

St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee

Minutes

Thursday, November 28, 2019

Burgoyne Woods Room at 4:30pm

Attendance:

Dr. John Bacher
David Bergen
Peter Connolly
John Crawley
Robert De Wolfe
Brian Narhi
Holly Washuta

Regrets:

Andrew Humeniuk

Staff Liaison:

Chloe Richer, Heritage Planner, Planning and Building Services
Sydney Ditomasso, Planning Co-op Student, Planning and Building Services

Council:

Councillor Carlos Garcia

Public:

- Michael D. Allan (ACK Architects), Regarding Item 8.1
- Connie Tintinalli (Chapman Murray Associates Architects Inc.), Paul Battaglia and Katherine Beaton, Regarding Item 8.2
- Larisa Brodsky (Larisa Brodsky Architect Inc.), Regarding Item 8.3

1. Call meeting to order (Chair)

Robert De Wolfe called the meeting to order at 4:34pm

2. Recognition of Traditional Territories

3. Additions / Deletions to the Agenda

- 3.1** 2020 St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee Work Plan
Chloe Richer, Heritage Planner and Staff Liaison

- Chloe Richer to present the draft 2020 St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee Work Plan.

Chloe Richer presented the draft 2020 St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee Work Plan, to be shared with the Cultural Sustainability Advisory Committee in January 2020. A key work item is the updated Demolitions Rating System, which the Demolitions Rating System Sub-Committee is currently working on. The purpose of this work item is to determine how the existing system can be improved and used throughout the City. It will tentatively be presented in February 2020.

Moved by: John Bacher

“That the SCHPAC receive the draft 2020 St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee Work Plan.”

CARRIED

4. Motion to approve the agenda

Moved by: John Crawley

“That the SCHPAC ratify and adopt the Agenda for this SCHPAC meeting held on November 28, 2019, copies having been previously distributed.”

CARRIED

5. Motion to adopt the minutes of the previous meeting

Moved by: Holly Washuta

“That the Minutes from the SCHPAC meeting of October 30, 2019, be approved.”

CARRIED

6. Presentations (invited guests)

- Michael D. Allan (ACK Architects), Regarding Item 8.1
- Connie Tintinalli (Chapman Murray Associates Architects Inc.), Regarding Item 8.2
- Larisa Brodsky (Larisa Brodsky Architect Inc.), Regarding Item 8.3

7. Business arising from the minutes

None.

8. Business

8.1 93 Dalhousie Avenue (Port Dalhousie HCD)

Owner(s): Dave Robinson

Agent(s): Michael D. Allan, ACK Architects

File No.: 19 114627 HERT

- Proposed rear addition and alterations to the front and side facades (modernization of front façade, alterations to window and door openings and removal of chimney).

Michael D. Allan presented a brief overview of the application to the Committee. The proposal suggests renovating and maintaining the majority of the dwelling. Mr. Allan advised that most of the window openings will be maintained and the owner will likely use materials such as Hardie Board (cement fibre) as siding. An addition is proposed for the rear of the dwelling. The Committee asked about the porch on the front addition. Mr. Allen clarified that they are only extending the porch rather than constructing an addition. The Committee asked about the removal of brick on the front and side, which is proposed to be removed to accommodate the contemporary roof. The brick removed will be relocated as to ensure the historic cladding material (brick) is continuous.

Moved by: John Bacher

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend approval of the Heritage Permit application for 93 Dalhousie Avenue for the proposed rear addition and alterations to the front and side facades (modernization of front façade, alterations to window and door openings and removal of chimney).”

CARRIED

8.2 17 Canal Street (Port Dalhousie HCD)

Owner(s): Katherine Beaton

Agent(s): Connie Tintinalli, Chapman Murray Associates Architects Inc.

File No.: 19 114595 HT

- Two-storey rear addition, replacement of existing cladding and alterations to the front porch.

Connie Tintinalli presented the proposal and discussed issues such as poor quality siding installed in 2012. The owners propose to re-clad the house with Maibec wood siding. An addition is proposed in the rear and will be set back from the main house. The new roof will be consistent with the original dwelling and the owners are also proposing to alter the existing porch. The owners have chosen a soft warm white colour for the new cladding of the house. The Committee feels the proposed addition is

appropriate and highly compatible with the original house. The Committee encouraged the owners to choose wood shakes as siding. The owners are open to using cedar shingles in order to be compatible with the surrounding neighbourhood.

Moved by: Brian Narhi

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend approval of the Heritage Permit application for 17 Canal Street for the two-storey rear addition, replacement of the existing vinyl cladding with wood siding and alterations to the front porch (traditional wood detailing).”

CARRIED

8.3 40 Lock Street (Port Dalhousie HCD)

Owner(s): Alan McLean

Agent(s): Larisa Brodsky Architect

File No.: 19 108804 HERT

- Proposed rear addition to the existing dwelling, and removal of the existing three additions (revised submission).

Larisa Brodsky presented a new proposal of a rear addition and removal of the existing three additions. Ms. Brodsky proposed to demolish the existing garage and replace it with a new masonry garage set slightly back from the front wall of the dwelling. Ms. Brodsky also proposed a garden as well as a masonry garden wall on the northwest side of the house to add landscaping/greenery. The addition in the rear will have tongue and groove-style siding. Ms. Brodsky advised that the windows in the rear will be similarly placed as those on the front wall. Ms. Brodsky would like to expose as much brick in the rear as possible in the interior of the dwelling if brick is found beneath the exterior cladding and hopes to salvage enough brick in order to make an appropriate transition from brick to stone on the east elevation. Chloe Richer encouraged consideration of reducing the height of the garage to expose the existing horizontal brick detailing. The Committee asked if the chimney in the proposed elevations is original and Ms. Brodsky clarified the chimney will be new and will be constructed with brick that is compatible with the original structure. The Committee feels the revised proposal maintains the house and ties in nicely with the surrounding area. The Committee suggested reaching out to Rankin Construction for compatible brick from their demolition of the rear additions at 16 Lock Street. The Committee feels the scale of the house is more appropriate than of the previously submitted plans.

Moved by: John Bacher

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend approval of the Heritage Permit application for the proposed rear addition to the existing dwelling, and removal of the existing three additions, subject to the following conditions:

- The decorative brickwork, including the banding, be retained on the front and side facades where possible; and
- Brick be considered as an alternate material for the new garage.”

CARRIED

9. Information/Correspondence

- Supporting information for 93 Dalhousie Avenue.
- Supporting information for 17 Canal Street.
- Supporting information for 40 Lock Street (revised submission).
- Updated draft 2020 St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee Work Plan.
- The Committee requested an update on Welland House (26/30 Ontario Street), which Chloe Richer provided.

10. Date of next meeting

Thursday, December 19, 2019

11. Motion to Adjourn

The meeting adjourned at 5:13pm

Committee Members should advise Chloe Richer (905-688-5601 ext. 1710) or cricher@stcatharines.ca if they are unable to attend the meeting or did not receive the item(s) noted in the agenda.