

---

## Memorandum

---

**To:** Budget Standing Committee

**cc:** D. Carnegie; B. Shynal; S. Chemnitz; K. Douglas; M. Kreuk

**From:** Dan Dillon, P.Eng. – Director-TES

**Date:** January 6, 2017

**Subject:** December 19, 2016 – Council Agenda – Item 9.1 - Facer Street Revitalization and Reconstruction Motion Referral

---

At its meeting of December 19, 2016, City Council referred the following motion to the City Budget Standing Committee for consideration at its first meeting in January 2017:

***Facer Street Revitalization and Reconstruction***

*Councillor Britton will present the following motion:*

*WHEREAS a sustainable community is one that respects and embraces its heritage to create a sense of identity and pride; and*

*WHEREAS Policy 4.1 of the Official Plan recognizes that Urban Design principles should be based on sustainable design principles including:*

- To help create a strong sense of identity and place*
- To be stimulating, have an attractive and safe public realm, be a compact, walkable, bikeable and a well-connected community*
- To consist of mixed use nodes and corridors*
- To have complete streets of all users*
- To have building design to support street life; and*

*WHEREAS within the Facer Street area there has been a renewed interest in improving the street and overall businesses as evidenced by the successful Facer Street European Festival held in August of 2016; and*

*WHEREAS it is important to seek the public's view on the ultimate vision of how Facer Street should look aesthetically and function practically at the street predesign stage;*

*THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the City commit \$60,000 from the Civic Project Fund towards seeking public input and develop the City's vision and*

*design phase of the Facer Street revitalization and reconstruction by the end of the first quarter of 2017.*

During discussion of the motion, Council also asked for additional information on the following items:

- Confirmation of expected costs of the consultant
- Alternative funding sources
- Indication of what work would have to be postponed if staff were to complete this study in-house.

## **Background**

### **Road Condition and Rehabilitation Options/Costs**

In our Pavement Management System, Facer Street is currently split into two sections:

- Facer Street: Niagara Street – Augusta Avenue – Current Pavement Condition Rating (PCR) - 56
- Facer Street: Augusta Avenue – Grantham Avenue – Current PCR - 67

Both sections of Facer Street are composed of asphalt on a concrete base and are at or nearing the trigger points where we would recommend resurfacing the street. Given our current level of funding and the condition of other streets throughout the City, the section from Niagara Street to Augusta Avenue would come up for resurfacing within the next couple of years with the section from Augusta Avenue to Grantham Avenue within the next five years. Both sections were last resurfaced in 2005.

Standard resurfacing would include undertaking spot curb repairs, milling and resurfacing the roadway with 50mm of asphalt. At the same time, we would undertake spot sidewalk repairs as required. Road reconstruction would involve the complete removal and replacement of the existing road base, including curbs and sidewalks and repaving the road.

Attached as Appendix 1 is a summary table providing the estimated costs for various rehabilitation strategies, from resurfacing to standard asphalt road reconstruction, concrete road reconstruction, coloured concrete and stamped coloured concrete road reconstruction. Also included as part of that table is the relative cost difference compared to a road resurfacing or standard road reconstruction. While reconstruction with coloured and/or stamped concrete would not normally be considered for the entire length of a road, these options were presented to reflect the premium associated with any enhancements to the aesthetics of the road driving surface.

### **Streetscaping Enhancements/Costs**

Any streetscaping enhancements would be in addition to these costs and are difficult to price as they are very much dependent upon what is being proposed. Enhancements could include wider sidewalks, decorative coloured concrete edging along sidewalks, landscape planters, overhead arches/signs, etc.

## **Streetlighting Costs**

Along the entire length of Facer Street, there are 32 existing hydro poles with cobra head streetlights on them. As part of our LED streetlight conversion project, these lights are being replaced at a cost of approximately \$9,000. If there is a desire for a more decorative street lights along Facer Street (similar to the lights along St Paul Street as an example), the costs would be significantly greater. Decorative street lights are typically installed at a lower height which would involve the installation of new poles (and wiring), on both sides of the street, spaced more closely together. The poles and fixtures themselves are also much more expensive. A very rough estimate to provide decorative streetlighting along the entire length of Facer Street would be approximately \$1.5 Million. This could vary significantly depending upon the type and style of streetlight pole and fixture selected.

## **Property Acquisition/Utility Relocation Costs**

These costs do not include any allowance for property acquisitions or utility relocations, or burying overhead utilities underground. The existing road allowance width along Facer Street varies and is quite narrow for a road that functions as a collector street. If Facer Street is reconstructed and if there is a desire to include other amenities (wider sidewalks, wider boulevards, bike lanes, etc) there may be a need for property acquisitions throughout which are difficult to quantify at this point.

Horizon Utilities is undertaking the replacement of much of their pole and overhead wiring infrastructure in this area this year. Staff have had preliminary discussions with Horizon and the other utilities to determine the cost to bury their overhead wiring – the additional cost to the City for burying the existing overhead wires would be approximately \$2.0 Million.

## **Construction Timing**

As indicated earlier, the road condition on Facer Street is at a point where our Pavement Management System is recommending resurfacing the road within the next 1-5 years. From a purely pavement or asset management perspective, the recommended approach would be to resurface the road at the appropriate time. There are no other underground sewer or watermain works required at this time that would accelerate the need to reconstruct Facer Street.

If there is a desire to reconstruct Facer Street in order to improve the aesthetics and provide other streetscape enhancements, it should be noted that, along with the additional construction costs outlined above, the actual construction timing would be pushed off well beyond the next five years in order to maximize the residual life of the road.

## **Project Design/Consultant Costs**

A road reconstruction project would typically follow the requirements set out in the Municipal Class Environmental Assessment process. As part of this process and

depending upon the nature of the project, consultation would be undertaken with various regulatory agencies, stakeholders and members of the public in order to:

- identify and define the problem,
- consider and evaluate alternatives, and
- identify ways to reduce any potentially unfavorable outcomes

Input from the consultation process would assist staff in weighing the many factors involved with the project and helping to identify the best solution.

The deliverables that would normally be associated with such a design assignment would include a full set of detailed (tender ready) plans and specifications along with an updated cost estimate. Several preliminary concept designs and cost estimates may also be presented throughout the evaluation process. The cost associated with this type of design assignment would typically be approximately 5-7% of the value of the project – assuming a standard asphalt road reconstruction cost of \$1.5 Million, staff would expect the design costs for this project to be approximately \$75-100,000, perhaps higher if additional aesthetic or streetscaping initiatives are being investigated.

The proposed motion refers to the desire to “... *seek the public’s view on the ultimate vision of how Facer Street should look aesthetically and function practically at the street predesign stage*” and to “...*develop the City’s vision and design phase of the Facer Street revitalization and reconstruction*”. If the deliverables expected from such a study are comparable to those described above, then the cost estimates indicated above would also be reflective of that.

If the intent of the study is meant to be more of a visioning exercise, then the cost may be somewhat less. As an example, in 2012-2013, the Region of Niagara undertook a Complete Streets Visioning Exercise that looked at complete streets concepts in general and considered a section of Queenston Street from Frank Street to just east of Woodburn Avenue as a pilot project. A link to the final study is included below:

<http://www.niagararegion.ca/living/icp/complete-streets/PDF/complete-streets-visualization.pdf>

The resulting visualizations provided some general concepts of what the street could look like at certain selected locations, however it did not provide an overall plan or cost estimates. The cost for this study, which was completed with the assistance of a consultant, was approximately \$25,000 with the visualization costs being approximately \$5,000-10,000.

## **Alternative Funding Sources**

The proposed motion suggests that funding for the design phase of the Facer Street revitalization and reconstruction would come from the Civic Project Fund. Designs for future road reconstruction projects would typically be funded from the Road and Drainage Improvement Program component of the Capital Budget.

## Implications of Completing Study with In-House Staff

Staff are currently working on several road reconstruction projects that were approved as part of previous budgets. These include works on:

Project #	Street	From	To	Status
P13-062	St Paul St	James St	Carlisle St	Design – Construction – 2017
P13-062	Carlisle St	St Paul St	McGuire St	Design – Construction – 2017
P13-066	Queenston St	Page St	Eastchester Ave	Design – Construction – 2017
P14-067	Lorne St	Queenston St	Eastchester Ave	Design – Construction – 2017
P15-065	Lowell Ave	Thomas St	Lake St	Design – Construction – 2017
P15-066	Moffatt St	N. Limit	S. Limit	Design – Construction – 2018
P15-067	Third St Louth	Fourth Ave	Lakeshore Rd	Design – Construction – 2018
P16-062	Churchill St	Chetwood St	Rykert St	Design – Construction – 2018
P16-063	St George St	Facer St	Dieppe Rd	Design – Construction – 2018
P16-064	Ridgewood Rd	Highland Ave	Riverdale Ave	Design – Construction – 2018
P16-065	Church St	King St	Niagara St	Design – Construction – 2018
P16-065	Geneva St	Church St	St Paul St	Design – Construction – 2018
P16-065	Niagara St	Geneva St	Church St	Design – Construction – 2018
P16-065	St Paul St	Court St	Geneva St	Design – Construction – 2018
P16-065	Queenston St	Geneva St	Riordon St	Design – Construction – 2018

These road reconstruction projects are in various stages of preliminary or detailed design with construction anticipated in 2017 or 2018 as noted. All of the above noted projects are being undertaken with the assistance of consultants, however they still occupy a significant component of staff's time in managing the project. These projects do not include any proposed 2017 budgeted works.

There is not the internal staffing capacity in TES to undertake and complete an in-house predesign study of Facer Street by the end of the first quarter of 2017 without further delaying many existing projects. The visioning aspect of any study would also include the involvement of staff from PBS. Given the request to have this study completed by the first quarter of 2017, work on either the Port Dalhousie Secondary Plan or the Infill and Intensification Study would be delayed.

## Conclusion

The motion regarding the Facer Street Revitalization and Reconstruction that has been referred to the Budget Standing Committee is asking *“that the City commit \$60,000 from the Civic Project Fund towards seeking public input and develop the City's vision and design phase of the Facer Street revitalization and reconstruction by the end of the first quarter of 2017.”*

Implied as part of the motion is that Facer Street be reconstructed. From a purely pavement or asset management perspective, the recommended approach would be to resurface the road at the appropriate time (within the next 1-5 years). If there is a desire

to instead reconstruct Facer Street, the construction costs would be significantly higher and the construction timeframe would extend well beyond the next five years.

If Facer Street is to be reconstructed for the purposes of improving the aesthetics and providing other streetscape enhancements, then a visioning or predesign exercise would be beneficial in better defining the scope of the work prior to proceeding with detailed design. Staff would suggest that this work be prioritized with other existing and proposed works to better align with the anticipated construction timeframe.

# Facer Street

## Preliminary Road Costs - 2016 Budget Estimate Costs

1

Rehabilitation Strategy	Section		Total	% Premium vs Resurfacing	% Premium vs Asphalt Road Reconstruction
	Niagara St - Augusta Ave	Augusta Ave - Grantham Ave			
Spot curb and sidewalk repairs, asphalt milling and resurfacing	\$236,000	\$150,000	\$386,000	N/A	N/A
Asphalt Road reconstruction including replacement of all sidewalks	\$961,000	\$611,000	\$1,572,000	407%	N/A
Concrete Road reconstruction including replacement of all sidewalks	\$1,410,000	\$896,000	\$2,306,000	597%	147%
Coloured Concrete Road reconstruction including replacement of all sidewalks	\$1,662,000	\$1,056,000	\$2,718,000	704%	173%
Coloured Stamped Concrete Road reconstruction including replacement of all sidewalks	\$2,090,000	\$1,328,000	\$3,418,000	885%	217%