

St. Catharines Heritage Advisory Committee

Minutes

Thursday, September 10, 2015

Burgoyne Woods Room at 5:00

Attendance:

Gail Benjafield
Nancy Cameron (from 5:15 pm)
John Crawley
Marty Mako
Robin McPherson
Brian Narhi
Mike Sullivan

Absent:

Holly Washuta
Dennis Gannon

Council:

Carlos Garcia (to 6:20pm)
Bruce Williamson (to 5:55pm)

Public:

Mark Shoalts
Harald Ensslen
Peter Connolly (to 5:30pm)
David Webb (to 5:30pm)

Staff Liaison:

Kevin Blozowski, Planning and Building Services
Charlotte McEwan, Planning and Building Services
Jim Riddell, Planning and Building Services
Anthony Martuccio, Transportation and Environmental Services

1. Call meeting to order (Chair)

Robin McPherson took the chair and called the meeting to order at 5:05pm. The committee was reminded to read and adhere to Handbook for Advisory Committees (revised May 2015)

2. **Additions/Deletions to the Agenda**

There were no additions/deletions to the agenda.

3. **Motion to approve the agenda**

Moved by: John Crawley

"That the SCHAC ratify and adopt the agenda for this SCHAC meeting held on Thursday, September 10, 2015, copies having been previously distributed."

CARRIED

4. **Motion to adopt the minutes of the previous meeting**

Moved by: Mike Sullivan

"That the SCHAC ratify and adopt the minutes, as revised, of the SCHAC meeting held on Thursday, August 13, 2015, copies having been previously distributed."

CARRIED

5. **Presentations (invited guests)**

See item 7.1

6. **Business arising from the minutes**

Kevin Blozowski will follow up regarding the air raid siren at Kernahan Park for the next meeting.

7. **Business**

7.1 Heritage Permit Application

Proposed Demolition of the Lakeside Park Pavilion

File No: 10.64.144 N5

At the August meeting the pavilion discussion was deferred to allow Mark Shoalts to further examine the roof structure. Brian Narhi was to prepare a report.

Mark Shoalts' follow up report and presentation concluded that the existing pavilion is the same size and shape as the original, but likely a reconstruction using some of the original materials.

Brian Narhi's report and presentation concluded that the pavilion appears to be the sole-remaining structure in its original location, however that its architectural integrity has been impacted due to the removal of some of its

original elements. Consideration of demolition could be conditional on the following: 1) that wooden support columns be identified and salvaged, possibly for interpretative purposes, and 2) that the partially buried steps on the west side of the pavilion be preserved.

Staff provided members with a structural assessment of the pavilion prepared by MacDonald Zuberec Ensslen Architects/Mark Shoalts detailing the foundations, above grade structure, roof structure, and finishes. The assessment provided an estimated construction date of the building elements. Estimated construction dates range from the early 1960s to the mid-1980s.

The committee discussed the matter focusing on whether the pavilion is original or if it has been extensively reconstructed. The consensus was the latter.

The reports (Shoalts, Webb, Narhi) will be provided to the St. Catharines Public Library.

It was then,

Moved by: Brian Narhi

“That the demolition of the pavilion at Lakeside Park may be considered because there is not enough evidence to determine the originality of the structure, subject to the following: That the wooden columns be preserved and used for interpretive purposes, that the partially buried steps on the west side of the pavilion be preserved, and that the “new build” be in the same general location of the existing pavilion.”

CARRIED

7.2 57 Lakeshore Road
Status of Heritage Designation
File No: 10.64.183 V2

In August 2013 the Owner of 57 Lakeshore submitted notice of intention to demolish the Queen Ann style home which was listed on the City's Register of Non-Designated Heritage Properties. On November, 2013, Council resolved its intention to designate the building under the Ontario Heritage Act and in December of 2013 the Owner filed a Notice of Objection to the designation. For most of 2014 the City/Owner attended a number of pre-hearing conferences and meetings in an effort to resolve the matter without a full hearing.

In January, 2015, the City/Owner signed a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) that required the Owner to do a number of things including preparing a Conservation Plan prior to the relocation of the house immediately to the east. The City has retained a heritage consultant, Richard Unterman, to provide professional heritage advice through the process. The Owner also agrees to withdraw objection to the designation on relocation of the building. The City will designate the building in its new location of the severed lot to the east.

There is another pre-hearing conference set for September 15, 2015, where it is anticipated the matter will be resolved. On resolution, staff will provide the Conservation Plan for the building to the committee.

8. Updates from Sub-Committees

Deferred to next meeting

- 8.1** Designations, Plaquing and Ceremonies
- 8.2** Public Outreach and Education (POE)
- 8.3** Research and Inventory
- 8.4** Heritage Districts

9. Date of next meeting

Thursday, October 08, 2015

10. Adjournment

There being no further items of business, the meeting adjourned at 6:35pm

Please advise Kevin Blozowski at 905 688-5601, extension 1710 or at kblozowski@stcatharines.ca if you are unable to attend the meeting or did not receive the item(s) noted in the agenda.

**Next Regular Meeting – Thursday October 8, 2015
Burgoyne Woods Room, Third Floor, City Hall**