

St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee & St. Catharines Heritage Advisory Committee

Minutes

Wednesday, October 30, 2019

Burgoyne Woods Room at 4:30pm

Attendance:

Gail Benjafield (SCHAC) (left at 5:45 pm)
David Bergen (SCHPAC)
Peter Connolly (SCHPAC) (left at 5:10 pm)
John Crawley (SCHPAC)
Robert De Wolfe (SCHPAC)
Andrew Humeniuk (SCHPAC & SCHAC)
Brian Narhi (SCHPAC & SCHAC)
Robert Speck (SCHAC)
Holly Washuta (SCHPAC)
Peter Wing (SCHAC)

Regrets:

Dr. John Bacher (SCHPAC)
David Donnelly (SCHAC)
Lorraine Giroux (SCHAC)
Justin Nicholls (SCHAC)

Absent:

Mark Hoerdts (SCHAC)

Staff Liaison:

Chloe Richer, Heritage Planner, Planning and Building Services
Amanda Knutson, Planner II, Planning and Building Services

Public:

- Andrew Hellwig (Andrew Hellwig Design Consultants Inc.), Regarding Item 8.1
 - Sheldon Rosen (Port Dalhousie Harbour Club), Bruce Hall (The Planning Partnership), Wayne Morgan (Heritage Planner) and Jason Fung (Jason Fung Architect Inc.), Regarding Item 8.2
 - Vanessa Hicks (MHBC) and Jim Frank (Rankin Construction Inc.), Regarding Item 8.3
-

1. Call meeting to order (Chair)

Brian Narhi called the meeting to order at 4:32pm

2. Recognition of Traditional Territories

3. Additions / Deletions to the Agenda

None.

4. Motion to approve the agenda

Moved by: Robert De Wolfe

“That the SChPAC and the SCHAC ratify and adopt the Agenda for this joint SChPAC and SCHAC meeting held on October 30, 2019, copies having been previously distributed.”

CARRIED

5. Motion to adopt the minutes of the previous meeting

Moved by: John Crawley

“That the Minutes from the SChPAC meeting of September 25, 2019, be approved.”

CARRIED

6. Presentations (invited guests)

- Bruce Hall (The Planning Partnership) and Wayne Morgan (Heritage Planner), Regarding Item 8.2
- Vanessa Hicks (MHBC), Regarding Item 8.3

7. Business arising from the minutes

None.

8. Business

8.1 68 Dalhousie Avenue (Port Dalhousie HCD)

Owner(s): Mr. Lewis Nickerson

Agent(s): Mr. Andrew Hellwig

File No.: 19 113636 HERT

- Proposed demolition of circa 1970s sunroom addition and construction of new solarium.

Andrew Hellwig provided a brief overview of the proposed alterations. The Committee sought to confirm whether the footprint of the new solarium

would remain the same as the existing sunroom addition. Mr. Hellwig advised that this would be the case. The Committee did not have any heritage concerns regarding the proposal.

Moved by: Robert De Wolfe

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend approval of the Heritage Permit application for 68 Dalhousie Avenue for the proposed demolition of the circa 1970s sunroom addition and the construction of a replacement solarium.”

CARRIED

8.2 61-63 Lakeport Road (Port Dalhousie HCD)

Owner(s): Port Dalhousie Harbour Group Inc.

Agent(s): Bruce Hall, The Planning Partnership

File No.: 19 113656 000 00 HERT

- Proposed demolition of the front and rear additions of the former Lincoln Fabrics building, and retention of the original structure.

Chloe Richer provided a brief overview of the steps taken since the initial Zoning By-law Amendment submission in November 2017.

Bruce Hall provided an overview of the development and further details on the steps that have been taken. He also discussed site plan details, the landscape plan, changes in the elevations, etc.

Wayne Morgan provided an overview of the Protection Plan (prevention of vandalism, weather, construction, etc.) and Conservation Plan (repairs, stabilizations, preservation, etc.). He advised that the North Wing is structurally unsound; two storeys were previously removed to try and address this concern. Mr. Morgan discussed the reuse of bricks and stone for repairs; the stair tower (the windows will be aligned); other window opening infills (brick or concrete block) to be removed; 14 new ground floor door openings (removing the brick below and the sill); reconstruction of the cupola; and replacement window sashes with the original number of panes (no original windows are left). Mr. Morgan has recommended not cleaning the masonry and leaving the heritage patina, though non-abrasive technique may be used where necessary. There will be no new structural supports in the rooftop addition driven into heritage building. Some interior elements will be conserved (two metal columns are to remain exposed, and the staircase posts, doors and machinery are to be salvaged). Mr. Morgan has also recommended a Heritage Easement Agreement (which is a recommendation that went before Council), an

annual building audit, City inspection, and not to use salt to prevent deterioration of the masonry.

The Committee asked various questions regarding the wooden pilings and structural concerns; the demolition process and contractors; security measures such as alarms; dust control; commemoration of the site, salvage and reuse of materials and records management; and alterations to the window openings. The applicant's team provided additional information on the topics of interest.

Moved by: Robert De Wolfe

"That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend approval of the Heritage Permit application for 61-63 Lakeport Road for the proposed demolition of the South Addition, North Wing and fire escapes of the former Lincoln Fabrics building and retention of the original structure, and recommend conditional approval of the addition/new construction and restoration work, subject to the following conditions:

- The contractors follow the conservation measures recommended in the Conservation Plan (October 2019);
- During demolition, materials such as brick, stone and circular windows be salvaged and stored on site for future repairs;
- Interior elements of cultural heritage value or interest (e.g., staircase posts, interior doors and machinery) be salvaged and reinstalled/reinstated where possible;
- A Commemoration Brief be submitted for the SCHAC's review by January 15th, 2020, that outlines ways to commemorate the history and former uses of the site;
- The property owner be required to enter into a Heritage Easement Agreement with the City of St. Catharines;
- The maintenance measures recommended in the Conservation Plan (October 2019) be implemented, e.g., annual building audit by a qualified heritage consultant;
- The protection measures recommended in the Protection Plan (October 2019), be implemented, e.g., constructing a temporary physical barrier to prevent unauthorized access to the site; and
- Approval of the addition/new construction through Site Plan review."

CARRIED

8.3 16 Lock Street (Port Dalhousie HCD)

Owner(s): The Locks Inc.

Agent(s): N/A

File No.: 19 112959 HERT

- Proposed demolition of the 1- and 2-storey rear additions to 16 Lock Street and retention of the original 3-storey portion of the structure.

Vanessa Hicks (MHBC) provided an overview of the partial demolition proposal (e.g., eras of construction of the rear additions). Ms. Hicks advised that the partial demolitions are a neutral impact as the rear additions are not heritage attributes. MHBC will be on site before, during and after demolition takes place. Other mitigation recommendations were discussed, e.g., older bricks can be salvaged and stored on site to be used in restoration work.

The Committee asked why Addition B cannot be retained as it does have some heritage value, though it is not a heritage attribute. Jim Frank discussed deterioration such as floor joists rotting and mold due to water damage. Mr. Frank advised that a structural engineer inspected the building and was not certain that the rear additions are structurally sound for workers to enter. The applicant's approach is to retain the original three-storey structure and they are still working through the process in terms of new architectural plans. The Committee asked additional questions regarding the salvage and reuse of materials, security measures such as fencing, and what is located in the second floor of Addition B. Long-standing Committee members advised that the rear additions were in poor shape during a previous tour approximately eight years ago and the previous Committee was willing to support the demolition of the rear additions so that the original three-storey structure could be retained.

Moved by: Holly Washuta

"That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend approval of the Heritage Permit application for the proposed demolition of the 1- and 2-storey rear additions to 16 Lock Street and retention of the original 3-storey portion of the structure, subject to the following conditions:

- That the demolition contractors follow the mitigation recommendations outlined in the Heritage Impact Assessment, Section 9.3 Demolition Plan (October 2019);
- During demolition, materials such as brick be salvaged and stored on site for reuse;
- Security measures such as fencing be implemented; and
- A Commemoration Brief be submitted for the SCHAC's review that outlines ways to commemorate the history and former uses of the site."

CARRIED

9. Information/Correspondence

- Supporting information for 68 Dalhousie Avenue.
- Supporting information for 61-63 Lakeport Road.
- Supporting information for 16 Lock Street.
- The Committee requested an update regarding Welland House (26/30 Ontario Street). Chloe Richer will follow up with additional information.
- 2020 Ontario Heritage Conference flyer.

10. Date of next meeting

Thursday, November 28, 2019

11. Motion to Adjourn

The meeting adjourned at 6:24pm

Committee Members should advise Chloe Richer (905-688-5601 ext. 1710) or cricher@stcatharines.ca if they are unable to attend the meeting or did not receive the item(s) noted in the agenda.