



CITY OF
ST. CATHARINES

Corporate Report

Report from Transportation and Environmental Services, Director/City Engineer and
Financial Management Services, Director/City Treasurer

Date of Report: November 13, 2013 **Date of Meeting:** December 16, 2013

Report Number: TES-FMS-379-2013 **File:** 68.2.101

Subject: Asset Management - Facilities Planning

Recommendation

That Council receive the report from Transportation and Environmental Services and Financial Management Services, dated November 13, 2013, regarding Asset Management - Facilities Planning, for information purposes; and

That staff be directed to complete a Facilities Accommodation Plan, including analysis of category 3 municipal facilities; and

That staff continue the process of demolition and / or disposal of the municipal facilities highlighted in Appendix 3, subject to relevant budget approval; and

Further, that criteria for the Facilities Accommodation Plan, as outlined in this report, be approved. FORTHWITH

Summary

A facilities master plan is underway that will be integrated with the City's asset management plan in 2014. However, in order to make recommendations related to municipal facilities, staff require direction from Council on the criteria that should be used to determine which facilities the City should continue to own and operate.

Staff have completed preliminary analysis and categorized facilities based on service life, condition, and use. This analysis, with proposed criteria for the facilities accommodation plan, is the subject of this report.

Background

Staff have prepared a corporate asset management strategy for consideration by Council at the December 16, 2013 meeting. The strategy has been prepared according to guidelines from the Ontario Ministry of Infrastructure and includes mandated infrastructure categories of roads, bridges, water and wastewater systems.

While not mandated by the provincial government, facilities are a significant infrastructure category that requires specific attention by the City. Staff are preparing a facilities master plan to forecast needs now and into the future. This plan will ensure that every municipal facility continues to be safe and accessible for staff and customers. The plan will also consider other corporate plans to align facilities with business and community planning.

The City owns a total of 181 buildings that vary in age, condition and complexity. The approximate replacement value of these facilities is \$410,250,000.

Buildings have architectural, structural, mechanical, and electrical components that are built to various codes, regulations and needs of the users of that day. Deficiencies are specific to components of a building or site that have reached the end of their service life, no longer meet the requirements of new codes or regulations, or no longer meet the needs of the users. The total value of rehabilitation and replacement activities required to address deficiencies in municipal facilities is currently estimated at \$91,500,000.

The City's approach to managing facilities is based on the following objectives:

- Facilities are safe for use by staff and customers
- Facilities meet operational needs of staff and are effective for delivering programs and services to customers.
- All systems (mechanical, electrical, information technology, building automation) operate accurately and efficiently.
- Overall integrity of facilities is maintained and, wherever possible, preventative maintenance minimizes the need for costly repairs or replacements.
- All staff and customers, including people with disabilities, can navigate municipal facilities with ease.

Staff regularly inspect municipal facilities to maintain a safe operating environment and ensure that major components are operating efficiently and properly. Detailed condition assessments are carried out by qualified and professional personnel in order to identify remaining service life for the various components, overall compliance with new regulations and codes, and how the building meets the needs of our current users and staff. These assessments help staff to plan for preventative maintenance programs and create an overall Improvement / Replacement program for municipal buildings. Staff strive to regularly update assessments so the City has an accurate picture of the overall condition of its facilities. However, these assessments are subject to available funding in a given year.

Report

Staff have compiled information on current deficiencies in all municipal facilities and have an understanding of current challenges based on service life, condition and use. Facilities generally fall within one of three categories, as follows:

Category 1 facilities

Category 1 facilities are those that have a relatively long service life, meet the City's building condition standards, and are highly used by staff and the public. Generally speaking, these facilities do not have major deficiencies nor require significant expenses (relative to the replacement cost of the asset) over and above standard operating, maintenance, and major building component renewal costs. It should be noted that preventative maintenance and component renewal costs for the City's complex facilities (i.e. arenas, firehalls, City Hall, service centres, etc.) are very significant relative to the City's Annual Capital requirements. These facilities will be monitored on an ongoing basis and staff will continue to use preventative maintenance in order to minimize future costs.

A full list of category 1 facilities is included under Appendix 1.

Category 2 facilities

Category 2 facilities are buildings where staff require further information related to use. Studies and needs assessments for these facilities are either planned or underway and will be reported to Council when complete. For example, Recreation and Community Services is undertaking a review of the City's outdoor pools and preparing an update to the 2007 Recreation Facilities Master Plan. These efforts will continue in order to determine community need for category 2 facilities.

Category 2 facilities are listed under Appendix 2.

Category 3 facilities

Category 3 facilities are rated relatively low in terms of service life, building condition and use. Staff have concerns regarding the City's continued ability to own and operate all of the facilities within category 3, and feel alternative solutions will be required to maintain desired levels of service. It should be noted that the facilities highlighted on Appendix 3 have been the subject of previous reports to Council and have already been determined to be surplus to the needs of the City. Demolition and / or disposal of these facilities is subject to budget or further stakeholder engagement.

A full list of category 3 facilities is included under Appendix 3.

Staff will review category 3 facilities further and report to Council with recommendations. In order to complete this analysis, staff require direction on the criteria that will be used to guide recommendations. Proposed **decision making criteria** include:

- Overall age and condition of the building envelope
- Condition and effectiveness of critical building systems, especially life safety systems, electrical and mechanical systems
- Deficiencies in relation to replacement value
- Compliance with Facility Accessibility Design Standards (FADS)
- Heritage features
- Energy consumption
- Use and community demand, as indicated within the Recreation Facilities Master Plan

- Ease of technological improvements including building automation and other information technology infrastructure

Should Council approve this approach, staff will rate each building according to its performance against the above criteria. In each instance, staff will consider alternative solutions, including:

- Potential eligibility for federal and provincial funding programs;
- Alternative service delivery arrangements with private or not-for-profit operators;
- Repurposing for alternative uses;
- Divestment of certain facilities, including sale or demolition.

Full analysis will be provided to Council in 2014.

Financial Implications

As with the asset management strategy, the goal of facilities accommodation planning is to ensure all City-owned infrastructure assets are sustainable into the future and promote better integration of infrastructure decisions within strategic, community and land-use goals. Collecting sufficient revenue to finance infrastructure needs is a critical part of this process.

Once final recommendations are presented and approved by Council in 2014, this information will be incorporated into the City's asset management strategy and reviewed and updated alongside the other provincially mandated infrastructure of roads, bridges, water and wastewater on an annual basis, as part of capital and operating budgets.

Conclusion

Should Council approve the criteria contained within this report, staff will proceed with preparing a facilities plan and report back in 2014.

In the meantime, staff continues to investigate ways to alleviate demands associated with municipal facilities through needs analyses and innovative partnerships. Examples of current activities include:

- Preparing an update to the 2007 Recreation Facilities Master Plan;
- Developing an outdoor pools strategy;
- Working with private partners on alternative service delivery arrangements (for example, through air space rights over municipal parking lots);
- Investigating ongoing financing opportunities from other levels of government;
- Reporting through preparation of 2014 capital and operating budgets.

Prepared by:

Erin O'Hoski
Corporate Planning Officer

Approved by:

Ron Tripp
Director, Transportation & Environmental Services

Anthony Martuccio
Design and Construction Engineer

Category 1 Facilities

Asset Description	Address	Acquisition Year
6-8 Academy Street - Fire Prevention Offices	6-8 Academy Street	1989
Buchanan House	360 Niagara Street	1868
Bill Burgoyne Arena	129 Linwell Road	1973
Carlisle Street Parking Garage	71 Carlisle Street	2012
Carlisle Street Parking Garage Store Front	71 Carlisle Street	2012
Chetwood Street (West St. Catharines) Seniors Centre	117 Chetwood Street	1970
City Hall	50 Church Street	1937
Dunlop Drive Seniors Centre	80 Dunlop Drive	1966
New Fire Hall #4	427 Merritt Street	2013
Fire Hall # 5	149 Martindale Road	2001
Fire Hall # 6	463 Scott Street	1979
Kiwanis Centre - Indoor Pool and Library	360 Niagara Street	2012
Lake Street Service Centre Administrative Building	383 Lake Street	1977
Lake Street Service Centre Salt Dome/Wash Bay	383 Lake Street	2010
Lakeside Park Carousel Building	9 Main Street	1981
Meridian Centre - Spectator Facility	55 McGuire Street	2014
Merritton Arena	7 Park Avenue	1968
Merritton Community Centre	5 Park Avenue	1955
Ontario Street Parking Garage	8 Ontario Street	1981
Ontario St. Car Park Store Front	8 Ontario Street	1980
Port Weller Community Centre	1 Bogart Street	1977
Q.E. Facer Community Centre	2 Facer Street	1958
Rear Inner Range Lighthouse	83 Lighthouse Road	1898
Robertson School	85 Church Street	1829
Robertson School - Annex	85 Church Street	1829
Russell Avenue Community & Seniors Centre	69 Catherine Street, 108 Russell Avenue	1966
Seymour-Hannah Centre	240 St Paul Street West	2005
St. Catharines Municipal Golf Course Clubhouse	37 Lincoln Road	2003
St. Catharines Museum	1932 Government Road	1990
St. Catharines Public Library - Centennial Branch	54 Church Street	1976
St. Catharines Public Library - Port Dalhousie Branch	23 Brock Street	1863
St. Catharines Transit Commission	2012 First Street Louth	1975
St. Catharines Performing Arts Centre	250 St. Paul Street	2015
Alex Mackenzie Concession and Washroom	17 Beech Street	1974
Artificial Turf Field - Change room and washroom	240 St Paul Street West	2011
Burgoyne Woods Park Washroom Building	30 Edgedale Road	2001
Burgoyne Woods Park Pavilion	30 Edgedale Road	1983
Buchanan House Barn	360 Niagara Street	1975
Happy Rolph's Barn	650 Read Road	1974
Happy Rolph's Washroom	650 Read Road	1974
Jaycee Park Garage	543 Ontario Street	1995
Joe McCaffery Park Concession	61 Vansickle Road	1995
Joe McCaffery Park Washroom	61 Vansickle Road	1995
Lakeside Park Pavilion	9 Main Street	1981
Lakeside Park Snack Bar & Washrooms	9 Main Street	1981
Lancaster Park Diamond 1 Snack Bar, Press booth, Change rooms and View Stands	30 Wood Street	1977
Lancaster Park Diamond 1 - Bleachers with Storage - First Base	30 Wood Street	1977
Lancaster Park Diamond 1 - Bleachers with Storage - Third Base	30 Wood Street	1977
Lancaster Park Soccer Building - Change rooms & Washrooms	30 Wood Street	1985
Lester B. Pearson Park Washroom	360 Niagara Street	1985
Malcolmson Park - Office (Built in 1929) - Original	325 Lakeshore Road	1989
Market Square Building	91 King Street	2001
Merritton Park Grand stands	32 Seymour Avenue	1986
Merritton Park Concession Stand	32 Seymour Avenue	1986
Merritton Park Locker Room	32 Seymour Avenue	1986

Montebello Park Pavilion	64 Ontario Street	1888
Montebello Park Bandstand	64 Ontario Street	1888
Montebello Park Storage Shed & Washroom	64 Ontario Street	2005
Morningstar Mill - Sawmill	2712 Decew Road	2000
Morningstar Mill - House	2712 Decew Road	1989
Morningstar Mill - Garage	2712 Decew Road	1992
Morningstar Mill - Grist Mill	2712 Decew Road	1989
Morningstar Mill - Barn - Blacksmith/Carpentry Shop	2712 Decew Road	1989
Municipal Beach Washrooms	1 Lombardy Avenue	2000
Reality Park - Electrical Control Building - Girotti	446 Vine Street	2005
St. Paul Street Storage - Renown	70 St. Paul Crescent	1975
St. Catharines Municipal Golf Course Workshop	37 Lincoln Road	2011
St. Catharines Municipal Golf Course Washroom - Girotti - #6 Tee	37 Lincoln Road	1985
St. Catharines Municipal Golf Course Washroom - Girotti - #6 Tee	37 Lincoln Road	1985
St. Catharines Municipal Golf Course Washroom - Girotti - #3 Green	37 Lincoln Road	1985
Victoria Lawn Cemetery Service Building	480 Queenston Road	1978
Victoria Lawn Cemetery Storage Building - Garage	480 Queenston Road	1978
Victoria Lawn Cemetery Taylor Building - Storage & Office	480 Queenston Road	1985
Victoria Lawn Cemetery Carillon Tower	480 Queenston Road	1936
Victoria Lawn Cemetery Cullinen Mausoleum	480 Queenston Road	1918
Victoria Lawn Cemetery Galilee Mausoleum	480 Queenston Road	1980
Victoria Lawn Cemetery Genesis Mausoleum	480 Queenston Road	1980
Victoria Lawn Cemetery Gethsemane Mausoleum	480 Queenston Road	1980
Victoria Lawn Cemetery Holy Trinity Mausoleum	480 Queenston Road	1980
Victoria Lawn Cemetery Garden of Memories Mausoleum	480 Queenston Road	2000
Walkinshaw Park Washroom	15 Henrietta Street	2004
Woodgale Park Washrooms	78 Louth Street	2002
Alex Mackenzie Dugout #1	17 Beech Street	1974
Alex Mackenzie Dugout #2	17 Beech Street	1974
Alex Mackenzie Girotti #1	17 Beech Street	1995
Alex Mackenzie Girotti #2	17 Beech Street	1995
Berkley Park Storage Shed Girotti Building	44 Ridgeview Avenue	1995
Berkley Park Storage Shed Girotti Building #2	44 Ridgeview Avenue	2009
Bulk Water Facility - Girotti	2012 First Street	2006
Burgoyne Woods Park Day Camp Shed #1	30 Edgedale Road	1995
Burgoyne Woods Park Day Camp Shed #2	30 Edgedale Road	1995
Burgoyne Woods Park Day Camp Shed #3	30 Edgedale Road	1995
Burgoyne Woods Park Day Camp Shed #4	30 Edgedale Road	1995
Burgoyne Woods Park Girotti Equipment Storage	30 Edgedale Road	1995
Burgoyne Woods Park Equipment storage building	30 Edgedale Road	1995
Catherine Street Park - Electrical/Sprinkler Control Building - Girotti	64 Catherine Street	2006
Fire Hall #1 Shed	64 Geneva Street	2010
Fire Hall #2 Shed	194 Linwell Road	1995
Fire Hall #3 Shed	285 Pelham Road	1970
Fire Hall #6 Shed	463 Scott Street	1995
Grapeview Park Storage Building Girotti	108 First Street Louth	1995
Happy Rolph's Animal Pens - Shelters	650 Read Road	2012
Happy Rolph's Pavilion	650 Read Road	1995
Joe McCafferey Park Storage & Girotti #1	61 Vansickle Road	1995
Joe McCafferey Park Storage & Girotti #2	61 Vansickle Road	1995
Kernahan Park Storage Building - Girotti	381 Queenston Street	1995
Lakeside Park Storage Building - Girotti #1	9 Main Street	1995
Lakeside Park Storage Building - Girotti #2	9 Main Street	1995
Lancaster Park Diamond 2 - Storage Building for Ball Diamond Lights	30 Wood Street	1995
Lancaster Park Diamond 2 - Storage Building 1	30 Wood Street	1995
Lancaster Park Diamond 2 - Storage Building 2	30 Wood Street	1995
Lancaster Park Diamond 2 - Storage Building 3	30 Wood Street	1995
Lester B. Pearson Park Girotti	360 Niagara Street	1995
Lester B. Pearson Park Pavilion	360 Niagara Street	2011
Lock Tender's Shanty		1829
Malcolmson Park Storage Girotti	325 Lakeshore Road	1995

Memorial Park Storage Building # 1 - Girotti	6-10 St. Paul Street W.	1995
Memorial Park Storage Building # 2 - Girotti	6-10 St. Paul Street W.	1995
Merritton Community Centre Shed	5 Park Avenue	1986
Merritton Park Storage Shed - Girotti #1 - Diamond 1	32 Seymour Avenue	1995
Merritton Park Storage Shed - Girotti #2 - Diamond 1	32 Seymour Avenue	1995
Merritton Park Storage Shed - Girotti #3 - Diamond 1	32 Seymour Avenue	1995
Merritton Park Dugout #1	32 Seymour Avenue	1986
Merritton Park Dugout #2	32 Seymour Avenue	1986
Morningstar Mill - Ice House	2712 Decew Road	1992
Morningstar Mill - Out House	2712 Decew Road	1992
RCS and Recreation - Girotti #1	320 Geneva Street	1985
RCS - Girotti #2	320 Geneva Street	1985
RCS - Girotti #3	320 Geneva Street	1985
Rennie Park - Storage Shed - Girotti	60 Lakeport Road	1995
St. Catharines Municipal Golf Course Clubhouse Girotti	37 Lincoln Road	1995
St. Catharines Municipal Golf Course Clubhouse Girotti	37 Lincoln Road	1995
St. Catharines Municipal Golf Course Clubhouse Girotti	37 Lincoln Road	1995
St. Catharines Municipal Golf Course Clubhouse Girotti	37 Lincoln Road	1995
St. Catharines Municipal Golf Course Clubhouse Girotti	37 Lincoln Road	1995
St. Catharines Museum - Storage - Girotti	1932 Government Road	1990
Victoria Lawn Cemetery Storage Building - Attached to Service Bldg	480 Queenston Road	1978
Victoria Lawn Cemetery Storage Building - Girotti - Beside Service Bldg	480 Queenston Road	1995
Victoria Lawn Cemetery Storage Building - Block Building - North Property	480 Queenston Road	1995
Victoria Lawn Cemetery Storage Building - Girotti - West of Holy Trinity Mausoleum	480 Queenston Road	1995
Victoria Lawn Cemetery Chinese Pagoda	480 Queenston Road	1992
Victoria Lawn Cemetery Queenston Courtyard Columbarium	480 Queenston Road	1986
Victoria Lawn Cemetery Storage Building - Girotti - Gas Storage	480 Queenston Road	1995
West Park - Storage Girotti #1	78 Louth Street	2002
West Park - Storage Girotti #2	78 Louth Street	2002
Woodgale Park Girotti	78 Louth Street	2002

APPENDIX 2**Category 2 Facilities**

Asset Description	Address	Acquisition Year
Old Court House	101 King Street	1846
Fire Hall # 1	64 Geneva Street	1948
Fire Hall # 2	194 Linwell Road	1958
Fire Hall # 3	285 Pelham Road	1958
Fire Training Tower	70 St. Paul Crescent	1975
Haig Bowl Arena	17 Beech Street	1973
Rex Stimers/Jack Gatecliff Arena (Garden City)	8 Gale Crescent	1932
RCS Main Office & Repair Garage	320 Geneva Street	1963
RCS Storage A - Storage/Workshop	320 Geneva Street	1985
RCS Storage B - Equipment Garage	320 Geneva Street	1985
Victoria Lawn Cemetery Office	480 Queenston Road	1856
Dalhousie Seniors - Old Fire Hall #5 - Brock Street Seniors Drop in Centre	19 Brock Street	
Arthur Street Park Filter Room and Washroom	92 Arthur Street	1985
Burgoyne Woods Park Pool Wash/Change Room	30 Edgedale Road	1995
Burgoyne Woods Park Girotti Filter Shed - Wading Pool	30 Edgedale Road	1995
Lancaster Park Pool - Wading Pool Filter Girotti	30 Wood Street	1986
Lancaster Park Pool Main Pool Building - Change rooms, Washrooms & Snack Bar	30 Wood Street	1985
Lincoln Park Filter Shed & Washrooms	63 Chetwood Street	1986
Lion Duncan Schooley (Merritton Park) Pool Washrooms & Change rooms	32 Seymour Avenue	1986
Port Dalhousie Lion's Park, Pool Building, Shed, Filter & Washroom, and Wading Pool	201, 203, 205 Main Street	1987

APPENDIX 3

Category 3 Facilities

Asset Description	Address	Acquisition Year
Malcolmson Park Recreational Greenhouse #1	325 Lakeshore Road	1989
Malcolmson Park Recreational Greenhouse #2	325 Lakeshore Road	1989
Malcolmson Park Recreational Greenhouse #3	325 Lakeshore Road	1989
Malcolmson Park Dutch Greenhouse - Behind Office	325 Lakeshore Road	1989
Dalhousie House	56 Lakeport Road	1850
Happy Rolph's House	2 Northup Crescent	1974
Merritton Seniors Centre	343 Merritt Street	1858
Old Fire Hall # 4	16 Walnut Street	1911
Old Fire Hall (Senior's Workshop)	431 Queenston Street	1961
West Park Swimming Pool Building	78 Louth Street	1967
West Park Wading Pool Girotti Filter	78 Louth Street	1988
St. Catharines Municipal Golf Course Old Clubhouse	37 Lincoln Road	1976
Fairview Golf Course Clubhouse	325 Geneva Street	1999
Fairview Golf Course Service Building	325 Geneva Street	1999

The facilities highlighted on Appendix 3 have been the subject of previous reports to Council and have already been determined to be surplus to the needs of the City. Demolition and/or disposal of these facilities is subject to budget approval or further stakeholder engagement.