

# St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee

## **Joint meeting of the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee (SCHPAC) and the St. Catharines Heritage Advisory Committee (SCHAC)**

### **Minutes**

**Thursday, February 28, 2019**

**Burgoyne Woods Room at 4:30pm**

#### **Attendance:**

Dr. John Bacher (SCHPAC)  
Peter Connolly (SCHPAC)  
John Crawley (SCHAC)  
Dennis Gannon (SCHAC)  
Robin McPherson (SCHAC and SCHPAC)  
Brian Narhi (SCHAC and SCHPAC)  
Edward Smith (SCHPAC)  
Mike Sullivan (SCHAC)  
Holly Washuta (SCHAC)

#### **Regrets:**

Gail Benjafield (SCHAC)  
Marty Mako (SCHAC)

#### **Absent:**

Dr. David Bergen (SCHPAC)

#### **Staff Liaisons:**

Tami Kitay, Director, Planning and Building Services  
Amanda Knutson, Senior Planner, Planning and Building Services  
Chloe Richer, Heritage Planner, Planning and Building Services  
Vincent Wen, Student Planner, Planning and Building Services

#### **Public:**

Mr. Donald Loucks, Metropolitan Design Ltd., re: 17 Welland Avenue

---

1. **Call meeting to order (Chair)**

Brian Narhi called the meeting to order at 4:34pm

2. **Additions/Deletions to the Agenda**

n/a

3. **Motion to approve the agenda**

Moved by: John Crawley

“That the SChPAC and the SCHAC ratify and adopt the Agenda for this joint SChPAC and SCHAC meeting held on February 28, 2019, copies having been previously distributed.”

**CARRIED**

4. **Motion to adopt the minutes of the previous meeting**

Moved by: John Bacher

“That the SChPAC ratify and adopt the Minutes of the SChPAC meeting held on January 31, 2019, copies having previously been distributed.”

Moved by: Robin McPherson

“That the SChPAC ratify and adopt the Minutes from the SChPAC meeting held on February 4, 2019, copies having previously been distributed.”

**CARRIED**

5. **Presentations (invited guests)**

Mr. Donald Loucks, Metropolitan Design Ltd. (Heritage Consultant), Regarding Item 7.1

6. **Business arising from the minutes**

The Committee expressed their appreciation regarding Frank Caplan's many years of contributions as the Committee's former chair. Frank recently passed away at the age of 82. A condolences card was available for signature following the meeting.

**CARRIED**

## **7. Business**

- 7.1** 17 Welland Avenue (Queen Street Heritage Conservation District)  
Owner: AAM Welland Inc.  
Agent: WND Associates  
File No.: 60.35.1046

Application has been made for a Zoning By-law Amendment to facilitate the proposed redevelopment of the former Memorial Public School site for residential use. The proposal consists of a 6-storey, 93-unit apartment building and 53 townhouse dwellings.

Donald Loucks, Metropolitan Design Ltd., provided an overview of findings from the Heritage Impact Assessment, including information on the history of the former school, which was constructed in 1919 with later additions, and its cultural heritage value or interest. The school structure is located within the Queen Street Heritage Conservation District, a mature residential area with a very rich surrounding streetscape. The school structure provides an important termination of views north along Queen Street as identified in the Queen Street Heritage Conservation District Study Background Report. In 2016, due to declining enrollment at Memorial Public School, the building was sold and closed.

The proposed redevelopment would maintain the existing front façade of the school and would include a 6-storey apartment building to the rear. Townhomes are proposed to be located to the rear of the lot with the addition of a private road. The demolition of a large portion of the school structure is proposed to support the redevelopment. The small portion of the original structure to be retained would be used as common space. The apartment building is proposed to be set back four to five metres from the base. The objective of the redevelopment as stated by Donald is to promote residential intensification while respecting the character of neighbourhood. Additionally, the redevelopment would preserve elements of the Arts and Crafts design philosophy.

Committee members expressed concerns regarding the potential loss of any memorial plaques and/or scrolls that had been located in building. It was reported that the District School Board of Niagara (DSBN) has

preserved significant item(s). A commemorative plaque at the front of the building was suggested.

In addition, Committee members were in favor of replacing the existing aluminum front door with a wood door. Committee members wanted to ensure that any architectural materials of value be preserved during construction.

One Committee member stated that they would not support approval of the redevelopment due to the significant amount of glass and aluminum proposed as construction materials, and that the proportion of these materials should not be considered as compatible with the existing heritage structure. Other concerns included the height of the proposed apartment building and the significant portion of the school proposed for demolition.

Moved by: Peter Connolly

“That St. Catharines Heritage Advisory Committee and the St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee support the redevelopment of the former Memorial Public School at 17 Welland Avenue and the related application for zoning by-law amendment. The Committees request alternative mitigation measures be explored that incorporate more of the original building, given the unique design and layout of the floor plan, including the central auditorium and direct access to the exterior from each of the eight classrooms. The Committees also request that should a scroll still exist, it be incorporated into the design of the building and/or site as a commemorative element. The Committees suggest that the design of the new building should include architectural features that tie into the Arts and Crafts style of the school building.”

SCHAC: 4 members in favor of, 2 against

SCHPAC: 5 members in favor of, 1 against

**CARRIED**

John Bacher left the meeting at 5:30pm.

**7.2** 106 Dalhousie Avenue (Port Dalhousie Heritage District)  
HERITAGE PERMIT  
Owner: Lawrence and Mary Groff  
Agent: Dan Keith  
File No.: 10.64.144R6

Application has been made for a change in the scope of work with revised plans for the dwelling. A change in the approved plans occurred as an interior wall had rotted and was replaced with new timber.

Moved by: Peter Connolly

“That the SChPAC approve the revised Heritage Permit application for a proposed new dwelling at 106 Dalhousie Avenue.”

**CARRIED**

John Bacher returned to the meeting at 5:55pm.

**7.3** 63 Christie Street  
HERITAGE PERMIT  
Owners: James Reidy and Aliya Turner  
Agent(s): MacDonald Zuberec Ensslen Architects  
File No.: 19 101750 00 HERT

Application has been made for proposed changes to the second storey of the existing building, including the removal of dormer windows, an addition for a new entryway, and a simplification of the roofline.

The dwelling was constructed circa the 1950s, with a major addition and renovation in 2006/2007 that included the enclosure of the front porch, a second floor addition, and a double bay attached garage.

The proposed work includes removing the dormers on the north side (lake side) and extending the gable roof to provide 8' ceilings on the second floor. The shed dormer on the south side will be maintained. In addition, a 125 square foot addition will be constructed for a centralized staircase and entrance to the left of the garage. The roof will be reconstructed over the 2006/2007 garage addition for simplified mono-slopes with transom windows for daylight harvesting. The triple-bay windows will be removed and replaced with singles, that will align with the ground and second floor windows.

Moved by: Edward Smith

“That the SChPAC approve the Heritage Permit application for the proposed alterations to 63 Christie Street, in accordance to the submitted architectural drawings.”

**CARRIED**

**7.4** 86 Bayview Drive (Port Dalhousie Heritage District)  
HERITAGE PERMIT  
Owners: Pat and Michele Bowman  
File No: 19 101748 HERT

Application has been made for the proposed addition of an attached single car garage to the existing dwelling.

Moved by: John Bacher

“That the Heritage Permit application for the proposed addition of a single car garage at 86 Bayview Drive be approved.”

**CARRIED**

**8. Information/Correspondence**

- Supporting information for 17 Welland Avenue can be found online at [stcatharines.ca/development](http://stcatharines.ca/development) (for both SChPAC and SCHAC)
- Hard copies of supporting information for SChPAC only for:
  - 106 Dalhousie Avenue
  - 63 Christie Street
  - 86 Bayview Drive

**9. Date of next meeting**

Thursday, March 28, 2019

**10. Adjournment**

The meeting adjourned at 6:23pm

Committee Members should advise Chloe Richer (905-688-5601 ext. 1710) or [cricher@stcatharines.ca](mailto:cricher@stcatharines.ca) if they are unable to attend the meeting or did not receive the item(s) noted in the agenda.