

St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee

Minutes

Thursday, May 23, 2019

Burgoyne Woods Room at 4:30pm

Attendance:

Dr John Bacher
Dr David Bergen (Left at 6:06pm)
Peter Connolly
Brian Narhi
Edward Smith

Regrets:

Robin McPherson

Council:

Councillor Carlos Garcia

Staff Liaisons:

Chloe Richer, Heritage Planner, Planning and Building Services
Mallory Smith, Student Planner, Planning and Building Services

Public

David and Agapi Robinson, re: 93 Dalhousie Avenue
Pooja Pershad and Lou Marcantonio, re: 28 Graham Avenue
Chris Essig, re: 147 Dalhousie Avenue
Kerry Howe, re: 166 Dalhousie Avenue

1. Call meeting to order (Chair)

Brian Narhi called the meeting to order at 4:33pm

2. Additions/Deletions to the Agenda

n/a

3. Motion to approve the agenda

Moved by: Peter Connolly

“That the Agenda for the meeting of May 23, 2019, be approved.”

CARRIED

4. Motion to adopt the minutes of the previous meeting

Moved by: Edward Smith

“That the Minutes from the SCHPAC meeting of April 25, 2019, be approved.”

CARRIED

5. Presentations (invited guests)

- 5.1** Michael Otter, Design & Construction Engineer
City of St. Catharines
23 Brock Street (Port Dalhousie HCD)
Proposal to replace the existing barrier-free ramp at the Port Dalhousie Library.

6. Business arising from the minutes

None

CARRIED

7. Business

- 7.1** 23 Brock Street (Port Dalhousie HCD)
Owner(s): City of St. Catharines
Agent(s): Michael Otter, Design & Construction Engineer
File No.: N/A

Proposal to replace the existing barrier-free ramp at the Port Dalhousie Library. Michael Otter, Design & Construction Engineer, presented two options for a barrier-free ramp. The first option included a railing around the ramp and the second option did not include a railing; rather, it included a hand railing attached to the building. The Committee supported both options with a preference for Option 2.

Moved by: David Bergen

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee support both options for the replacement of the existing barrier-free ramp at the Port Dalhousie Library, 23 Brock Street, with a preference for Option 2.”

CARRIED

- 7.2** 93 Dalhousie Avenue (Port Dalhousie HCD)
Owner(s): David and Agapi Robinson
Agent(s): N/A
File No.: 19 104372 HERT

Proposal to demolish the existing garage and replace it with a steel two-car (tandem) garage. The Committee, upon inspection of the garage, found wood rot and structure concerns with the garage leaning towards the adjacent property. The Committee found that the design and historical value of the structure is low. The Committee would like to see the new garage painted a darker colour to be more compatible with the existing house.

Moved by: Peter Connolly

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee recommend approval of the Heritage Permit application for the demolition of the existing garage and the construction of a steel two-car (tandem) garage, to be located at the rear of 93 Dalhousie Avenue, conditional upon:

- That the new garage structure be painted a darker colour compatible with the brick dwelling.”

CARRIED

- 7.3** 28 Graham Avenue (Port Dalhousie HCD)
Owner(s): Pooja and Neeraj Pershad
Agent(s): 2M Architects
File No.:

Proposal for a replacement 2-storey home (new design from previously approved application). The Committee discussed their concerns regarding the change from a two-door garage, to a two-car garage with a single large, horizontal opening. It was noted that there are currently not any

single-door two-car garages in the District. The Committee noted a two-door garage would fit in better with the neighbourhood.

Moved by: David Bergen

“That the Heritage Permit application for a new dwelling at 28 Graham Avenue be approved, conditional upon the following revision:

- A two-door garage.”

CARRIED

7.4 5 Lock Street (Port Dalhousie HCD)
Owner(s): 1855827 Ont. Inc. (Alejandra Lopez)
Agent(s): N/A
File No.: 19 1052246 HT

Proposal for two new commercial signs, live edge pine (Sign #1 – 2’x6’ and Sign #2 – 2’x4’). The Committee did not have any concerns, as the signs are constructed of wood and are of modest design, and can be removed in the future.

Moved by: Edward Smith

“That the Heritage Permit application for two commercial signs at 5 Lock Street be approved.”

CARRIED

7.5 18 Salina Street (Yates Street and Area HCD)
Owner(s): Ella Mielke
Agent(s): Joe Mielke
File No.: 19 105249 HT

Proposal for a 2-level deck located at the rear of the building. The Committee noted the footprint of the deck remains the same as the previously-approved addition and the proposed location is at the rear of the building. The Committee found that the proposed deck is not intrusive.

Moved by: John Bacher

“That the Heritage Permit application for a two-storey balcony, to be located at the rear of 18 Salina Street, be approved.”

CARRIED

- 7.6** 147 Dalhousie Avenue (Port Dalhousie HCD)
Owner(s): Chris Essig/Sarah Essig
Agent(s): N/A
File No.: 19 105227 HT

Proposal to enclose the front portion of the existing front porch. The Committee noted that enclosing the front porch would have no significant impact on the appearance of the home or the streetscape.

Moved by: John Bacher

“That the Heritage Permit application for an addition to 147 Dalhousie Avenue, in the form of enclosing a portion of the existing front porch, be approved.”

CARRIED

- 7.7** 166 Dalhousie Avenue (Port Dalhousie HCD)
Owner(s): Alice Hart/Margaret Hillier
Agent(s): Kerry Howe
File No.: 19 105301 HT

Proposal to demolish the existing residential dwelling.

The Committee were concerned that none of the members were able to attend the site visit scheduled by Heritage Planning staff on Tuesday, May 21, 2019. The Committee noted concerns regarding the loss of a modest, vernacular style home that is associated with the working-class history of Port Dalhousie. The Committee discussed whether a renovation of the existing structure would be of interest to the applicant rather than a full demolition. A second site visit is to be scheduled.

Moved by: Edward Smith

“That the Heritage Permit application for the demolition of the existing dwelling at 166 Dalhousie Avenue be deferred pending a site visit and a Special Meeting be scheduled for Tuesday, May 28th at 4:30 pm.”

CARRIED

8. Information/Correspondence

- Supporting information for 23 Brock Street.
- Supporting information for 93 Dalhousie Avenue (provided with April 2018 meeting package).
- Supporting information for 28 Graham Avenue.
- Supporting information for 5 Lock Street.
- Supporting information for 18 Salina Street.
- Supporting information for 147 Dalhousie Avenue.
- Supporting information for 166 Dalhousie Avenue.
- Letter from Linda Krause.

9. Date of next meeting

Special meeting regarding 166 Dalhousie Avenue: Tuesday, May 28, 2019

Thursday, June 27, 2019

10. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 6:17 pm

Committee Members should advise Chloe Richer (905-688-5601 ext. 1710) or cricher@stcatharines.ca if they are unable to attend the meeting or did not receive the item(s) noted in the agenda.