 12, 2019

11. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 5:55pm