

St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee

Minutes

Thursday, July 25, 2019

Burgoyne Woods Room at 4:30pm

Attendance:

Dr. John Bacher
David Bergen
Robert De Wolfe
Andrew Humeniuk
Brian Narhi
Holly Washuta

Regrets:

John Crawley

Absent:

Peter Connolly

Staff Liaison:

Chloe Richer, Heritage Planner, Planning and Building Services
Mallory Smith, Student Planner, Planning and Building Services

Public:

Luigi Marcantonio (2M Architects Inc.), Scott Sweitzer and Adriana Sweitzer, 38
Lakeport Road
Larisa Brodsky and John Davies (Larisa Brodsky Architect Inc.), 40 and 42 Lock Street

1. **Call meeting to order (Chair)**
Robert De Wolfe called the meeting to order at 4:32pm
2. **Recognition of Traditional Territories**
3. **Additions / Deletions to the Agenda**
None.
4. **Motion to approve the agenda**

Moved by: David Bergen

“That the Agenda for the meeting of July 25, 2019, be approved.”

CARRIED

5. Motion to adopt the minutes of the previous meeting

Moved by: David Bergen

“That the Minutes from the SChPAC meeting of June 27, 2019, be approved.”

CARRIED

6. Presentations (invited guests)

Luigi Marcantonio (2M Architects Inc.), 38 Lakeport Road

Larisa Brodsky (Larisa Brodsky Architect Inc.), 40 and 42 Lock Street

7. Business arising from the minutes

None.

8. Business

8.1 17 Salina Street (Yates Street HCD)

Owner(s): Toby Ley

Agent(s): N/A

File No.: 19 108441 00 HERT

- Existing exterior rear deck constructed of wood.

The Committee did not have any concerns regarding the existing exterior rear deck constructed of wood.

Moved by: Brian Narhi

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend approval of the heritage permit application for 17 Salina Street for the existing exterior rear deck constructed of wood.”

CARRIED

8.2 38 Lakeport Road (Port Dalhousie HCD)

Owner(s): Scott Sweitzer

Agent(s): 2M Architects Inc.

File No.: 19 108806 HERT

- Proposed exterior alterations to the existing former Murphy's Restaurant building.

Luigi Marcantonio, on behalf of the applicants, presented the proposed alterations to 38 Lakeport Road. Chloe clarified which of the alterations require heritage permit approval as per the Port Dalhousie Heritage Conservation District Guidelines for Conservation and Change. The applicants wish to use dark taupe as the colour for some of the exterior features. After a discussion occurred, the Committee expressed their support for the proposal.

Moved by: Holly Washuta

"That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend approval of the heritage permit application for 38 Lakeport Road, for the following alterations:

- New window opening, to match the existing window openings, in the West Elevation (Hogan's Alley façade);
- Conversion of two existing door openings to window openings, to match the existing window openings, in the North Elevation (courtyard façade);
- New door opening, to match the existing door opening, in the North Elevation (courtyard façade);
- Demolition of the existing tiki bar structure;
- New bump out in the rear of the shed roof of the adjacent frame structure to accommodate a suite washroom;
- New prefinished openable storefront window system; and
- New painted cement fibre panels below and around storefront windows, in the East Elevation (main/front façade).

A heritage permit application will be required for the construction of a new courtyard structure (outdoor kitchen and bar)."

CARRIED

8.3 40 Lock Street (Port Dalhousie HCD)

Owner(s): Alan McLean

Agent(s): Larisa Brodsky Architect

File No.: 19 108804 HERT

- Proposed addition to the existing dwelling, and removal of the existing garage and rear side entrance.

Larisa Brodsky, on behalf of the applicant, presented the proposed design. The Committee expressed concern about the height and size of the addition, as well as the demolition of a significant portion of the structure to the rear of the façade. Larisa discussed some of the challenges with the site. The Committee expressed that the addition may not be appropriate for the area. The applicant suggested lowering the roof and removal of the third floor from the proposed design. A desire for a site visit was expressed by the Committee, which Chloe will set up. A neighbour in attendance expressed concern about the impact of increased shadows on their property and requested a shadow study. Another neighbor inquired about the setback of the deck.

Moved by: John Bacher

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend deferral of the heritage permit application for 40 Lock Street, pending a site visit and concerns regarding the height and size of the proposed addition being addressed in a revised design.”

CARRIED

8.4 42 Lock Street (Port Dalhousie HCD)

Owner(s): Alan McLean

Agent(s): Larisa Brodsky Architect

File No.: 19 108803 HERT

- Proposed three-storey International-style dwelling on a severed lot.

Larisa Brodsky, on behalf of the applicant, presented the proposal. The Committee discussed concerns about the three-storey height of the proposed new dwelling and the flat roof. Larisa advised her design intent is to tie the streetscape together as there is a modern apartment building on the street. Concern regarding the contrast of the house with other homes on the street was discussed by the Committee. Heritage Planning staff clarified the policies in the Port Dalhousie Heritage Conservation District Guidelines for Conservation and Change regarding new construction and roof styles. The Committee requested revisions to the proposal that would respect the roof guidelines.

Moved by: John Bacher

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend deferral of the heritage permit application for 42 Lock Street, pending revisions to the design regarding the height of the proposed dwelling and the roof type.”

CARRIED

8.5 Annual SChPAC Work Plan

Chloe Richer, Heritage Planner (Staff Liaison)

- Discussed priorities, action items and accomplishments for the 2019 Work Plan.

Chloe presented the draft Annual SChPAC Work Plan for the Committee’s review and consideration.

Moved by: John Bacher

“Receive the draft 2019 SChPAC Work Plan, subject to modification, for guidance throughout the 2019 to 2022 term.”

CARRIED

8.6 Rating System for Demolitions Sub-Committee

Chloe Richer, Heritage Planner (Staff Liaison)

- Formal appointment of Committee members is also to include a clear mandate of the Sub-Committee and start/end dates.

Chloe advised that for the Rating System for Demolitions Sub-Committee to be officially established, the Committee needs to pass motions regarding the mandate of the Sub-Committee and start/end dates, as well as a motion appointing members to the Sub-Committee.

Moved by: John Bacher

“That a Rating System for Demolitions Sub-Committee be established, with a start date of July 25, 2019, to the end date of the Committee term, to report back to the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee as needed, with a mandate of:

- Conducting a policy review of existing practices by other municipalities in Ontario; and
- Reviewing the existing Rating System for Demolitions and updating the System accordingly.”

CARRIED

Moved by: John Bacher

“Appoint Peter Connolly, Brian Narhi and David Bergen as members of the Rating System for Demolitions Sub-Committee for the 2019 to 2022 term.”

CARRIED

8.7 Draft Heritage Permit Application Submission Guidelines
Chloe Richer, Heritage Planner (Staff Liaison)

The Committee reviewed and discussed the draft Heritage Permit Application Submission Guidelines prepared by Heritage Planning staff.

At the [June 2019](#) SChPAC meeting, Chloe presented an overview of the draft Heritage Permit Application Submission Guidelines. The Committee was generally supportive of the draft Guidelines.

The discussion of whether to include smaller projects in the summary tables for the Queen Street and Yates Street Heritage Conservation Districts was deferred until the next Committee meeting due to the heavy agenda. The Committee expressed not wanting to change the existing practice of typically only requiring a heritage permit application for large projects in Heritage Conservation Districts. A Committee member suggested more education and outreach to property owners regarding the best conservation practices, and creating brochures on different types of heritage projects and alterations.

Moved by: John Bacher

“That the SChPAC has received the draft Heritage Permit Application Submission Guidelines prepared by Heritage Planning staff, subject to modification, for future use in assisting applicants with preparing submissions for heritage permit applications.”

CARRIED

9. Date of next meeting

Thursday, August 29, 2019

10. Motion to Adjourn

The meeting adjourned at 6:23pm

Committee Members should advise Chloe Richer (905-688-5601 ext. 1710) or cricher@stcatharines.ca if they are unable to attend the meeting or did not receive the item(s) noted in the agenda.