

St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee

Minutes

Thursday, April 25, 2019

Burgoyne Woods Room at 4:30pm

Attendance:

Dr. John Bacher
Dr. David Bergen
Peter Connolly
Brian Narhi

Absent:

Robin McPherson

Regrets:

Edward Smith

Council:

Councillor Carlos Garcia

Staff Liaisons:

Chloe Richer, Heritage Planner, Planning and Building Services
Vincent Wen, Student Planner, Planning and Building Services

Public:

Larisa Brodsky and John Davies, re: 77 Dalhousie Avenue
David Robinson, re: 93 Dalhousie Avenue
Mr. Thomas A. Richardson, C.S., Tim Sinke, Mrs. Sinke, Jake Sinke and Mr. Hank Huitema, M.Eng., P.Eng., re: 7 Shelley Avenue

1. Call meeting to order (Chair)

Brian Narhi called the meeting to order at 4:33pm

2. Additions/Deletions to the Agenda

n/a

3. **Motion to approve the agenda**

Moved by: Peter Connolly

“That the Agenda for the meeting of April 25, 2019, be approved.”

CARRIED

4. **Motion to adopt the minutes of the previous meeting**

Moved by: David Bergen

“That the Minutes from the SChPAC meeting of March 28, 2019, be approved as amended.”

CARRIED

5. **Presentations (invited guests)**

Mr. Thomas A. Richardson, C.S., re: 7 Shelley Avenue

6. **Business arising from the minutes**

None

CARRIED

7. **Business**

7.1 77 Dalhousie Avenue (Port Dalhousie Heritage Conservation District)

Owners: R. McLean

Agent: Larisa Brodsky Architect

File No.: 18 113823 HERT

Application has been made for a proposal of a two-storey dwelling with an undeveloped attic. The Committee deferred the application during the SChPAC meeting of October 25, 2018 due to the concerns about the dwelling's height, in accordance to the Port Dalhousie Heritage Conservation District Guidelines.

The Committee expressed concerns about the exterior wall materials. Stone veneer cladding should be used sparingly, as per the Guidelines.

One Committee member suggested clapboard be the primary material used on the exterior of the dwelling, with some masonry.

Moved by: David Bergen

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee approve the Heritage Permit application in principle for the construction of a new dwelling at 77 Dalhousie Avenue, provided:

- The railing be redesigned with compatible materials, rather than a significant amount of glazing;
- Compatible wall materials be used, such as clapboard, with two feet of masonry at the base.”

CARRIED

7.2 93 Dalhousie Avenue (Port Dalhousie Heritage Conservation District)

Owners: David and Agapi Robinson

Agent: n/a

File No.: 19 104372 HERT

Application has been made to demolish the existing garage and replace it with a steel two-car (tandem) garage. The applicant advised that the existing garage is in an unstable condition with a dirt floor. The applicant indicated that the proposed garage will be assembled in the natural silver steel colour, however, he intends on painting it at a later date. There is an existing 7-foot-high hedge on the east and south elevations of the property, which help hide the view of the proposed garage. Additionally, the applicant intends to construct a wooden fence on the west elevation of the property to further conceal the proposed garage.

Moved by: Peter Connolly

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee approve the Heritage Permit application in principle for the demolition of the existing garage and the construction of a steel two-car (tandem) garage to be located at the rear of 93 Dalhousie Avenue, conditional upon:

- A committee site inspection;
- That the garage structure be painted a darker colour compatible with the brick dwelling.”

CARRIED

7.3 7 Shelley Avenue (Port Dalhousie Heritage Conservation District)
Owner: Up21 Enterprises Inc.
Agent: Jake Sinke
File No.: 10.64.144 I7

Application has been made to demolish the existing detached dwelling located at 7 Shelley Avenue. The Committee was not in favor of approving demolition at the February 4, 2019 SChPAC meeting. The applicant returned to the SChPAC with a revised Building Inspection Report noting that the inspection involved both the exterior and interior of the dwelling.

Committee members noted that the deficiencies listed in the Report are not uncommon for a century year old home and that there are methods to reinforce the structure to meet contemporary building standards. Furthermore, the Committee noted that the majority of the home is untouched, making it one of the oldest original cottages in the district.

The Committee encouraged the applicant to submit alternatives to demolition, as is encouraged in the Port Dalhousie Heritage Conservation District Guidelines.

Moved by: David Bergen

“The SChPAC has received the revised conditional assessment dated November 2, 2018, for consideration.”

CARRIED

“That the SChPAC stands by their motion from February 4, 2019:
‘That the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee would consider subordinate, sympathetic, and appropriate additions to the existing dwelling at 7 Shelley Avenue.’”

CARRIED

8. Information/Correspondence

- Supporting information for 77 Dalhousie Avenue (revised submission)
- Supporting information for 93 Dalhousie Avenue
- Supporting information for 7 Shelley Avenue (revised submission)

9. **Date of next meeting**

Thursday, May 23, 2019 (changed from May 30, 2019, due to a conflict with the 2019 Ontario Heritage Conference).

10. **Adjournment**

The meeting adjourned at 5:49pm

Committee Members should advise Chloe Richer (905-688-5601 ext. 1710) or cricher@stcatharines.ca if they are unable to attend the meeting or did not receive the item(s) noted in the agenda.