
Memorandum

To: Budget Standing Committee

cc: S. Chemnitz; D. Oakes; K. Douglas; M. Kreuk

From: Dan Dillon, P.Eng. – Director-TES

Date: November 28, 2018

Subject: Facer Street EA

At its meeting of March 26th, Council passed the following motion:

“That Council direct staff to prepare a report on the costs and terms of an Environmental Assessment for Facer Street which would implement the Community Vision in the 8-80 Cities Study with an emphasis on a European Design for the street as approved as Council’s vision for the street at the Council Meeting of July 10, 2017, and the other 21 recommendations in the 8-80 Cities Study which was received by Council.”

Background

At its meeting of January 12, 2017, the Budget Standing Committee received a memo (attached as Appendix 1) from the Director of TES regarding the potential revitalization/reconstruction of Facer Street.

In that previous memo, the approximate costs and general terms of reference for an Environmental Assessment (EA) were outlined. As indicated in the earlier memo, an EA process would entail consultation with various regulatory agencies, stakeholders and members of the public in order to:

- identify and define the problem,
- consider and evaluate alternatives, and
- identify ways to reduce any potentially unfavorable outcomes

Input from this consultation process would assist staff in weighing the many factors involved with the project and helping to identify the best solution.

The preliminary estimated cost for an EA for Facer St is approximately \$100,000. At its meeting of March 5, 2018, Council considered, as part of the deliberations for the 2018

Capital Budget, including an amount of \$100,000 for an EA for Facer Street, however that motion was lost.

Report

In 2017, the City engaged the services of 880 Cities to prepare a Community Engagement Report on “The Future of Facer Street”. This report was presented to Council at its meeting of July 10, 2017. As a result of this community engagement process, a list of 21 recommendations was prepared, broken into short, medium and long-term improvements that may be led by either the City or the Community. This list of improvements was also characterized in terms of general cost and impact. Staff have expanded upon the list (refer to Appendix 2) to further approximate costs (where known) and provide additional comments.

While many of the longer term improvements (such as some types of entrance features, cross-walk upgrades, lighting upgrades, curb bulb-outs and street and/or sidewalk pavers) would be better considered as part of a larger reconstruction project which would initially require an EA to scope the final design, there are many other initiatives or improvements that could be undertaken more quickly and perhaps still have significant impact.

As an example, in 2018, staff worked with the Facer Street community representatives to supply and install historic street name signs along portions of Facer Street. As part of their Draft 2019 Work Plan, the Economic, Development & Tourism Services Department has indicated their intent to work with the Facer Street community representatives to install banners along Facer Street. Other opportunities exist in working with the community to install improved seating, garbage receptacles, planters, etc. An opportunity may exist in working with the Green Committee to install a “Welcome to Facer Street District” entrance sign, similar to the “Welcome to ...” flower beds and signs that have been installed in the Merritton, Western Hill and Glen Ridge areas over the years.

As indicated in the January 12, 2017 memo, from a purely pavement or asset management perspective, the recommended approach would be to resurface Facer Street at the appropriate time, perhaps within the next five years. There is no other underground sewer or watermain work required at this time that would accelerate the need to reconstruct Facer Street.

If there is a desire to reconstruct Facer Street in order to improve the aesthetics and provide other streetscape enhancements, it should be noted that the actual construction timing would be pushed off well beyond the next five years in order to maximize the residual life of the road. The need for an EA would be premature at this time and, as such, the Draft 2019 Operating and Capital Budgets do not have an allocation for an EA for Facer Street.



Memorandum

To: Budget Standing Committee

cc: D. Carnegie; B. Shynal; S. Chemnitz; K. Douglas; M. Kreuk

From: Dan Dillon, P.Eng. – Director-TES

Date: January 6, 2017

Subject: December 19, 2016 – Council Agenda – Item 9.1 - Facer Street Revitalization and Reconstruction Motion Referral

At its meeting of December 19, 2016, City Council referred the following motion to the City Budget Standing Committee for consideration at its first meeting in January 2017:

Facer Street Revitalization and Reconstruction

Councillor Britton will present the following motion:

WHEREAS a sustainable community is one that respects and embraces its heritage to create a sense of identity and pride; and

WHEREAS Policy 4.1 of the Official Plan recognizes that Urban Design principles should be based on sustainable design principles including:

- To help create a strong sense of identity and place*
- To be stimulating, have an attractive and safe public realm, be a compact, walkable, bikeable and a well-connected community*
- To consist of mixed use nodes and corridors*
- To have complete streets of all users*
- To have building design to support street life; and*

WHEREAS within the Facer Street area there has been a renewed interest in improving the street and overall businesses as evidenced by the successful Facer Street European Festival held in August of 2016; and

WHEREAS it is important to seek the public's view on the ultimate vision of how Facer Street should look aesthetically and function practically at the street predesign stage;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the City commit \$60,000 from the Civic Project Fund towards seeking public input and develop the City's vision and

design phase of the Facer Street revitalization and reconstruction by the end of the first quarter of 2017.

During discussion of the motion, Council also asked for additional information on the following items:

- Confirmation of expected costs of the consultant
- Alternative funding sources
- Indication of what work would have to be postponed if staff were to complete this study in-house.

Background

Road Condition and Rehabilitation Options/Costs

In our Pavement Management System, Facer Street is currently split into two sections:

- Facer Street: Niagara Street – Augusta Avenue – Current Pavement Condition Rating (PCR) - 56
- Facer Street: Augusta Avenue – Grantham Avenue – Current PCR - 67

Both sections of Facer Street are composed of asphalt on a concrete base and are at or nearing the trigger points where we would recommend resurfacing the street. Given our current level of funding and the condition of other streets throughout the City, the section from Niagara Street to Augusta Avenue would come up for resurfacing within the next couple of years with the section from Augusta Avenue to Grantham Avenue within the next five years. Both sections were last resurfaced in 2005.

Standard resurfacing would include undertaking spot curb repairs, milling and resurfacing the roadway with 50mm of asphalt. At the same time, we would undertake spot sidewalk repairs as required. Road reconstruction would involve the complete removal and replacement of the existing road base, including curbs and sidewalks and repaving the road.

Attached as Appendix 1 is a summary table providing the estimated costs for various rehabilitation strategies, from resurfacing to standard asphalt road reconstruction, concrete road reconstruction, coloured concrete and stamped coloured concrete road reconstruction. Also included as part of that table is the relative cost difference compared to a road resurfacing or standard road reconstruction. While reconstruction with coloured and/or stamped concrete would not normally be considered for the entire length of a road, these options were presented to reflect the premium associated with any enhancements to the aesthetics of the road driving surface.

Streetscaping Enhancements/Costs

Any streetscaping enhancements would be in addition to these costs and are difficult to price as they are very much dependent upon what is being proposed. Enhancements could include wider sidewalks, decorative coloured concrete edging along sidewalks, landscape planters, overhead arches/signs, etc.

Streetlighting Costs

Along the entire length of Facer Street, there are 32 existing hydro poles with cobra head streetlights on them. As part of our LED streetlight conversion project, these lights are being replaced at a cost of approximately \$9,000. If there is a desire for a more decorative street lights along Facer Street (similar to the lights along St Paul Street as an example), the costs would be significantly greater. Decorative street lights are typically installed at a lower height which would involve the installation of new poles (and wiring), on both sides of the street, spaced more closely together. The poles and fixtures themselves are also much more expensive. A very rough estimate to provide decorative streetlighting along the entire length of Facer Street would be approximately \$1.5 Million. This could vary significantly depending upon the type and style of streetlight pole and fixture selected.

Property Acquisition/Utility Relocation Costs

These costs do not include any allowance for property acquisitions or utility relocations, or burying overhead utilities underground. The existing road allowance width along Facer Street varies and is quite narrow for a road that functions as a collector street. If Facer Street is reconstructed and if there is a desire to include other amenities (wider sidewalks, wider boulevards, bike lanes, etc) there may be a need for property acquisitions throughout which are difficult to quantify at this point.

Horizon Utilities is undertaking the replacement of much of their pole and overhead wiring infrastructure in this area this year. Staff have had preliminary discussions with Horizon and the other utilities to determine the cost to bury their overhead wiring – the additional cost to the City for burying the existing overhead wires would be approximately \$2.0 Million.

Construction Timing

As indicated earlier, the road condition on Facer Street is at a point where our Pavement Management System is recommending resurfacing the road within the next 1-5 years. From a purely pavement or asset management perspective, the recommended approach would be to resurface the road at the appropriate time. There are no other underground sewer or watermain works required at this time that would accelerate the need to reconstruct Facer Street.

If there is a desire to reconstruct Facer Street in order to improve the aesthetics and provide other streetscape enhancements, it should be noted that, along with the additional construction costs outlined above, the actual construction timing would be pushed off well beyond the next five years in order to maximize the residual life of the road.

Project Design/Consultant Costs

A road reconstruction project would typically follow the requirements set out in the Municipal Class Environmental Assessment process. As part of this process and

depending upon the nature of the project, consultation would be undertaken with various regulatory agencies, stakeholders and members of the public in order to:

- identify and define the problem,
- consider and evaluate alternatives, and
- identify ways to reduce any potentially unfavorable outcomes

Input from the consultation process would assist staff in weighing the many factors involved with the project and helping to identify the best solution.

The deliverables that would normally be associated with such a design assignment would include a full set of detailed (tender ready) plans and specifications along with an updated cost estimate. Several preliminary concept designs and cost estimates may also be presented throughout the evaluation process. The cost associated with this type of design assignment would typically be approximately 5-7% of the value of the project – assuming a standard asphalt road reconstruction cost of \$1.5 Million, staff would expect the design costs for this project to be approximately \$75-100,000, perhaps higher if additional aesthetic or streetscaping initiatives are being investigated.

The proposed motion refers to the desire to “... *seek the public’s view on the ultimate vision of how Facer Street should look aesthetically and function practically at the street predesign stage*” and to “...*develop the City’s vision and design phase of the Facer Street revitalization and reconstruction*”. If the deliverables expected from such a study are comparable to those described above, then the cost estimates indicated above would also be reflective of that.

If the intent of the study is meant to be more of a visioning exercise, then the cost may be somewhat less. As an example, in 2012-2013, the Region of Niagara undertook a Complete Streets Visioning Exercise that looked at complete streets concepts in general and considered a section of Queenston Street from Frank Street to just east of Woodburn Avenue as a pilot project. A link to the final study is included below:

<http://www.niagararegion.ca/living/icp/complete-streets/PDF/complete-streets-visualization.pdf>

The resulting visualizations provided some general concepts of what the street could look like at certain selected locations, however it did not provide an overall plan or cost estimates. The cost for this study, which was completed with the assistance of a consultant, was approximately \$25,000 with the visualization costs being approximately \$5,000-10,000.

Alternative Funding Sources

The proposed motion suggests that funding for the design phase of the Facer Street revitalization and reconstruction would come from the Civic Project Fund. Designs for future road reconstruction projects would typically be funded from the Road and Drainage Improvement Program component of the Capital Budget.

Implications of Completing Study with In-House Staff

Staff are currently working on several road reconstruction projects that were approved as part of previous budgets. These include works on:

Project #	Street	From	To	Status
P13-062	St Paul St	James St	Carlisle St	Design – Construction – 2017
P13-062	Carlisle St	St Paul St	McGuire St	Design – Construction – 2017
P13-066	Queenston St	Page St	Eastchester Ave	Design – Construction – 2017
P14-067	Lorne St	Queenston St	Eastchester Ave	Design – Construction – 2017
P15-065	Lowell Ave	Thomas St	Lake St	Design – Construction – 2017
P15-066	Moffatt St	N. Limit	S. Limit	Design – Construction – 2018
P15-067	Third St Louth	Fourth Ave	Lakeshore Rd	Design – Construction – 2018
P16-062	Churchill St	Chetwood St	Rykert St	Design – Construction – 2018
P16-063	St George St	Facer St	Dieppe Rd	Design – Construction – 2018
P16-064	Ridgewood Rd	Highland Ave	Riverdale Ave	Design – Construction – 2018
P16-065	Church St	King St	Niagara St	Design – Construction – 2018
P16-065	Geneva St	Church St	St Paul St	Design – Construction – 2018
P16-065	Niagara St	Geneva St	Church St	Design – Construction – 2018
P16-065	St Paul St	Court St	Geneva St	Design – Construction – 2018
P16-065	Queenston St	Geneva St	Riordon St	Design – Construction – 2018

These road reconstruction projects are in various stages of preliminary or detailed design with construction anticipated in 2017 or 2018 as noted. All of the above noted projects are being undertaken with the assistance of consultants, however they still occupy a significant component of staff's time in managing the project. These projects do not include any proposed 2017 budgeted works.

There is not the internal staffing capacity in TES to undertake and complete an in-house predesign study of Facer Street by the end of the first quarter of 2017 without further delaying many existing projects. The visioning aspect of any study would also include the involvement of staff from PBS. Given the request to have this study completed by the first quarter of 2017, work on either the Port Dalhousie Secondary Plan or the Infill and Intensification Study would be delayed.

Conclusion

The motion regarding the Facer Street Revitalization and Reconstruction that has been referred to the Budget Standing Committee is asking *“that the City commit \$60,000 from the Civic Project Fund towards seeking public input and develop the City’s vision and design phase of the Facer Street revitalization and reconstruction by the end of the first quarter of 2017.”*

Implied as part of the motion is that Facer Street be reconstructed. From a purely pavement or asset management perspective, the recommended approach would be to resurface the road at the appropriate time (within the next 1-5 years). If there is a desire

to instead reconstruct Facer Street, the construction costs would be significantly higher and the construction timeframe would extend well beyond the next five years.

If Facer Street is to be reconstructed for the purposes of improving the aesthetics and providing other streetscape enhancements, then a visioning or predesign exercise would be beneficial in better defining the scope of the work prior to proceeding with detailed design. Staff would suggest that this work be prioritized with other existing and proposed works to better align with the anticipated construction timeframe.

Facer Street
Preliminary Road Costs - 2016 Budget Estimate Costs

Rehabilitation Strategy	Section		Total	% Premium vs Resurfacing	% Premium vs Asphalt Road Reconstruction
	Niagara St - Augusta Ave	Augusta Ave - Grantham Ave			
Spot curb and sidewalk repairs, asphalt milling and resurfacing	\$236,000	\$150,000	\$386,000	N/A	N/A
Asphalt Road reconstruction including replacement of all sidewalks	\$961,000	\$611,000	\$1,572,000	407%	N/A
Concrete Road reconstruction including replacement of all sidewalks	\$1,410,000	\$896,000	\$2,306,000	597%	147%
Coloured Concrete Road reconstruction including replacement of all sidewalks	\$1,662,000	\$1,056,000	\$2,718,000	704%	173%
Coloured Stamped Concrete Road reconstruction including replacement of all sidewalks	\$2,090,000	\$1,328,000	\$3,418,000	885%	217%

APPENDIX 2

Facer St Area

Preliminary Costing for Various Initiatives

Source: *The Future of Facer Street - Recommendations Report - June 2017 - Page 35*

Prepared by: 8-80 Cities

Improvement	Timeline	Cost		Impact	Project Lead	Comments
Banners	Short-term	\$\$	+/- \$120/ea	Medium	Community	Banner only - Based on DTA costs
Murals	Short-term	\$	Unknown	Medium	Community	Community/business based initiative
Vinyl Wraps	Short-term	\$	Unknown	Low	Community	Community/business based initiative
Hanging Planters	Short-term	\$-\$	+/- \$250/ea	Medium	Community	City? - Current cost/hanging basket - also consider option thru Green Committee
Seating	Short-term	\$-\$	+/- \$2,200-\$3,500 ea	Medium	City	Proposed 2019 Rates for Memorial Benches
Garbage Cans	Short-term	\$	Nominal	Medium	City	Nominal cost for regular cans - perhaps investigate more decorative installation such as in Port Dalhousie?
Holiday Celebrations	Short-term	\$	Unknown	High	Community	Community/business based initiative
Summer Markets	Short-term	\$	Unknown	Medium	Community	Community/business based initiative
Patios	Short-term	\$-\$	Unknown	Medium	Community	Community/business based initiative
Entrance Feature	Medium-term	\$-\$-\$	+/- \$10,000 to \$100,000-\$250,000 (*)	Medium	City	Could range from "Welcome to Facer District" sign/planting to an archway across the road
Historical Plaques	Medium-term	\$-\$	+/- \$1000/ea	Low	Community	Cost could vary depending upon complexity
Sidewalk Plaques or Medallions	Medium-term	\$	+/- \$1000/ea	Low	Community	Cost could vary depending upon complexity
Cross walks	Medium-term	\$	*	Medium	City	As part of larger reconstruction project
Shade Trees	Medium-term	\$-\$-\$	+/- \$1,000/ea	High	City	Could do indepentantly or as part of larger reconstruction project
Lighting	Medium-term	\$	*	High	Community	Should be City Project Lead? - As part of larger reconstruction project
Facade Grant	Medium-term	\$	Unknown	Medium	City	PBS
Pop-Up Shops	Medium-term	\$	Unknown	Medium	Community	Community/business based initiative
Branding Strategy	Long-term	\$	Unknown	High	Community	Community/business based initiative
Curb bulb outs	Long-term	\$	*	High	City	As part of larger reconstruction project
Sidewalk maintenance	Long-term	\$	**	High	City	On-going maintenance
Street and sidewalk pavers	Long-term	\$	*	High	City	As part of larger reconstruction project

\$ = Up to \$10,000 \$\$ = Between \$10,000 and \$100,000

\$\$\$ = Between \$100,000 and \$1,000,000 \$\$\$\$ = \$1,000,000 and above

Identified as City project lead

* - Costs can vary significantly depending upon complexity - would be incorporated as part of a larger reconstruction project - would initially require a design Environmental Assessment (EA) to scope final design - EA Cost - +/- \$100,000

** - Costs for required sidewalk maintenance included as part of city's operating budget - will vary depending upon necessity