

St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee

Minutes

Thursday, August 29, 2019

Burgoyne Woods Room at 4:30pm

Attendance:

Dr. John Bacher
Brian Narhi
Holly Washuta
John Crawley
Peter Connolly

Regrets:

David Bergen
Andrew Humeniuk
Robert De Wolfe

Staff Liaison:

Chloe Richer, Heritage Planner, Planning and Building Services
Mallory Smith, Student Planner, Planning and Building Services

Public:

Patrick O'Leary, Regarding Item 8.1
Lawrence Servos, Beverly Hendry and Michael Mirynech (2M Architects Inc.),
Regarding Item 8.2
Gabriel and Stephanie Demarco and Mark Shoalts, P.Eng., CAHP, Regarding Item 8.3
Rochelle Bush and Mark Shoalts, P.Eng., CAHP, Regarding Item 8.4

1. Call meeting to order (Chair)

Brian Narhi called the meeting to order at 4:37pm

2. Recognition of Traditional Territories

3. Additions / Deletions to the Agenda

- "5. Motion to adopt the minutes of the previous meeting" deleted from the agenda as the previous meeting minutes from August 22, 2019, are being prepared for the September 2019 meeting.

- “8.5 Rating System for Demolitions Sub-Committee” update deleted from the agenda due to limited time for the meeting prior to losing quorum.

4. Motion to approve the agenda

Moved by: Holly Washuta

“That the Agenda for the meeting of August 29, 2019, be approved.”

CARRIED

5. Motion to adopt the minutes of the previous meeting

None.

6. Presentations (invited guests)

None.

7. Business arising from the minutes

None.

8. Business

8.1 27 Christie Street (Port Dalhousie HCD)
Owner(s): Patrick O’Leary/Lorraine McKenzie
 Agent(s): N/A
 File No.: 19 110593 HERT

- Proposed exterior alterations (replacement front porch, replacement mud room, conversion of existing second front door to a window, new cladding and window replacement throughout).

The Committee did not have any significant concerns regarding the exterior alterations completed to date. Councillor Garcia requested confirmation of the proposed material for the board and batten-style cladding; the applicant advised it will be aluminum cladding. As per the Port Dalhousie Heritage Conservation District Guidelines for Conservation and Change, a heritage permit is not required for the installation of aluminum siding on existing structures without aluminum siding. The original cladding is to be retained beneath the new aluminum cladding.

Moved by: John Bacher

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend approval of the heritage permit application for 27 Christie Street for the proposed exterior alterations (replacement front porch, replacement mud

room, conversion of existing second front door to a window, new cladding and window replacement throughout).”

CARRIED

8.2 5 Ann Street (Port Dalhousie HCD)

Owner(s): Lawrence Servos/Beverly Hendry

Agent(s): Michael Mirynech (2M Architects Inc.)

File No.: 19 110640 00 HERT

- Proposed partial demolition and new additions to the existing structure. Existing one-and-a-half storey portion (c. 1876) of the structure to remain.

The applicant indicated that the character of the existing house and streetscape will be maintained through the new additions. A member of the Committee spoke to the history of the house and its current deteriorated state. Comments were made that supported the design of the garage, as the entryway will be accessed from the side of the addition rather than from the front façade. Councillor Garcia indicated that two-storey additions would not be subordinate; Mr. Mirynech discussed how the proposed two-storey additions would maintain the streetscape. Chloe requested confirmation of the proposed materials and the applicant advised the cladding would not be vinyl or aluminum; they are exploring options such as Hardie board siding (cement fibre siding). Chloe advised that there may be some changes to the proposed plans due to concerns regarding the requested minor variance(s); the Committee may choose to defer the application to September 2019 or recommend approval for the heritage permit that is conditional upon approval by the Committee of Adjustment.

Moved by: Peter Connolly

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend approval of the heritage permit application for 5 Ann Street for the proposed demolition of the existing rear and side additions, and the new 2-storey rear and side additions with a single-storey garage, subject to the following conditions:

- Conditional upon approval by the Committee of Adjustment; and
- Colour and materials be compatible with the historical building materials.”

CARRIED

8.3 166 Dalhousie Avenue (Port Dalhousie HCD)

Owner(s): Gabriel and Stephanie Demarco

Agent(s): Mark Shoalts, P.Eng., CAHP

File No.: 19 110794 HERT

- Proposed demolition of the existing dwelling and construction of a new two-storey brick dwelling.

Chloe provided background information on the Committee's discussion in May 2019 regarding a previous application submitted by different applicants to demolish the existing house, which did not include architectural plans as supporting documentation. Mr. Shoalts provided an overview of his findings in the Heritage Impact Assessment, that the property contains little Cultural Heritage Value or Interest (CHVI) and that it would not make economic nor practical sense to upgrade and adapt the existing building. Councillor Garcia advised that demolitions should be actively discouraged, as per the Port Dalhousie Heritage Conservation District Guidelines for Conservation.

The Committee discussed the extent of the CHVI of the property, and whether any of the original features remain. The Committee members expressed some differing opinions, however, the majority agreed the existing house has little CHVI, the proposed new build would be in character with the neighbourhood and the design meets the intent of the Port Dalhousie Heritage Conservation District Guidelines for Conservation. The Committee asked whether a new use could be found for the existing dwelling if it were moved to the rear of the property (e.g., as a shed) and the applicants advised that they would like to maximize the green space for their child.

Moved by: Peter Connolly

"That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend approval of the Heritage Permit application for the full demolition of the existing dwelling at 166 Dalhousie Avenue and recommend approval of the new dwelling as per the architectural plans submitted with the application (dated August 21, 2019)."

CARRIED

- 8.4** 92 Geneva Street (Part IV Designated Property)
Owner(s): Trustees of the Salem Chapel British Methodist Episcopal Church
Agent(s): Mark Shoalts, P.Eng., CAHP

File No.: 19 110818 HERT

- Proposed restoration of the canopy over the front entryway (removal of temporary posts, replacement of deteriorated woodwork and painting).

The applicant provided a brief overview of the proposed restoration work. Photographs of the canopy over the front entryway prior to the installation of the temporary posts, as well as photographs showing the posts and damage to the canopy (e.g., deteriorated wood), were reviewed by the Committee. The Committee inquired about any future restoration work to the church structure. Chloe advised that the City has a grant available for designated heritage properties which may assist with covering some of the costs of future restoration work.

Moved by: Peter Connolly

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend approval of the heritage permit application for 92 Geneva Street, for the proposed restoration of the canopy over the front entryway, subject to an accurate restoration (e.g., replacement woodwork with like material and similar grain pattern to previous material, new canopy to match the existing canopy in size, top line 100% acrylic paint be used, and painting of the new downspouts to match the woodwork).”

9. Information/Correspondence

- Supporting information for 27 Christie Street.
- Supporting information for 5 Ann Street.
- Supporting information for 166 Dalhousie Avenue.
- Supporting information for 92 Geneva Street.

10. Date of next meeting

Wednesday, September 25, 2019

11. Motion to Adjourn

The meeting adjourned at 5:34pm

Committee Members should advise Chloe Richer (905-688-5601 ext. 1710) or cricher@stcatharines.ca if they are unable to attend the meeting or did not receive the item(s) noted in the agenda.