



**The Corporation of the City of St. Catharines
CITY COUNCIL AGENDA
Twenty-Seventh Meeting, Regular, Monday, December 16, 2013
Council Chambers, City Hall, 6:30 PM**

His Worship Mayor Brian McMullan takes the Chair and opens the meeting

Page

- 1. Invocation**
- 2. Opening Remarks, Mayor McMullan**
- 3. Presentations**
- 4. Adoption of the Agendas**
- 5. Declarations of Interest**
- 6. Public Meetings Pursuant to Planning Act (Commencing at 7:30 p.m.)**
- 7. Adoption of the Minutes (Council and General Committee)**
 - 7.1 [Twenty-Sixth Meeting of Council, December 2, 2013](#)
 - 7.2 [Twenty-Sixth Meeting of General Committee, December 2, 2013](#)
- 8. Delegations**
 - 8.1 Barry Katzman and John Potts, Co-Chairs, Niagara Grape and Wine Festival; Re: Board's Annual Review (See General Committee Agenda, December 16, 2013, Item 3.1)
 - 8.2 Vincent Atallah, Chairperson; Re: Mayor's Youth Advisory Committee Update
 - 8.3 Sandra Merk and Peter Vietgen, Public Art Advisory Committee Members; Re: Committee Update and Recent Acquisition
 - 8.4 **PUBLIC MEETING (Pursuant to Notice By-law)**
2014 Schedule of Rates and Fees (See General Committee Agenda, December 16, 2013, Item 3.2)
- 9. Call for Notices of Motion**

Page

10. Motions

10.1 Governance Committee

That Council direct staff to disband the Governance Committee as per the Terms of Reference; and

That staff thank the committee members for volunteering to serve on this committee. FORTHWITH

11. Resolve into General Committee

12. Motion Arising from In-Camera Session

13. Motion to Ratify Forthwith Recommendations

14. By-laws

14.1 Reading of By-laws

15. Agencies, Boards, Committee Reports

15.1 Committee Minutes to Receive: Graffiti Committee, Mayor's Advisory Committee for Black History, Museum Advisory Committee, Public Art Advisory Committee, Port Dalhousie Heritage District Advisory Committee, St. Catharines Heritage Committee, and Mayor's Youth Advisory Committee

16. Adjournment

By-laws to be considered on December 16, 2013

- (a) A By-law to authorize a Lease Agreement with Beatties Stationary Limited. (Three readings – with respect to multifunction digital devices. To be considered by General Committee, December 16, 2013 FORTHWITH.
- (b) A By-law to amend By-law No. 6756 entitled “A By-law to establish Zoning Area No. 5 and to regulate the use of land and the character, location and use of buildings and structures therein”. (Three readings – with respect to lifting the holding provision on 136 James Street. Council, January 30, 2012, Item No. 42.)
- (c) A By-law to amend By-law No. 2013-138 entitled “A By-law to provide for the adoption of an amendment to the Official Plan of St. Catharines.” (Three readings – with respect to change of OPA number for 88 Merritt Street. Regular Council, April 29, 2013, Item No. 6.1)
- (d) A By-law to provide for the adoption of an amendment to the Official Plan of St. Catharines. (Three readings – with respect to aligning new Zoning By-law and Official Plan. Council, November 18, 2013, Item No. 6.1, Part One, (1).)
- (e) A By-law to regulate the use of land, the bulk, height, location, erection and use of buildings and structures, the provision of parking spaces and other associated matters in the City of St. Catharines. (Three readings – with respect to new City of St. Catharines Zoning By-law. Council, November 18, 2013, Item No. 6.1, Part One (2).)
- (f) A By-law to amend By-law No. 85-534 which designates certain lands within the City of St. Catharines as a Site Plan Control Area. (Three readings – with respect to new City of St. Catharines Official Plan and exemption of residential buildings having less than four dwellings from the provisions of the Site Plan Control. Council, November 18, 2013, Item No. 6.1 Part One (3).)
- (g) A By-law to authorize an Agreement with Niagara Grape and Wine Festival. (Three readings – with respect to funding for the 2014-2015 Grape and Wine Festivals. To be considered by General Committee, December 16, 2013 FORTHWITH.
- (h) A By-law to impose certain fees charged by The Corporation of the City of St. Catharines with respect to certain administrative matters. (Three readings – with respect to 2014 Schedule of Rates & Fees. To be considered by General Committee, December 16, 2013, FORTHWITH.
- (i) A By-law to amend By-law No. 89-2000 entitled “A By-law regulating traffic and parking on City Roads”. (Three readings – with respect to Heavy Vehicle Prohibition on Vine Street South, School Zone Policy at 7 School Locations and School Bus Loading Zone for Michael J. Brennan School. To be considered by General Committee, December 16, 2013, FORTHWITH.

- (j) A By-law to authorize a contract with Trenchline & Roads Inc. (Three readings – with respect to Municipal Services Improvements – Bridge Street, Project P13-065. Delegation By-law No. 2004-277, as amended.)
- (k) A By-law to confirm the proceedings and decisions of the Council of The Corporation of the City of St. Catharines at its Meeting held on December 16, 2013. (Three readings – with respect to ratification and adoption of City Council Minutes of December 2, 2013, and General Committee Minutes of December 2, 2013.)



Corporation of the City of St. Catharines
MAYOR'S GRAFFITI COMMITTEE MEETING

Tuesday, Nov 19, 2013

5:00 to 6:00pm

St. Catharines City Hall, 50 Church Street: Ante Room

Meeting Notes

Present: Mayor Brian McMullan, Councillor Greg Washuta
 Staff: Stacey Wells (Legal), Kristen Sullivan (RCS)
 Tisha Polocko, Ben Hannan, Holly Washuta, Kris Akilie, Selby Harris, Milica Kovacevich, Filomena Goldsworthy for John Stainsby

Regrets: Councillor Jeff Burch
 Paul Jackson (NRP), John Stainsby (DSBN), Dan Trainor (NCDSB)
 Stacey Sheehan, Dave Schulz, Daniel Frye, Edmund Bruckner, Kris Akilie, Michelle Gagnon

Welcome and roundtable introductions ~ Mayor McMullan

1. Corporate Accessibility Training ~ Julie Hughes

- See handouts, Accessibility for Ontarians Disability Act training manual

Action, Committee members

- *Volunteer training manuals to be read with instructions to complete the Knowledge Check List and return asap to Mayor's Office*

2. CrimeStoppers CASH arena board replacement ~ Kristen Sullivan

- 7 arena boards need to be replaced at cost of \$121.00 each plus HST

Motion, Ben Hannan

- *That the Graffiti Committee consents to the replacement of each of the 7 CrimeStoppers arena boards at a total cost of \$847.00 plus HST and that the contact information on the poster be verified prior to replacement. That the Mayor's Office notify CrimeStoppers of the continued efforts to deter graffiti*

Seconded, Selby Harris

All in favour

Carried

3. Graffiti vandalism at McCalla/Carlton ~ Kristen Sullivan

Councillor Greg Washuta

- Photos circulated
- Large scale graffiti vandalism on fencing and sheds affecting several homeowners who back onto the public walking trail corridor
- NRP notified, tags photographed with incident reports
- Discussion on how the Committee can best expedite graffiti removal efforts without the City incurring liability

MAYOR'S GRAFFITI COMMITTEE MEETING

MEETING: Nov 19, 2013

PAGE 2

Motion, Milica Kovacevich

- *That the Graffiti Committee request Council's approval to grant the Graffiti Committee the ability to use their discretion on a case by case basis to increase the ratio of city funding from 50% up to 100% for applicants to the City's Graffiti Removal Program*

All in favour

Carried

Action, Councillor Washuta

- *Councillor Washuta to make the request at Council on Dec 2, 2013*

Motion, Milica Kovacevich

- *That, if the above motion is approved by Council on Dec 2, 2013, the Graffiti Committee will cover 100% of the cost of graffiti removal to all the homeowners identified in the McCalla/Carlton area whose private property was vandalized by graffiti*

All in favour

Carried

Action, Councillor Washuta and city staff

- *Councillor Washuta to report the names and addresses of the homeowners to staff (Kristen Sullivan/Julie Hughes)*
- *Staff to distribute graffiti removal contractor information, applications for the Graffiti Removal Program along with a personalized letter (which will outline the percentage to be covered by the City as approved by Council on Dec 2)*

4. Private property bordering St Patrick's Park ~ Milica Kovacevich

- Staff reports that there have never been graffiti reported on this property
- However, business does get targeted due to location
- Discussion on how the City could help to mitigate graffiti, fencing or planting

Action, Kristen Sullivan

- *RCS staff will investigate planting vines at this location in the spring*

5. Volunteer Policy update~ Stacey Wells

- HR has not completed draft policy
- Ben Hannan requests stakeholder participation in review

Action, Stacey Wells

- *Stacey will pass along Ben's suggestion to HR*

Next meeting: early March 2014 (date to be determined in January)

Meeting adjourned: 6:00pm



Mayor's Advisory Committee for Black History

FOR: 2013 / 5th MEETING of the Mayor's Advisory Committee for Black History

HELD: Thursday, Sept. 26, 2013 – City Hall

PRESENT: Donna Ford, Chair; Mathew Siscoe; Councillor; Elizabeth Freeman-Shaw; Gord McGinn; John Richmond

REGRETS: Brian McMullan, Mayor; Jeff Burch, Councillor; Rochelle Bush; Christiana Fixon-Owoo; Richard Ndayizigamiye; Rosemary Sadlier; Ada Summers

CIRCULATED TO: Dan Carnegie, Director Corporate Support Services

IN ATTENDANCE: Kathleen Powell, Supervisor Historical Services/Curator
Phil Cristi, Manager Programs & Cultural Services, RCS
Karen Cockerham, Secretary

MINUTES

1. **Call to Order**

The meeting was called to order at 6:43 pm by the Chair.

2. **Confirmation of Minutes**

MOTION: RICHMOND/FREEMAN-SHAW

THAT the minutes of the Meetings held July 18, 2013 be approved.
Carried.

3. **Feasibility Study Update**

MOTION: RICHMOND/SISCOE

THAT the peter j. smith & company inc. consulting firm be approved as the consultants for the Feasibility Study.
Carried.

Discussion:

References were contacted for the preferred & secondary consultants. Based on those results and related criteria, the Committee came to a unanimous decision to engage a consultant firm. Staff will prepare a Council Report and submit to City Council for the first available meeting.

4. Next Meeting Date

The next meeting will be held Thursday, October 24, 2013, 6:30 pm
In the event there is no update available at that time, the next meeting will be held Thursday, November 14, 2013.

5. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 7:18 pm.

Certified Correct (Secretary): _____

Confirmed by (Chair): _____



St. Catharines Museum Advisory Committee

FOR: 2013 / 6th Meeting

HELD: Tuesday, September 24, 2013

PRESENT: Lesley Seaborne, Chair; Michael Coakley; Justine Cotton; Gord McGinn; Edwin Wand; Vaughn Stewart; Brenda Zadoroznij

REGRETS: Matt Harris, Councillor; Elizabeth Freeman-Shaw;

CIRCULATED TO: Dan Carnegie, Director Corporate Support Services

IN ATTENDANCE: Kathleen Powell, Supervisor Museum Operations/Curator;
Karen Cockerham, Secretary

MINUTES

1. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 6:02 pm by the Chair

2. Confirmation of Minutes

MOTION: COAKLEY/ZADOROZNIJ

THAT the Minutes of the meeting held June 25, 2013 be approved.
Carried.

3. Reports

a. Curator's Report – K. Powell

Handout: Statistics, Activities for June-August 2013

- Note that it is difficult to get accurate visitation numbers to the Centre, as there are two ground-floor entrances and a counter on only the front door.
- It was suggested that, for events where food trucks may be appropriate, having fresh fruit stands would be a good alternative
- It was suggested that a small market-place for fresh fruit and vegetables might work well during the summer months.

4. **Ongoing Discussion Items**

a. **Public Transit**

No report at this time.

b. **Outdoor Signage**

- Requested quotes based on outdoor lit, similar size to current sign
- Waiting for quotes from contacted sign companies
- It was suggested that retrofitting the current sign might be an option

5. **Special Funds Report**

- The difference between Admissions Donations (revenue, operating funds) and general Donations (Development Fund within Special Funds) was discussed
- It was suggested that a brochure re donating by bequest be developed. The Public Relations/Fundraising Committee will work towards this.

6. **Strategic Planning**

- RFP for consultant has been submitted to Finance for review and approval

7. **Sub-Committee Reports**

a. **Collections Sub-Committee**

- Meeting on Sept. 11 consisted of orientation and tour of the collections
- Will meet the second Wednesday of each month on as-needed basis

b. **Programs Sub-Committee**

Sub-Committee meeting: not met

c. **Public Relations Sub-Committee**

Sub-Committee meeting: not met

- Under Consideration: mobile off-site exhibits
 - Downtown art centre – space not available
 - Downtown – suggested paper displays, with cooperation and input from Downtown Association
 - City Hall – small teaser display, changed every 4-6 weeks
 - Library – a display is in place
 - Hospital – Mack Nursing project brings possibility of having parts displayed at both Museum & Hospital
 - Spectator Facility – Sports Hall of Fame will be on permanent display, with Museum updating and changing
 - Brock University – J. Cotton will investigate possibility of using display areas already in place

d. **Fundraising Sub-Committee**

Sub-Committee meeting: not met

Update: 1905 Oldsmobile – City Council has approved motion to purchase the artifact with Special Funds.

8. **Steering Committee Reports**

a. **Website Improvement Steering Committee**

- Committee met to review submitted site design; will continue to follow up

9. **Other Business**

a. **Mayor's Advisory Committee for Black History**

Consultant presentations were heard. References are being checked.

b. **Welland Canals Fallen Workers Memorial**

Focus is on workers killed during construction of 4th Canal, due to granting purposes (grant is based on 100th Anniversary of first death). Design Committee is looking for members (volunteers).

10. **Next Meeting**

The next meeting has been scheduled for Tuesday, Oct. 22, 6:00 pm, at the Museum.

11. **Adjournment**

The meeting was adjourned at 7:34 pm

Certified Correct (Secretary): _____

Confirmed by (Chair): _____

Public Art Advisory Committee Meeting Minutes

Thursday September 19, 2013
3:30pm Buchanan House | 4:00pm Kiwanis Aquatics Centre

Present: Councillor Mark Elliott, Lesley Bell (Chair), Sandra Merk, Peter Vietgen, Michael Zuberec
Regrets: Marcie Bronson
Staff: Rebecca Cann, Emma German, Scott Ritchie, Jennifer Tupling

1. Tour of Buchanan House

The Public Art Advisory Committee toured Buchanan House and viewed the works onsite by artist John Sakars. Decisions regarding the work will be undertaken at a later date.

2. Approval of Agenda

Motion: To approve the agenda for Thursday September 19, 2013.

Moved: P. Vietgen **Seconded:** M. Elliott **Approved.**

3. Approval of Minutes

Motion: To approve the meeting minutes from Wednesday August 28, 2013.

Moved: M. Zuberec **Seconded:** M. Elliott **Approved.**

4. Correspondence

Nothing at this time.

5. Business Arising from the Minutes

a. Acquisition of work from Beyond the Wall

R. Cann announced that the acquisition process is complete and the artist is excited to have his work in the City of St. Catharines' Civic Art Collection.

b. Twinning Artwork

R. Cann reported that the donated artwork is now installed in the Mayor's office and other Trinidad works from the collection are displayed in the Anteroom. Port of Spain Mayor Louis Lee Sing will be visiting St. Catharines this month.

6. Community Public Art Initiatives

a. Burgoyne Bridge project update

Nothing to report at this time. R. Cann will follow-up with the Engineering Department regarding the letter from this committee.

b. Welland Canal Fallen Workers Memorial

R. Cann reported that the Call for Selection Panel Members is now out and responses have started to come in. She requested assistance with reviewing the applications and selecting the final panel members.

Action: R. Cann will email possible dates for selection and those available will respond.

7. Public Art Initiatives

a. City Hall Exhibits

i. Call for 2014 Juried Exhibit

J. Tupling shared the draft Call to Artists and asked for feedback. She will also distribute via email.

ii. City Hall, 3rd Floor Space

Staff are moving forward on the reframing of the Council photographs, the test image was a success. This will be completed with the renovations of the 3rd floor in the start of 2014.

b. Downtown Performing Arts Centre and Meridian Centre Public Art

Nothing to report at this time.

c. Centennial Gardens exhibit

The exhibit is installed at Centennial Gardens.

8. St. Catharines Arts Award Design Task Force

R. Cann reported that the members of the task force have been confirmed and will be contacted in the coming week to arrange their first meeting.

9. Art Collection

a. Johansson's Bar

It can still not be confirmed what the object is, how it was used and its historical significance to St. Catharines. The working group has explored many possibilities and is continuing their research. There is some thought that it may be a tool used in the quarry work. They asked the committee to share other ideas for information that they may have.

b. Collections Update

R. Cann reported that she is working on getting the two bronze sculptures in the collection evaluated for restoration. Work continues on the St. Catharines Cenotaph, the ramp is being installed and there will be landscaping completed. The site is to reopen in time for Remembrance Day.

c. Twinning Artwork Donation

The committee discussed the painting received by the Mayor this February in Port of Spain and requested more information on the artist; this will be required to complete rating system. R. Cann reviewed the section of the Public Art Policy with them that relates to gifts.

Action: Staff will research and send more information to the committee for review.

9. Development of Public Art Procurement Process

Nothing at this time.

10. Reports

a. Culture Committee – P. Vietgen

P. Vietgen reported that the group reviewed the draft Festivals and Events Grant program that would be administered as part of the St. Catharines Cultural Investment Program (SCCIP). The 2013 SCCIP recommendations were approved by City Council on August 26. The date for the 2014 City of St. Catharines Arts Awards has been confirmed – save the day, May 3.

b. Joint Mural Task Force – S. Merk

Nothing to report.

c. Cultural Services – R. Cann

R. Cann reported that the latest edition of Culture Ink has been released. Cultural Services has been working with the Downtown Alliance for the Performing Arts on a promotional contest through cNiagara.ca. SCCIP funding has been released to approved recipients. The City Core exhibit has been hung at City Hall and other artwork has been put on display. Staff is working with the Friends of the Carousel to organize the upcoming restoration season. R. Cann noted she has been working with two organizations looking at the possibility of a Regional Arts Organization. ArtsVest had 10 submissions in St. Catharines and all have been accepted. The Culture Plan is in the final draft stage.

11. Other Business

R. Cann reported that Council approved a report recommending the Tribute to Workers memorial return to its former location on McGuire Street once the Burgoyne Bridge project is complete.

Motion: To adjourn the meeting of Thursday September 19, 2013.

Moved: P. Vietgen

Meeting Adjourned at approximately 5:14 pm

Next Meeting: Thursday November 21, 2013 – 4:00pm, Ante Room, City Hall



City of St. Catharines

Planning and Development Services
PO Box 3012, 50 Church Street
St. Catharines, ON L2R 7C2

Phone: 905-688-5600
Fax: 905-688-5873
TTY: 905-688-4TTY (4889)

**SPECIAL MEETING OF THE PORT DALHOUSIE HERITAGE
DISTRICT ADVISORY COMMITTEE
MINUTES**

Meeting of Thursday, June 13, 2013

PRESENT: John Bacher
Carlos Garcia
David Webb

COUNCIL: Councillor Bruce Williamson

STAFF: Jim Riddell, Planning and Development Services
Britney Williamson, Planning and Development Services

REGRETS: David Bergen
Anita Hofmann-Caslin
David Roberts
Norman Rockwell
Councillor Len Stack
Bob Sennett

ABSENT: Peter Connolly
Jim Rowbottom
Holly Washuta

PUBLIC: Bryan Bawnor, Legion
Tim Collins, Developer
Ken Kruck, ACK Architects
Stanford Downing, Stanford Downey Architects Inc.
Donna Henderson, Legion
Chuck Johnston, Legion
Paul Squires, Developer
James Smith, Heritage Architect
Barb Wiens, Agent

1. CALL TO ORDER

David Webb took the chair and called the meeting to order at the Port Dalhousie Legion, 57 and 57A Lakeport Road at 2:10 p.m.

2. BUSINESS

2.1 Preconsultation Discussion

Proposal: Legion Redevelopment
Address: 57 and 57A Lakeport Road
Agent: Barb Wiens, Quartek Group

David Webb welcomed the owner and presenters. The PDHDAC introduced themselves, and David Webb noted that the purpose of the special meeting is to introduce the proposed concept for redevelopment of the Legion and to receive input from PDHDAC, in particular any information regarding important heritage resources of the building and site that should be considered for heritage conservation and integration with the proposed redevelopment.

Barb Wiens provided a brief introduction regarding the initial plans for the Legion site and Tim Collins also provided context on the current situation and the Developer's request for feedback from the PDHDAC. The proposal is for a residential apartment building with ground floor space dedicated to the Port Dalhousie Legion. Exact building height, massing and scale are yet to be determined. Chuck Johnson provided a perspective on behalf of the Legion, elaborating on the background of the property and the space they would retain within the proposed redevelopment. James Smith provided a summary of the heritage attributes based on his research to date, noting the social significance of the Legion and the historical value of the original building together with later additions.

David Webb explained the process and role of the Committee and the Port Dalhousie Heritage Conservation District Guidelines for Conservation and Change (the "Guidelines"). David also provided a brief historical background on the property, noting the archaeology of the water wheel, 1870s workshop for second and third Welland Canal repair and basic finishes and framing of the building. It was also noted that the building was used by the Henley Regatta, which is significant for its association with the community. More research is required to determine the historical value of the building within the community, and it was suggested that the webpage for vintage Port Dalhousie could be used as a starting point. Carlos Garcia suggested that the James Smith get in touch with family members of the late Doug Mackey, who was a local historian in Port Dalhousie (Port Memories). Brock University's Geography Department could be used to source early aerial photography as well.

Members present expressed concern that any demolition could impact the Region's efforts to commemorate the Welland Canal through National Designation (Historic Sites and Monuments Board). It is important to determine the significance of the structure in terms of association with the second and third Welland Canal as a priority.

In order to fully evaluate the building, the Committee will need more information on the age of the building, its structural integrity and other features of historical importance, including both the built structure and the uses of the site. Barb Wiens advised that a structure assessment has not been completed yet. Following the meeting, the Committee was given a tour of the facility.

3. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further items of business, the meeting adjourned at 4:00 p.m.

The next meeting is scheduled for Thursday, July 25, 2013.

Committee members should advise Britney Williamson at 905-688-5601 (Extension 1704) or brwilliamson@stcatharines.ca if they are unable to attend the meeting or did not receive the item(s) noted in the agenda.

Minutes prepared by:

Sara Epp
Student Planner
Planning Services

G:\Heritage\Port Dalhousie Heritage Committee\Minutes\2013\PDHDAC Minutes 06-13-2013 - Special Meeting.docx



City of St. Catharines

Planning and Development Services
PO Box 3012, 50 Church Street
St. Catharines, ON L2R 7C2

Phone: 905-688-5600
Fax: 905-688-5873
TTY: 905-688-4TTY (4889)

Port Dalhousie Heritage District Advisory Committee Meeting Minutes

Meeting of Thursday, June 27, 2013

PRESENT: John Bacher
David Bergen
Carlos Garcia
Jim Rowbottom
Councillor Len Stack
Holly Washuta
David Webb

STAFF: Vince Covatta, Transportation and Environmental Services
Jim Riddell, Planning and Development Services
Kristen Sullivan, Recreation and Community Services
Britney Williamson, Planning and Development Services

REGRETS: Peter Connolly

ABSENT: Anita Hofmann-Caslin
David Roberts
Norman Rockwell
Bob Sennett
Councillor Bruce Williamson

PUBLIC: Anthony Meo, Premier Homes of Niagara (19 Shelley Avenue)
John Davies, Architect (19 Shelley Avenue)
Leo Di Fabio, Real Estate Agent (19 Shelley Avenue)
Bill Richardson, Neon By-Onyx Signs (1 Lock Street)
Frank, Owner (1 Lock Street)
Chris Essig, Owner (147 Dalhousie Avenue)
Sarah Johnston, Owner (147 Dalhousie Avenue)

David Bergen arrived at 5:24 pm.

1. CALL TO ORDER

David Webb took the chair and called the meeting to order in Committee Room 1 at 5:25 pm.

2. CONFIRMATION OF PREVIOUS MINUETS

2.1. Thursday, May 30, 2013

Moved by: Carlos Garcia

"That the PDHDAC ratify and adopt the minutes of the PDHDAC meeting held Thursday, May 30, 2013, copies having been previously distributed."

CARRIED

3. BUSINESS

3.1. Heritage Permit Application

Address: 19 Shelley Avenue

Proposal: To construct a new 865 ft², 2 storey, single detached dwelling

Applicant: Premier Homes of Niagara (Anthony Meo)

File No.: 10.64.144J4

Application is made for a heritage permit to construct a new 865 ft², two storey, single detached dwelling. The applicant was present to answer questions, and briefly explained the proposal, noting that the use of materials will further the appearance of the recessed garage. The Port Dalhousie Heritage Conservation District Guidelines for Conservation and Change (the "Guidelines") set out policies to evaluate proposals for new construction in Section 5.5 and 5.6.

The Committee discussed compliance with the Guidelines, and comments centred upon the placement of the garage as it should not dominate the front façade. The applicant believes the dominance of the garage will be mitigated by the front gable atop the porch. The impact of the height of the home in relation to neighbouring properties was also discussed as the surrounding neighbourhood is predominantly one storey. It was then,

Moved by: David Bergen

"That the heritage permit for the proposed 865 ft², 2 storey, single detached dwelling at 19 Shelley Avenue be approved."

CARRIED

3.2. Heritage Permit Application

Address: 1 Lock Street

Proposal: To replace and install new wall signs on the south and east elevations

Applicant: Neon By-Onyx Ltd. (Bill Richardson)

File No.: 10.64.144K4

Application is made for a heritage permit to replace and install new wall signs on the south and east elevations of the existing commercial building. Colour copies

were provided to the PDHDAC at the meeting. Discussion focused on the illumination aspect of three signs, which are proposed to be backlight by LED, and the applicant advised that the signs can be dimmed to a softer appearance. The applicant also noted that the electronic sign may be kinetic, which was not indicated on the application. The electronic sign has the ability to offer moving imagery and text. Concerns regarding the frequency and type of messages were expressed by committee members. David Webb cited 5.7 of the Guidelines, which states "signage should be sympathetic in size, shape, materials, placement and lighting to traditional motifs." Signage is also regulated by Section 4.3.2 of the Guidelines, which states "avoid the use of back-lit florescent sign boxes against the fascia that project from the historic frame of the building." Britney Williamson noted that signs are also regulated by the Sign By-law, and Jim Riddell advised that staff will follow-up with the requirements therein

Moved by: John Bacher

"That the heritage permit for the proposed wall sign (180" x 31") and projection sign (17 ½" x 77 ¾") on the south elevation, as well as the Acqua logo sign (64" x 48") on the east elevation of the existing building at 1 Lock Street be approved."

CARRIED

Moved by: John Bacher

"That the heritage permit for the proposed LED electronic sign (82 ½" x 50 ½") be deferred to the July meeting, pending receipt of further information on the sign by-law requirements from Staff."

CARRIED

*David Webb declared a conflict of interest with regard to Item 3.3 on the agenda.
Carlos Garcia assumed the chair, by unanimous vote.*

3.3. Heritage Permit Application

Address: 147 Dalhousie Avenue

Proposal: To construct a 163 ft² second storey addition atop and behind the existing garage

Applicant: Chris Essig

File No.: 10.64.144L4

Application is made for a heritage permit to construct a 163 ft² second storey addition atop and behind the existing attached garage at 147 Dalhousie Avenue. The applicant was present to answer questions, and briefly explained the proposal. It was noted that the dormer on the second storey will be set back and the addition will be clad in the same vinyl siding as the existing dwelling.

Moved by: John Bacher

“That the heritage permit for the proposed 163 ft² second storey addition atop and behind the existing garage at 147 Dalhousie Avenue be approved.”

CARRIED

4. NEW/OTHER BUSINESS

4.1. Heritage Approval- Locktender’s Shanty

Address: 69 Lakeport Road

Proposal: Replace existing board and batten, replace or refinish window surrounds and frieze boards, install new eaves trough

Applicant: City of St. Catharines

File No.: 10.64.152

Vince Covatta provided background and explained the extent of damage to the Locktender’s Shanty. Monies have been allocated in the 2013 budget to restore the Shanty, including plans to re-clad with pre-painted pine board and 3” wide PVC batten. The City is also requesting consideration to replace the boards with PVC as well, for longevity. Vince noted that the window sills are also damaged. The plans also include installation of eaves troughs and rain water leaders, which does not require heritage permit approval, to resolve the drainage issues that have resulted in rotting at the base of the boards.

The Committee discussed the proposal, in particular, the materials to be used, such as pressure treated wood. The installation of eaves troughs was also discussed and alternatives suggested, such as grading techniques similar to those used at Fort George. Concern was noted regarding the current vacancy of the building and the importance of repairing the damage.

A site visit will be necessary to determine the extent of the damage and appropriateness of the suggested repairs. The PDHDAC agreed to visit the site on Thursday, July 4, 2013 at 5:00 pm, and Vince Covatta will co-ordinate the visit. It was also suggested that staff get in touch with the teacher from Lakeport High school to determine how much of the original structure was retained as part of the work done by the shop class in the early 1990s.

5. INFORMATION/CORRESPONDENCE

5.1. By-law 2013-99 (Simplified Meeting Procedures for Advisory Committees)

Britney Williamson informed the Committee that the simplified meeting procedure for Committees of Council was approved by By-Law 2013-99. Members should read the by-law and contact Britney Williamson with any questions.

6. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 6:40 pm.

Committee Members should advise Britney Williamson (905-688-5601 (ext. 1704) or brwilliamson@stcatharines.ca) if they are unable to attend the meeting or did not receive the item(s) noted in the agenda.

Next regular meeting - Thursday, July 25, 2013 (Pending there is business to discuss)

Committee Room #1, Third Floor, City Hall

G:\Heritage\Port Dalhousie Heritage Committee\Minutes\2013\PDHDAC Minutes 06_27_013.docx



City of St. Catharines

Planning and Development Services
PO Box 3012, 50 Church Street
St. Catharines, ON L2R 7C2

Phone: 905-688-5600
Fax: 905-688-5873
TTY: 905-688-4TTY (4889)

**Port Dalhousie Heritage District Advisory Committee Meeting
Minutes**

Meeting of Thursday, July 25, 2013

PRESENT: John Bacher
Peter Connolly
Carlos Garcia
Anita Hofmann-Caslin
Jim Rowbottom
Bob Sennett
David Webb
Councillor Bruce Williamson

STAFF: Vince Covatta, Transportation and Environmental Services
Sara Epp, Planning and Development Services
Kristen Sullivan, Recreation and Community Services
Britney Williamson, Planning and Development Services

REGRETS: David Bergen
Holly Washuta

ABSENT: David Roberts
Norman Rockwell
Councillor Len Stack

PUBLIC: Nick Thanos, Owner (23 Main Street)
Bruce Colby, Former Shop Teacher for Lakeport Secondary School
(Locktender's Shanty)

1. CALL TO ORDER

David Webb took the chair and called the meeting to order in Committee Room 1 at 5:02 pm.

2. CONFIRMATION OF PREVIOUS MINUETS

2.1. Thursday, June 13, 2013 – Special Meeting

Moved by: John Bacher

"That the PDHDAC ratify and adopt the minutes of the special PDHDAC meeting held Thursday, June 13, 2013, copies having been previously distributed."

CARRIED

2.2. Thursday, June 27, 2013

Moved by: John Bacher

"That the PDHDAC ratify and adopt the minutes of the PDHDAC meeting held Thursday, June 27, 2013, copies having been previously distributed."

CARRIED

3. BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES

3.1. Heritage Approval – Locktender's Shanty

Address: 69 Lakeport Road

Proposal: Replace existing board and batten, replace or refinish window surrounds and frieze boards, install new eaves trough

Applicant: City of St. Catharines

File No.: 10.64.152

Following the June 27, 2013 meeting, PDHDAC members visited the Locktender's Shanty with City Staff to discuss the proposed alterations. Vince Covatta introduced the shop teacher, Bruce Colby, who oversaw the restoration of the Shanty in the early 1990's. Mr. Colby explained the process of dismantling, labelling and reconstructing the building, and advised that over 95% of the materials are original. Only those battens that needed replacing were replaced. Throughout the restoration, many different paint colours (gold, white, green, burgundy) were evident on the cladding. Mr. Colby was uncertain of which colour was likely original; however, Kristen Sullivan noted documents that refer to a green building. It was also discussed that the trim colour was likely burgundy, given the areas it was found.

All records accumulated by Mr. Colby were, unfortunately, destroyed when he left Lakeport Secondary School. It was noted that there were two plaques in front of the Shanty, which have since gone missing and should be replaced. Mr. Colby will look for other pictures he may have of the site, depicting the plaques, as a guide for restoration. David Webb strongly encouraged recording an oral history of Mr. Colby's accounts concerning the restoration and the community members he spoke to regarding their memories of the Shanty. Mr. Colby recalled many stories residents shared with him after the restoration, regarding their family members' involvement with the canals or the use of the Shanty. In order to preserve these memories, Mr. Colby agreed to an interview to transcribe the oral history of his activities and encounters. Mr. Colby also noted that the name of the Lakeport students that assisted with the restoration can be found on the North West corner board. This should be preserved.

The Committee asked Mr. Colby for recommendations regarding future restorations and he noted, most importantly, to only use a light wire brush and a sealer to protect the wood. He also recommended creating a trough with gravel for drainage to prevent rotting and to avoid the need to install eaves troughs. Mr. Colby noted that during the restoration, the students only stripped the exterior wood, leaving the interior unaffected. Considering this, there could be evidence of the original colours on the interior wood. The majority of the building, with the exception of the concrete pad, chimney and windows, are original. The framing for the sash and other trim were all fully restored.

It was then,

Moved by: David Webb

Seconded by: Bob Sennett

“That on behalf of the PDHDAC, Bruce Colby be thanked and commended for his work to restore the Locktender’s Shanty.”

CARRIED

The Committee continued discussing Mr. Colby’s restoration and the work involved in performing another restoration. Mr. Colby noted that any extra batten or other left over materials from the initial restoration were placed inside the Shanty. There was also a sloped desk in the Shanty, which, in addition to the extra materials left by Mr. Colby, is no longer there. David Webb proceeded to provide the Committee with recommendations from a report he wrote regarding a second restoration of the Shanty.

It was then,

Moved by: John Bacher

“That the PDHDAC support the restoration of the Locktender’s Shanty and that the following principles be used to guide the restoration:

1. Any replacement of materials be in kind, and research be conducted in this regard to guide restoration efforts;
2. Complete an oral history review to confirm restoration efforts and original materials;
3. Direct the ground slope away from the building (i.e. French drain) to prevent future rot, as an alternative to eaves troughs;
4. Replace rotted boards and battens with staggered scarf joints as opposed to whole replacement, or trim and relocated rotted boards in conjunction with whole replacement in the void locations;
5. Assess joint colours of the interior to guide colour choices;
6. Replace former plaques that have gone missing from the site; and

7. Confirm whether restoration materials and sloped desk are being kept in offsite storage.”

CARRIED

4. BUSINESS

4.1. Heritage Permit Application

Address: 23 Main Street

Proposal: To construct a new pitched roof atop the existing flat roof

Applicant: Nick Thanos

File No.: 10.64.144 M4

Application is made to construct a new pitched roof on the existing commercial building at 23 Main Street. The resulting height of the building will be 6.4 metres (21 feet), which is below the maximum permitted height in the zoning by-law. Section 5.3 of the Port Dalhousie Heritage Conservation District Guidelines for Conservation and Change (the “Guidelines”) provides design consideration for upper storey additions, including that the heights of existing roof lines and predominant roof profiles of adjacent buildings should be maintained. There are a number of buildings in the immediate vicinity with similar pitched roofs, and in discussing the matter, the PDHDAC considers the proposal to comply with the Guidelines. It was then,

Moved by: John Bacher

“That the heritage permit application to construct a new pitched roof at 23 Main Street be approved.”

CARRIED

4.2. Heritage Permit Application

Address: 19 Graham Avenue

Proposal: To construct a new roof atop the existing front porch

Applicant: Todd Hildebrand and Marilyn Mason

File No.: 10.64.144 N4

This item was deferred to the August 29th PDHDAC meeting at the request of the applicant.

4.3. Heritage Permit Application

Address: 6 Simcoe Street

Proposal: To demolish the existing enclosed porch and construct a new open air porch, and to demolish the existing detached garage and construct a new detached garage

Applicant: Emmanuelle Gattuso

File No.: 10.64.144 O4

Application is made to demolish the existing enclosed porch and existing detached garage at 6 Simcoe Street. The owner wishes to construct a new open air porch and new detached garage in their place. The owner has not submitted a building inspectors report.

In accordance with PDHDAC protocol, a site visit has been scheduled for July 31 at 5:00pm to provide members an opportunity to view the premises prior to discussing demolition.

It was then,

Moved by: Carlos Garcia

“That consideration of the application to demolish the enclosed porch and detached garage be deferred pending the site inspection scheduled for July 31 at 5:00pm.”

CARRIED

5. NEW/OTHER BUSINESS

There was no new/other business.

6. INFORMATION/CORRESPONDENCE

There was no information/correspondence.

7. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 6:00 pm.

Committee Members should advise Britney Williamson (905-688-5601 (ext. 1704) or brwilliamson@stcatharines.ca) if they are unable to attend the meeting or did not receive the item(s) noted in the agenda.

**Next regular meeting - Thursday, August 29, 2013
(Pending there is business to discuss)
Committee Room #1, Third Floor, City Hall**

G:\Heritage\Port Dalhousie Heritage Committee\Minutes\2013\PDHDAC Minutes 07_25_2013.docx



City of St. Catharines

Planning and Development Services
PO Box 3012, 50 Church Street
St. Catharines, ON L2R 7C2

Phone: 905-688-5600
Fax: 905-688-5873
TTY: 905-688-4TTY (4889)

PORT DALHOUSIE HERITAGE DISTRICT ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Meeting of Thursday, August 29, 2013

PRESENT: John Bacher
David Bergen
Carlos Garcia
Anita Hofmann-Caslin
Norman Rockwell
Jim Rowbottom
Bob Sennett
Holly Washuta
David Webb

STAFF: Jim Riddell, Planning and Development Services
Britney Williamson, Planning and Development Services

REGRETS: Councillor Len Stack

ABSENT: Peter Connolly
David Roberts
Councillor Bruce Williamson

PUBLIC: Frank Basil (1 Lock Street)
David Shihur (6 Simcoe Street)
Vijai Singh (28 Bayview Drive)
Brenda Singh (28 Bayview Drive)
Anthony Meo (17 and 19 Shelley Avenue)
Todd Barber (42 Ann Street)
Diana Continenza (42 Ann Street)

1. CALL TO ORDER

David Webb took the chair and called the meeting to order in Committee Room 1 at 5:00 pm.

2. CONFIRMATION OF PREVIOUS MINUETS

2.1. Thursday, July 25, 2013

Moved by: John Bacher

"That the PDHDAC ratify and adopt the minutes of the PDHDAC meeting held Thursday, July 25, 2013, copies having been previously distributed."

CARRIED

3. BUSINESS

3.1. Heritage Permit Application – continuation of discussion

Address: 1 Lock Street

Proposal: To install a new electronic wall sign on the south elevation

Applicant: Neon By-Onyx Ltd. (Bill Richardson)

File No.: 10.64.144 K4

Following the July 25, 2013 meeting, PDHDAC members visited the sign manufacturers to view the proposed electronic wall sign. The Owner was present to answer questions from the PDHDAC.

Britney Williamson reiterated Sections 4.3.2 and 5.7 of the Guidelines, which are applicable to signage. Comments centred around fit, context of the heritage district, implications of the kinetic aspect of the sign, and lack of control to regulate. Upon discussion, the Committee did not believe the proposal complies with the Guidelines and that approval of such a sign would set an undesirable precedent within the district. Britney noted that although the sign complies with both the City and Regional sign by-laws, the by-laws do not give consideration to location within a heritage district.

It was then,

Moved by: Carlos Garcia

Seconded by: Norm Rockwell

"That the heritage permit for the proposed electronic sign on the south elevation of the existing building at 1 Lock Street be denied."

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

3.2. Heritage Permit Application – continuation of discussion

Address: 6 Simcoe Street

Proposal: To demolish the existing enclosed porch and construct a new open air porch, and to demolish the existing detached garage and construct a new detached garage

Applicant: Emmanuelle Gattuso

File No.: 10.64.144 O4

Following the July 25, 2013 meeting, PDHDAC members visited the property on July 31 at 5:00pm to inspect the existing porch and detached garage proposed

to be demolished. David Webb prepared a summary of his inspection noted, which was circulated to Committee members in advance of the meeting. David Shihur was present to answer questions on behalf of the Owner.

The Committee discussed the proposed demolition of the porch first. Comments centred on dateability of the enclosure, structural condition, and neoclassical design of the existing porch roof in relation to the proposed simplified shed roof. The Committee then rated the porch using the Rating System for Demolition, which resulted in a score of 33.75 out of 100, which means demolition may be considered.

It was then,

Moved by: David Bergen

“That the demolition of the enclosed porch at 6 Simcoe Street may be considered.”

CARRIED

The Committee proceeded to discuss demolition of the detached garage. Comments centred on dateability, and David Webb noted that the garage is likely post WWII, and the poor condition of the existing structure. The Committee then rated the detached garage using the Rating System for Demolition, which resulted in a score of 23 out of 100, which means demolition may be considered.

It was then,

Moved by: David Bergen

“That the demolition of the detached garage at 6 Simcoe Street may be considered.”

CARRIED

The Committee then discussed the proposal to construct a new porch and detached garage in place of the existing. There was discussion about the proposed simplified roof line and Committee members' preference of the existing neoclassical roof. It was also noted that a steeper pitch on the proposed garage roof is preferred.

It was then,

Moved by: Norm Rockwell

“That the heritage permit application to construct a new porch, revised to include a neoclassic roof design in kind with the existing, at 6 Simcoe Street be approved.”

CARRIED

Moved by: Carlos Garcia

“That the heritage permit application to construct a new detached garage at 6 Simcoe Street be approved, and that the Owner is encouraged to revise the design to make the roof higher.”

CARRIED

3.3. Heritage Permit Application – REVISED

Address: 28 Bayview Drive

Proposal: To construct a new two storey dwelling

Applicant: Vijai Singh

File No.: 10.64.144 G4

The application to construct a new two storey dwelling was deferred from the February 28, 2013 PDHDAC meeting pending the Committee of Adjustment decision on the minor variance application. The proposal was revised by the applicant, and variances from the zoning by-law are no longer required. Vijai Singh was present to answer questions about the revised proposal.

Britney Williamson provided a summary of the changes, including a smaller building footprint and attached garage at grade. Britney referenced Section 5.5 and 5.6 of the Guidelines, which set out policies to evaluate proposals for new construction. Comments from the Committee centred on the modern design, which lends itself to the eclectic character of the neighbourhood, conformity of the flat roof to the Guidelines, and the constraints of the lot.

It was then,

Moved by: David Bergen

“That the heritage permit application to construct a new two storey dwelling with attached garage at 28 Bayview Drive be approved.”

CARRIED

Carlos Garcia and John Bacher noted that they were opposed to the motion.

3.4. Heritage Permit Application

Address: 19 Graham Avenue

To construct a new roof atop the existing front porch

Applicant: Todd Hildebrand and Marilyn Mason

File No.: 10.64.144 N4

Application is made to construct a new roof on top of the existing front porch at 19 Graham Avenue. The application was deferred from the July 25, 2013 meeting at the request of the applicant. Section 4.2.6 of the Guidelines details design considerations for entrances. The proposed roof will facilitate the protection and maintenance of the porch and enhance the streetscape presence of the building. Front yard porches are characteristic of the established streetscape on Graham Avenue. After some discussion about the proposed stone skirt, it was then,

Moved by: Carlos Garcia

“That the heritage permit application to construct a new roof on top of the existing porch at 19 Graham Avenue, as illustrated on the plans received in Planning and Development Services on August 7 and 8, 2013, be approved .”

CARRIED

3.5. Heritage Permit Application – Clarification (should be 17 Shelley Avenue)

Address: 19 Shelley Avenue

Proposal: To construct a new 865 ft², 2 storey, single detached dwelling

Applicant: Premier Homes of Niagara (Anthony Meo)

File No.: 10.64.144 J4

At their June 27, 2013 meeting, PDHDAC approved a heritage permit to construct an 865 ft², 2 storey, single detached dwelling at 19 Shelley Avenue. The Owner has since submitted clarification that the application was intended for 17 Shelley Avenue. The plans differ slightly because 17 Shelley Avenue has 30 feet of frontage and 19 Shelley Avenue has 40 feet of frontage.

It was then,

Moved by: John Bacher

“That the heritage permit originally approved for 19 Shelley Avenue (File No. 10.64.144 J4) be revised to 17 Shelley Avenue.”

CARRIED

3.6. Heritage Permit Application

Address: 19 Shelley Avenue

Proposal: To construct a new 850 ft², 2 storey, single detached dwelling

Applicant: Premier Homes of Niagara (Anthony Meo)

File No.: 10.64.144 P4

Application is made for a heritage permit to construct a new 850 ft², two storey, single detached dwelling. The applicant was present to answer questions. The Port Dalhousie Heritage Conservation District Guidelines for Conservation and Change (the "Guidelines") set out policies to evaluate proposals for new construction in Section 5.5 and 5.6.

It was then,

Moved by: David Bergen

"That the heritage permit for the proposed 850 ft², 2 storey, single detached dwelling at 19 Shelley Avenue be approved."

CARRIED

4. NEW/OTHER BUSINESS

There was no new business.

5. INFORMATION/CORRESPONDENCE

5.1. Heritage Permit – Update

Address: 42 Ann Street

Regarding: Front door style, colouration of stone, siding, soffit and fascia/trough, landscaping design

Applicant: Diana Continenza

File No.: 10.64.144 D4

At a special meeting on February 7, 2013, PDHDAC approved a heritage permit application for a new dwelling at 42 Ann Street. At that time, the Committee passed a motion recommending that the Owners soften the privacy wall along the north portion of the west elevation with landscaping or planters. The Owner has since retained Todd Barber (Forest Green Creations Inc.) to design the landscape for the property.

Todd reviewed the proposed changes to the plans, which include a larger front door and smaller transom windows (no changes to the opening size is proposed), landscaping, and stone wall along the front lot line. The stone wall will be 30" high with 30" glass panels on top, and will not block views to the lake from the adjacent parkette. No formal heritage permit approval is required for the stone

wall, which is non-retaining, landscaping or revised door.

It was then,

Moved by: John Bacher

“That the PDHDAC received the update regarding 42 Ann Street for information purposes.”

CARRIED

6. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 6:05 pm.

The next regular meeting is scheduled for Thursday, September 26, 2013 (Pending there is business to discuss).

Committee Members should advise Britney Williamson (905-688-5601 (ext. 1704) or brwilliamson@stcatharines.ca) if they are unable to attend the meeting or did not receive the item(s) noted in the agenda.

Minutes prepared by:
Britney Williamson
Planning and Development Services

G:\Heritage\Port Dalhousie Heritage Committee\Minutes\2013\PDHDAC Minutes 08_29_2013.docx



City of St. Catharines

Planning and Development Services
PO Box 3012, 50 Church Street
St. Catharines, ON L2R 7C2

Phone: 905-688-5600
Fax: 905-688-5873
TTY: 905-688-4TTY (4889)

ST. CATHARINES HERITAGE COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Meeting of Thursday, June 13, 2013

PRESENT: Evan Acs
John Bacher
Gail Benjafield
Heather Foss
John Haynes
Calvin Jessome
Robin McPherson
Marty Mako
Brian Narhi

STAFF: Kailen Goerz, Planning and Development Services
Anthony Martuccio, Transportation and Environmental Services
Kristen Sullivan, Recreation and Community Services
Britney Williamson, Planning and Development Services

COUNCIL: Mathew Siscoe, Councillor

REGRETS: Dennis Gannon

ABSENT: Chris Loat

PUBLIC: Laura Collings, Climate Action Niagara

1. CALL TO ORDER

Robin McPherson took the chair and called the meeting to order in Committee Room 1 at 5:01 p.m.

2. CONFIRMATION OF PREVIOUS MINUTES

2.1. Meeting of SCHC, Thursday, May 9, 2013

Moved by: Mathew Siscoe
Seconded by: John Bacher

"That the SCHC ratify and adopt the minutes of the SCHC meeting as revised, held Thursday, May 9, 2013, copies having been previously distributed."

CARRIED

2.2. Thursday, May 30, 2013 - Special Meeting

Moved by: Calvin Jessome
Seconded by: Brian Narhi

"That the SCHC accept the minutes of the SCHC meeting as revised, held Thursday, May 30, 2013, copies having been previously distributed"

CARRIED

3. BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES

3.1. Climate Action Niagara- request for formal letter of support from the SCHC

John Bacher declared a conflict of interest.

Evan Acs arrived at 5:13 p.m.

Further to the May meeting, Laura Collings has requested a letter from the SCHC in support of the Tree Hunt. Any financial support would assist in advertising, outreach and resources. Laura has specifically requested \$250.00 to cover the cost of printing 500 coloured flyers. Britney Williamson noted that the SCHC could print the through the City's print shop at a lower rate. The cost to print 500 colour copies would be \$27.50 plus taxes.

There was further discussion about consent requirements for the Tree Hunt nominations, specifically whether trees could be nominated without owner consent. Laura advised that owner consent is required for every nomination. Other questions centred around nominating groups of trees and accessibility of the nomination forms online.

It was then,

Moved by: John Haynes
Seconded by: Calvin Jessome

"That the SCHC provide a letter of support to CAN regarding the Tree Hunt."

CARRIED

Moved by: Brian Narhi
Seconded by: Gail Benjafield

“That the SCHC supports the Tree Hunt by providing outreach materials (approximately 500 colour copies) to CAN.”

CARRIED

3.2. Library Display update (Britney Williamson)

The library display will be installed on July 3, 2013. Britney Williamson will confirm the time after discussion with John Haynes and library staff.

4. MATTERS REFERRED FROM COUNCIL

There were no matters deferred from Council.

5. DELEGATIONS

There were no new delegations.

6. BUSINESS

6.1. Designated Property Grant Application

Address: 3-5 College Street

Proposal: Replacement of Window and Shingles on Bay Window

File No.: 10.64.143 I1

Application is made for a Designated Property Grant (DPG) for replacement of the bay window on the south-west side of the dwelling at 3-5 College Street. The two and one half storey stucco dwelling was constructed in 1911. The building is referenced in the Yates Street and Area HCD Study Background Report (1994) as being owned by the Newman Family of Newman Brothers Construction for a number of years, and the windows are specifically referenced as an architectural element in the report.

Staff visited the property and inspected the proposed project. The conservation of existing architectural elements that are significant, including repair of original elements such as windows, constitutes eligible work under the DPG guidelines. The proposed work does not require a heritage permit as it does not involve changes to the original building fabric and is considered a “like for like” change. The applicant has submitted two quotes for the replacement, one for casement windows and one for double hung windows. The applicant received a DPG in 2012 for the replacement of the front windows. After some discussion, it was then,

Moved by: John Bacher

Seconded by: Evan Acs

“That approval in principle be granted for a DPG grant for a window replacement project at 3-5 College Street to a maximum of \$1,000.”

CARRIED

6.2. Reports from Sub-Committees

6.2.1. Designations, Plaquing and Ceremonies

6.2.1.1. Request for Framed History for Non-designated Building

Address: 144 St. Paul Street

File No.: 10.64.17 Vol. 2D

A request for a framed history for 144 St. Paul Street was received from the owner of Serendipity Sweets, which occupies a portion of the building. There was further discussion regarding utilizing the Rating System for Built Heritage Resources to prioritize the framed history requests. After some discussion, it was then,

Moved by: Heather Foss

Seconded by: Mathew Siscoe

“That the SCHC approve the request for a Framed History for the Non-designated Building at 144 St. Paul Street.”

CARRIED

In order to assist in researching the framed histories, Brian Narhi has volunteered to hold a training session for committee members on research at the land registry office and special collections. Interested members should contact Britney Williamson, who will co-ordinate a time for the training session.

6.2.2. Public Outreach and Education (POE)

Robin McPherson updated the Committee on the blog. The sub-committee recently held a meeting and assigned tasks.

6.2.3. Research and Inventory

There was no new information from the research and inventory sub-committee.

6.2.4. Heritage Districts

There was an article in the May issue of *Heritage Matters* regarding

Heritage Districts. Britney Williamson circulated the article to committee members by email for information.

6.2.5. War of 1812 Bicentennial

Brian Narhi provided an updated. The Laura Secord Walk is scheduled for June 22, 2013. There will be a Dedication of Allies plaque and a drum making workshop at the museum. The Tall Ships are coming to Port Dalhousie on July 1, 2013. Applications are now being accepted for genealogical certificates. There is a Land Commissioner book being published, which will be beneficial for conducting research.

7. New Business

7.1. Designation of Alexandra School (Robin McPherson)

John Haynes and Mathew Siscoe declared a conflict of interest.

Robin McPherson provided some background regarding the potential loss of Alexandra School. There was discussion regarding third party designation without owner consent and Britney Williamson clarified that owner consent is not a requirement of the Ontario Heritage Act. There was some general discussion about pursuing designation without owner consent.

Brian Narhi provided a brief historical background highlighting, noting that the school was designed by Architect John Wiley and is the third oldest school in the downtown.

It was then,

Moved by: John Bacher

Seconded by: Calvin Jessome

“That the SCHC begin research on the heritage value of Alexandra School for the purposes of pursuing designation.”

CARRIED

7.2. Memorial Park Cenotaph Concept (Anthony Martuccio, Transportation and Environmental Services) (proposed plans enclosed)

Anthony Martuccio made a brief presentation to the committee, noting that Council has allocated funds in the budget to improve landscaping and accessibility design to the Cenotaph. The project will involve removing the current landscaping in order to create an accessible ramp and lighting. All landscape would be replaced after the construction is completed. There is a

potential to add an additional walkway at the rear of the Cenotaph if there is room in the budget. The plans will also be presented to the Veterans for their comments.

Comments from the committee centred around fit of any new landscaping within the existing context of the park, whether the Cenotaph will be impacted by the construction of the Burgoyne Bridge and concerns regarding skateboarders using the ramps.

It was then,

Moved by: Gail Benjafield
Seconded by: Marty Mako

“That the SCHC endorses the redesign of the Cenotaph as proposed.”

CARRIED

8. Information/Correspondence

8.1. By-law 2013-99 (Simplified Meeting Procedures for Advisory Committees)

Britney Williamson informed the Committee that the simplified meeting procedure for Committees of Council was approved by By-Law 2013-99.

9. Adjournment

There being no further items of business, the meeting adjourned at 6:45 p.m.

The next regular meeting is scheduled for Thursday, July 11, 2013.

Britney Williamson will be out of the office during the week of July 8-12, so committee members should advise Sara Epp (905-688-5601 ext. 1708 or sepp@stcatharines.ca) if they are unable to attend the meeting or did not receive the item(s) noted in the agenda.

Minutes prepared by:
Britney Williamson
Planner I
Planning and Development Services

G:\Heritage\St. Catharines Heritage Committee\Minutes\Minutes (2013)\SCHC Minutes 06_13_013.docx



City of St. Catharines

Planning and Development Services
PO Box 3012, 50 Church Street
St. Catharines, ON L2R 7C2

Phone: 905-688-5600
Fax: 905-688-5873
TTY: 905-688-4TTY (4889)

ST. CATHARINES HERITAGE COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Meeting of Thursday, July 11, 2013

PRESENT: Evan Acs
John Bacher
Gail Benjafield
Heather Foss
John Haynes
Calvin Jessome
Robin McPherson
Marty Mako
Brian Narhi

STAFF: Kevin Blozowski, Planning and Development Services
Sara Epp, Planning and Development Services
Jim Riddell, Planning and Development Services

REGRETS: Dennis Gannon
Mathew Siscoe, Councillor

ABSENT: Chris Loat

PUBLIC: Mike Mirabella, 18 Power Glen
John Pisaro, 18 Power Glen

1. CALL TO ORDER

Brian Narhi took the chair and called the meeting to order in Committee Room 1 at 5:05 p.m.

2. CONFIRMATION OF PREVIOUS MINUTES

2.1. Meeting of SCHC, Thursday, June 13, 2013

Moved by: John Bacher
Seconded by: Robin McPherson

"That the SCHC ratify and adopt the minutes of the SCHC meeting as revised, held Thursday, June 13, 2013, copies having been previously distributed."

CARRIED

3. MATTERS REFERRED FROM COUNCIL

There were no matters referred from Council.

4. BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES

4.1. Heritage Permit Application

Address: 18 Power Glen

Proposal: To construct a new 2464.2 ft², 2 storey, single detached dwelling

Applicant: Mike and Susan Mirabella

File No.: 10.64.176C

Application is made for a heritage permit to allow construction of a 229 m² (2464.2 ft²), 2 storey detached dwelling on the subject lands, which are located within the Power Glen Heritage District. John Pisaro and Mike Mirabella made a brief presentation regarding the proposed new dwelling.

Section 5.C.4 of the Power Glen Heritage Conservation District Plan (July, 2010) provides guidelines for new construction in the "2005 Homes" sub area.

According to the guidelines, new construction should be "compatible with adjoining properties and the streetscape; constructed in a manner that avoids replication of other homes, appears new; and be generally no higher than 2 storeys." It was then,

Moved by: John Bacher

Seconded by: Evan Acs

"That the heritage permit application for a 2 storey detached dwelling at 18 Power Glen be approved."

CARRIED

4.2. Designation of Alexandra School

At the June 13, 2013 meeting the Committee passed a motion to conduct research on the history of Alexandra School for the purposes of pursuing designation. In order to implement that direction, Brian Narhi has prepared a report entitled "A Brief History of Alexandra Public School, 82 Henry Street, St. Catharines" (July 2013).

In summary, the original building was designed by Hamilton architectural firm Stewart and Witton and constructed in 1909-10. The school was subsequently enlarged in 1913 and 1916 by Thomas H. Wiley, a prominent St. Catharines architect of the day. The report concludes that Alexandra School still stands today as a reminder of the great population growth and industrial economic prosperity experienced in St. Catharines during the first half of the twentieth century.

The Committee discussed the style of the building and process moving forward. The District School Board of Niagara (DSBN) will be invited to attend the meeting. Staff will provide members with copies of the rating system and forms. It was suggested that a site visit would also be prudent. It was then,

Moved by: John Bacher
Seconded by: Evan Acs

“That the report prepared by Brian Narhi entitled ‘A Brief History of Alexandra Public School, 82 Henry Street, St. Catharines, dated July, 2013’, be received and that the Committee rate the property based on its rating system and provide a recommendation at the next meeting. Representatives from the District School Board of Niagara should be invited to the meeting.”

CARRIED

4.3. Reports from Sub-Committees

4.3.1. Designations, Plaquing and Ceremonies

A plaquing ceremony will be planned for Hostetter cemetery with a date to be set for September or October 2013. The Ten Broeck cemetery may be a candidate for plaquing in 2014; however, it is currently in dire need of maintenance, as it is quite overgrown. The cemetery is located behind Linhaven. The Committee discussed the status of the house plaques and whether they have been ordered. Staff will confirm at the next meeting.

4.3.2. Public Outreach and Education (POE)

The library window display has been installed and has been well received by the public. Possible options for next year's window display were discussed. In particular, a window display regarding “St. Catharines Firsts” was suggested, which would portray a variety of innovations that first appeared in St. Catharines. Alternately, St. Catharines has also been linked to the American Civil War, particularly as a place for confederate sympathizers. A window display could also explore this local connection.

4.3.3. Research and Inventory

There was no new information from the research and inventory sub-committee.

4.3.4. Heritage Districts

There was no new information regarding heritage districts.

4.3.5. War of 1812 Bicentennial

Brian Narhi provided a brief update on the War of 1812 bicentennial

activities. The Laura Secord walk and Tall Ships in Port Dalhousie were both well attended events. The War of 1812 Bicentennial Committee is working on publications and finalizing the genealogy certificates. They are also planning closing events for 2014-2015.

5. NEW BUSINESS

5.1. Gail Benjafield shared a painting by Julie Snider of the Hair Cloth building that she won at a silent auction.

5.2. A new residential development on Vansickle Road may be constructing a new road which could potentially be named after a historically significant person. Gail Benjafield has attempted to contact the developer multiple times to inform them of this potential opportunity. Kevin Blozowski noted that developers are already provided with a list of significant individuals for street names when they apply for their planning applications. It is therefore, up to the discretion of the developer as to what the street will be called.

5.3. Robin McPherson updated the Committee on the status of the blog. The blog will go live once all Committee members have submitted their entries and a proper calendar with release dates is determined.

5.4. Kevin Blozowski informed the Committee of the how heritage has impacted the new draft Zoning By-law. In a meeting with the representatives of Mayholme, they expressed their preference to maintain their cultural facility status. As a result, the site will be zoned institutional.

6. INFORMATION/CORRESPONDENCE

There was no information/correspondence.

7. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further items of business, the meeting adjourned at 6:20 p.m.

The next regular meeting is scheduled for Thursday, August 8, 2013.

Committee members should advise Britney Williamson at 905-688-5601 (Extension 1704) or brwilliamson@stcatharines.ca if they are unable to attend the meeting or did not receive the item(s) noted in the agenda.

Minutes prepared by:
Sara Epp
Senior Planning Student
Planning and Development Services

G:\Heritage\St. Catharines Heritage Committee\Minutes\Minutes (2013)\SCHC Minutes 07_11_13.docx



City of St. Catharines

Planning and Development Services
PO Box 3012, 50 Church Street
St. Catharines, ON L2R 7C2

Phone: 905-688-5600
Fax: 905-688-5873
TTY: 905-688-4TTY (4889)

ST. CATHARINES HERITAGE COMMITTEE (SCHC) MEETING MINUTES

Meeting of Thursday, August 8, 2013

PRESENT: John Bacher
Gail Benjafield
Heather Foss
Robin McPherson
Marty Mako
Brian Narhi
Mathew Siscoe, Councillor

STAFF: Jim Riddell, Planning and Development Services
Britney Williamson, Planning and Development Services

REGRETS: Evan Acs
Dennis Gannon
John Haynes
Calvin Jessome
Chris Loat

PUBLIC: Pamela Minns, Thorold LACAC
Cam Hathaway, DSBN (Superintendent of Planning)
Joe Weinberg, DSBN (Superintendent of Business)
Bob Dunn, DSBN (Manager of Projects and Maintenance)

1. CALL TO ORDER

Robin McPherson took the chair and called the meeting to order in Committee Room 1 at 5:03 p.m.

2. CONFIRMATION OF PREVIOUS MINUTES

2.1. Meeting of SCHC, Thursday, July 11, 2013

Moved by: John Bacher
Seconded by: Gail Benjafield

"That the SCHC ratify and adopt the minutes of the SCHC meeting, held Thursday, July 11, 2013, copies having been previously distributed."

CARRIED

3. MATTERS REFERRED FROM COUNCIL

There were no matters referred from Council.

4. DELEGATIONS

4.1. Pamela Minns, Thorold LACAC

RE: Outreach and Education in Thorold

The SCHC introduced themselves and welcomed Pamela Minns to the meeting. Mrs. Minns made a presentation on outreach and education in the Town of Thorold, noting several tools that Thorold LACAC have used to promote heritage conservation, including the Ontario Heritage Toolkit, optimizing the role of the Committee, and training for new members (by existing members).

Mrs. Minns also discussed the importance of natural heritage, the Heritage Canada Foundation and the role of Business Improvement Areas (BIAs) as a component to heritage preservation. It was noted that BIAs need to be in touch with the rest of the City and that areas identified as BIAs may be eligible for Community Improvement Project (CIP) Grants, which can be a tool used to fund heritage preservation. In Thorold, grants for façade improvements are often offered through the CIP, where the Town matches the cost of façade improvements to a maximum of \$10,000. Façade improvement applications are screened by the Thorold LACAC and have helped to revitalize the streetscape in downtown Thorold. Thorold is also working on a streetscape master plan for downtown, and Mrs. Minns sits on this working committee. Pam noted the important of committee members maintaining a presence in other aspects of community planning to ensure heritage is at the forefront of decision making.

Heritage advocates can also use economics as an argument for preservation, noting that heritage tourism is growing 15% annually. Heritage in Thorold is publicized through local media outlets, which has helped to increase awareness of heritage activities, initiatives and events. Council is also aware of heritage initiatives through regular reports that serve to highlight positive news items. Display boards that provide summary information and photos of designated buildings are also utilized at events to promote built heritage in Thorold. The Mayor has also recognized the importance of heritage resources, and has, for example, sent postcards depicting heritage site for Christmas cards in the past. Heritage in Thorold is further publicized through awards, brochures, walking tours, a website, videos and workshops. Residents have become involved in protecting Thorold's heritage, which is evident by the number of property owners requesting designation.

Pam also noted that the return of Heritage Day (now Family day), lesson about economic stimulus plans in New York state, and implementation of a Heritage

Property Tax Relief Program, where taxes can be reduced by 10-15% where a heritage easement agreement is registered on the property, would also help.

The floor was then opened to committee members. Comments and questions centred on:

- Development of a work plan (Thorold LACAC does develop an annual work plan as part of the budget review process, but new things always arise)
- Identifying long term projects
- How to get people engaged and excited

It was then,

Moved by: Gail Benjafeld

Seconded by: John Bacher

“That the SCHC received the presentation from Pamela Minns regarding public education and outreach in the Town of Thorold, and that the committee thank Mrs. Minns for sharing her experience regarding heritage conservation.”

CARRIED

5. BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES

Councillor Mat Siscoe declared a conflict of interest with regard to Item 5.1.

5.1. Designation of Alexandra School

Continuation of discussion from July meeting

At their June 13, 2013 meeting, the SCHC discussed the potential loss of Alexandra School and passed a motion to begin research on the heritage value of the school for the purposes of pursuing designation. A background report, entitled *A Brief History of Alexandra Public School, 82 Henry Street, St. Catharines, dated July, 2013*, was prepared by Brian Narhi and distributed and received by the committee at the July 11, 2013 meeting.

The report concludes that the school was constructed in 1909-1910 to replace the old St. Patrick's Ward School. The building was designed by the important architectural partnership of Stewart and Witton of Hamilton. Their design represented the new style of school building approved by the Ministry of Education, which was then replacing the one- and two-roomed schools that were so prevalent in nineteenth century Ontario. The building is of some significance since it is probably the only known example of their work to be found in St. Catharines, and possibly in the whole of the Niagara Region.

Representatives from the District School Board of Niagara were present, and Cam Hathaway and Joe Weinberg made brief presentations on behalf of the

DSBN. Comments centred on:

- Background on the accommodation review process, noting that each school site was evaluated to determine whether a new school could be accommodated. Alexandra School was selected as the preferred site provided a portion of George Street was closed to facilitate the use of Catherine Street Park by the DSBN. City Council must decide in favour of the closure and use of this park by the end of September, or the new school will be built at 185 Carlton Street.
- Retaining Alexandra School and constructing an addition poses issues:
 - Retrofit complications
 - 30% cost premium to save building
 - Ministry funding not available to retain because not cost effective
 - Disruption to students
- There are financial implications as well:
 - A need to consolidate and optimize DSBN assets given available funding
 - Requirements to update doors, flooring and entrance modifications to accommodate accessibility requirements
 - Other areas also need to be brought up to AODA Standards
- DSBN is interested in retaining elements of Alexandra School that are feasible to incorporate into the new building
 - Previous new builds have incorporated heritage attributes (cornerstones, date plaques, bells, etc.) to pay homage to the history of the school site
 - Matthews School example (Diamond Trail Public School)
 - Venerino V P Panici Architect Inc. has been retained to design the new school
 - Purple beach tree to be retained in the plan

The floor was then opened to committee members, and questions to the DSBN included:

- Timing
 - If the SCHC had broached preservation earlier, would the DSBN have been more receptive to preservation?
- Architect's experience with heritage restoration
 - The architect was not retained to design around the existing school
- Opportunity to reuse the building
 - Victoria School was cited as an example
- Opportunity to restore and incorporate elements of the building as an alternative
 - The DSBN is open to incorporating elements of the existing school that are not structural components
 - There is a plan to incorporate elements from each of the schools that will be closed to incorporate into the new build
- The availability of funding for expansion to the school

- DSBN will apply for funding either way

The committee then rated the property for potential designation under the Ontario Heritage Act, using the Rating System for Built Heritage Resources. The property was assigned a score of 81.5 out of 100 points, resulting in a Priority 1 building. This means that the building is a High Priority Resource.

It was then,

Moved by: John Bacher
Seconded by: Brian Narhi

“That the SCHC recommend that 84 Henry Street (Alexandra School) be designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act.”

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Moved by: Heather Foss
Seconded by: John Bacher

“That, should Council decide not to designate 84 Henry Street (Alexandra School) under the Ontario Heritage Act, elements of the existing school, as identified through consultation with the St. Catharines Heritage Committee, be salvaged and incorporated into the overall design for the new school as a requirement of the site plan agreement.”

CARRIED

5.2. Reports from Sub-Committees

5.2.1. Designations, Plaquing and Ceremonies

5.2.1.1. Plaquing suggestions from the 1812 Steering Committee (Britney Williamson)

Carla Mackie, Historical Services Co-ordinator and member of the 1812 Steering Committee, forwarded plaquing recommendations from the 1812 Committee for consideration by the SCHC, including:

- Army Central Encampment in downtown St. Catharines
- Niagara and Lakeshore intersection
- Hamilton and Scourge at Lakeside Park

The plaque ideas aim to commemorate significant locations associated with the War of 1812. The 1812 Committee requests that the SCHC give consideration to these plaques as part of the 2014 budget, as plaquing does not fall within the 1812 Committee's mandate.

5.2.2. Public Outreach and Education (POE)

- Robin McPherson advised that the SCHC blog will be live in the next few weeks.
- Gail Benjafield mentioned the mural of downtown St. Catharines in the lobby to the Leonard Hotel (Carlisle Café).
- Calvin Jessome and John Haynes were thanked for their involvement in the library display window.
- The committee will begin work on the next library window display (Spring 2014), which will focus on St. Catharines' firsts to emphasize anything originating in St. Catharines. The museum is willing to assist the Committee but will require advance notice.

5.2.3. Research and Inventory

Britney Williamson provided a brief update, noting that all of the properties with buildings constructed prior to 1876 have been added to a database that includes information on legal description, area/sector of the city, land use associated with the building, construction date, and status (i.e. listed on the register, designated under Part IV or Part V of the OHA, or no status). The Research and Inventory Subcommittee is working to compile information regarding architectural description, historical description, photos and mapping, which will be added to the database as they are completed.

Britney will provide a sample worksheet as part of the research 101 training session that Brian Narhi is leading on Thursday, August 15 at 5pm in Committee Room 1. The inventory is a huge undertaking, and members that are not a part of the sub-committee are encouraged to help out with the remaining research in any way they can.

5.2.4. Heritage Districts

N/A

5.2.5. War of 1812 Bicentennial

Quorum was not reached at the last meeting.

6. NEW BUSINESS

6.1. Culture Development Fund (MTCS) (Brian Narhi, Britney Williamson)

The Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport is offering grants through the Culture Development Fund. The grant seeks to strengthen cultural organizations and their leadership, and includes arts and heritage organizations as well as

municipalities as eligible groups. The grant is set-up in a cost sharing program that can be used in conjunction with other contributions and funding sources, including other grants. Single applicant organizations can apply for up to 50% of the total eligible project costs to a maximum of \$25,000 per year for up to two years. The grant money must be used to support one or more of the four priorities:

- Develop stronger boards and advisory committees
- Create more effective collaborations and partnerships
- Improve planning, financial and digital capabilities
- Make strategic use of emerging new media and social media

The deadline for applications is Friday, September 6, and the application must include audited financial statements, expense quotes for estimated costs, partnership letter, and proof of status. It was suggested that the committee contact Ben Hannon regarding the designation of Walker's Creek as a Cultural Heritage Landscape, and that funding could be utilized to study the area. Committee members noted that the deadline is less than a month away, and won't provide enough time to compile the submission and supporting materials. The committee opted to pass on applying for funding in 2013.

6.2. Work Plan

The Committee discussed the need to conduct research on Glenridge School and Rodman Hall.

It was then,

Moved by: Gail Benjafield
Seconded by: John Bacher

"That the SCHC conduct research on the heritage value of Glenridge School."

CARRIED

7. INFORMATION/CORRESPONDENCE

There was no information/correspondence.

8. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further items of business, the meeting adjourned at 6:55 p.m.

The next regular meeting is scheduled for Thursday, September 12, 2013.

Committee members should advise Britney Williamson at 905-688-5601 (Extension 1704) or brwilliamson@stcatharines.ca if they are unable to attend the meeting or did not receive the item(s) noted in the agenda.

Minutes prepared by:
Sara Epp
Senior Planning Student
Planning and Development Services

G:\Heritage\St. Catharines Heritage Committee\Minutes\Minutes (2013)\SCHC Minutes 08_08_13.docx



City of St. Catharines

Planning and Development Services
PO Box 3012, 50 Church Street
St. Catharines, ON L2R 7C2

Phone: 905-688-5600
Fax: 905-688-5873
TTY: 905-688-4TTY (4889)

ST. CATHARINES HERITAGE COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Meeting of Thursday, September 12, 2013

PRESENT: Evan Acs
John Bacher
Gail Benjafield
John Crawley
Heather Foss
Dennis Gannon
Calvin Jessome
Linda Krause
Robin McPherson
Marty Mako
Brian Narhi
Mathew Siscoe, Councillor
Paul Vance

STAFF: Jim Riddell, Planning and Development Services
Britney Williamson, Planning and Development Services

REGRETS: John Haynes
Chris Loat

PUBLIC: Thomas De Simone (2M Architects Inc.) (Agent, 64 Yates Street)

1. CALL TO ORDER

Brian Narhi took the chair and called the meeting to order in Committee Room 1 at 5:04 p.m.

2. CONFIRMATION OF PREVIOUS MINUTES

2.1. Meeting of SCHC, Thursday, August 8, 2013

Moved by: John Bacher
Seconded by: Robin McPherson

"That the SCHC ratify and adopt the minutes of the SCHC meeting, held Thursday, August 8, 2013, copies having been previously distributed."

CARRIED

Evan Acs arrived at 5:06pm.

3. MATTERS REFERRED FROM COUNCIL

There were no matters referred from Council.

4. BUSINESS

4.1. Heritage Permit Application

Address: 64 Yates Street

Proposal: To demolish existing sunroom and construct new two storey addition

Applicant: 2M Architects Inc. (Thomas De Simone)

File No.: 10.64.143 L1

Application is made for a heritage permit to demolish the existing sunroom at 64 Yates Street, which is located within the Yates Street Heritage District. The applicant is proposing to construct a new two storey addition in its place. Thomas De Simone made a brief presentation regarding the proposal, noting that the sunroom is in poor repair and that the addition will not be visible from the street by virtue of the existing fence and vegetation. The addition will be the same height as the existing building. Britney Williamson noted that Section 5.2 of the Yates Street District Plan provides design considerations for addition to heritage buildings and sites. The committee noted that although the addition will be in the front, it is more in keeping with the style of the building than the existing sunroom. The existing building is also setback substantially from the street. It was noted that the rear of the townhouse block is a fragment of the Springbanks Hotel.

It was then,

Moved by: John Bacher

Seconded by: Evan Acs

“That the heritage permit application to demolish the existing sunroom and construct a new two storey addition at 64 Yates Street be approved.”

CARRIED

4.2. Designated Property Grant Application

Address: 96 Queen Street

Proposal: To replace fascia and soffit

Applicant: Patty and Terry Rempel

File No.: 10.64.136 R

Application is made for a Designated Property Grant (DPG) for replacement of fascia and soffit at 96 Queen Street. The applicant has submitted one quote together with photos of the existing condition. The dwelling was constructed in 1900. Staff visited the property and inspected the proposed project. The proposed work does not require a heritage permit as it does not involve changes to the original building fabric and is considered a “like for like” change. Although the conservation of existing architectural elements that are significant constitutes eligible work under the DPG guidelines, it is unknown whether the fascia and/or soffits are original to the dwelling. Discussion centred on whether replacement of the soffits falls within the routine maintenance category, which is not eligible for a designated property grant.

It was then,

Moved by: John Bacher

Seconded by: Councillor Mathew Siscoe

“That the applicants submit a revised quote that include only replacement of the fascia, together with additional information to demonstrate that the fascia is original to the dwelling.”

CARRIED

4.3. Notice of Intent to Demolish Property on Register of Non-Designated Properties

Address: 57 Lakeshore Road

Applicant: Grey Forest Homes Ltd.

File No.: 10.64.28

Britney Williamson advised that the owner of 57 Lakeshore Road, which is listed on the Register of Non-Designated Properties, has submitted written notice of their intent to demolish the building on the property. The owner is required to provide Council with at least 60 days notice prior to demolition. Brian Narhi noted that the home was likely constructed in the 1880s or 90s, and was originally the Irwin homestead. Comments centred on reasons for the demolition and the possibility of moving the building to reuse it within the redevelopment plan. It was then,

Moved by: John Bacher

Seconded by: Calvin Jessome

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Committee research the heritage value 57 Lakeshore Road for the purposes of pursuing designation.”

CARRIED

A special meeting will be held on October 3, 2013 at 5:00pm in Committee Room 1 to discuss the research and rate the building for heritage value.

4.4. Reports from Sub-Committees

4.4.1. Designations, Plaquing and Ceremonies

Britney Williamson received a request to plaque the old Biersach and Niedermeyer Mobil Directo air raid siren in Kernahan Park. Brian Narhi provided a brief historical background on the siren, noting that although they were common in the city in the 1960s, this may be the only remaining siren in Niagara. Comments centred on ownership of the siren, media coverage, longevity and design of a plaque.

It was then,

Moved by: Gail Benjafield
Seconded by: John Bacher

“That Staff confirm ownership of the air raise siren in Kernahan Park and confirm with the owner that a modest plaque may be installed.”

CARRIED

4.4.2. Public Outreach and Education (POE)

Gail Benjafield provided an update on the research on Glenridge School, noting that the land was purchased in 1910 and the building designed by Nicolson and MacBeth. Pauline Jewett, a former Canadian Member of Parliament, and her sister Carolina also attended the school.

Gail also made note of North Toronto Collegiate, where architectural elements of the original school were incorporated into the courtyard of the new school, commenting on the similarity to Alexandra School. Brian Narhi and Dennis Gannon were also quoted in the Standard in the September 7, 2013 article about Alexandra School.

Councillor Mathew Siscoe left the meeting at 6:07pm.

4.4.3. Research and Inventory

Brian Narhi suggested that research on the heritage inventory be focused on the directories only in an effort to speed up the process, and that a registry office search could be done as part of the designation process.

4.4.4. Heritage Districts

N/A

4.4.5. War of 1812 Bicentennial

There were no updates. The next meeting is in October.

5. NEW BUSINESS

5.1. Comprehensive Zoning By-law- comments on final draft (Britney Williamson)

On September 5, 2013, Britney Williamson circulated a letter from Ellen Savoia regarding the final draft of the Comprehensive Zoning By-law. Over the summer, the final draft was revised based on feedback received during the first round of open houses. The final draft is now complete and available online at www.stcatharines.ca/draftzoningbylaw. In this regard, comments on the final draft by-law are now being requested from the heritage committee. Comments can be sent directly to Ellen Savoia or to Britney.

5.2. Heritage Permit – Update

Address: 27 Power Glen

Regarding: Revisions to Elevations

Applicant: Laurie King

File No.: 10.64.176 A

Britney Williamson advised that the building permit application for 27 Power Glen does not match the heritage permit approval. Because the plans were not submitted before the agenda packages were circulate, committee members did not have time to review the revised plans.

It was then,

Moved by: Evan Acs

Seconded by: John Bacher

“That the revised plan for 27 Power Glen be deferred to the October 5, 2013 meeting, or that the application revise the building permit submission to reflect the original heritage permit approval.”

CARRIED

6. INFORMATION/CORRESPONDENCE

6.1. Updated Committee Membership List (Revised August 2013)

7. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further items of business, the meeting adjourned at 6:30 p.m.

A SPECIAL MEETING IS SCHEDULED FOR OCTOBER 3, 2013. The regular October 10, 2013 meeting is cancelled. The next regular meeting is scheduled for Thursday, November 14, 2013.

Committee members should advise Britney Williamson at 905-688-5601 (Extension 1704) or brwilliamson@stcatharines.ca if they are unable to attend the meeting or did not receive the item(s) noted in the agenda.

Minutes prepared by:
Britney Williamson
Planning and Development Services

G:\Heritage\St. Catharines Heritage Committee\Minutes\Minutes (2013)\SCHC Minutes 09_12_13.docx



City of St. Catharines

Planning and Development Services
PO Box 3012, 50 Church Street
St. Catharines, ON L2R 7C2

Phone: 905-688-5600
Fax: 905-688-5873
TTY: 905-688-4TTY (4889)

ST. CATHARINES HERITAGE COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Meeting of Thursday, October 3, 2013

PRESENT: John Bacher
Gail Benjafield
John Crawley
Heather Foss
Dennis Gannon
Calvin Jessome
Linda Krause
Robin McPherson
Marty Mako
Brian Narhi
Mathew Siscoe, Councillor
Paul Vance

STAFF: Jim Riddell, Planning and Development Services
Britney Williamson, Planning and Development Services
Kate Frankovich, Planning and Development Services

REGRETS: Evan Acs
John Haynes
Chris Loat

1. CALL TO ORDER

Robin McPherson took the chair and called the meeting to order in the Atrium Room at 5:00pm.

2. CONFIRMATION OF PREVIOUS MINUTES

2.1. Meeting of SCHC, Thursday, September 12, 2013

Moved by: John Bacher

“That the SCHC ratify and adopt the minutes of the SCHC meeting held Thursday, September 12, 2013, copies having been previously distributed.”

CARRIED

3. **MATTERS REFERRED FROM COUNCIL**

There were no matters referred from Council.

4. **BUSINESS**

4.1. **Heritage Permit Application- REVISED**

Address: 27 Power Glen

Proposal: To construct a new single detached dwelling

Applicant: Laurie King

File No.: 10.64.176A

The Committee approved a heritage permit to construct a new single detached dwelling at their meeting on October 11, 2012. Subsequently, the Owner applied for a building permit for the dwelling, and the plans submitted did not comply with the heritage permit approval. The Owner made a brief presentation, noting the following revisions to the plan:

- Footprint has decreased by 108 ft² as a result of an easement running along the side of the property
- The roofline has been lowered 5 ft

The Owner advised that the details and finished of the dwelling remain the same.

After some discussion, it was then,

Moved by: John Bacher

“That the revised plans for 27 Power Glen be approved.”

Heather Foss arrived at 5:05pm

4.2. **Notice of Intent to Demolish Property on Register of Non-Designated Properties**

Address: 57 Lakeshore Road

Applicant: Grey Forest Homes Ltd.

File No.: 10.64.28

Britney Williamson advised that the Owners of 57 Lakeshore Road, Grey Forest Homes Ltd., submitted written notice on August 29, 2013, of their intent to demolish the dwelling on the property. The property is listed on the Register of Non-designated Cultural Heritage Properties. Britney advised that the Ontario Heritage Act requires that the Owner provide Council with at least 60 days' notice of their intent to demolish. The Owner's letter was forwarded to Council for information on September 9, 2013, thus the 60 day prior expires on November 7, 2013. The Owner is requesting demolition to accommodate a proposed redevelopment of 16 townhouse units, and because the building is in a state of disrepair.

Brian Narhi prepared a background report, entitled ' *Historical Overview of 57 Lakeshore Road, St. Catharines, Part Lot 18, Concession 1 (Grantham), dated September 20, 2013*', which was distributed to the committee as part of the agenda package. The report concludes that the house was constructed between 1887 and 1890 by local contractor Edwin Nicholson in a vernacular, Queen Anne style popular during the late Victorian period. The house is one of two surviving examples of a Queen Anne style frame farmhouse in St. Catharines. Its deliberate placement near a natural bend in the line of Lakeshore Road ensured the dwelling would be a focal point for passers-by.

The plan is asymmetrical, originally consisting of frame construction with wooden clapboarding. The second storey roof line contains crossed gables featuring wooden shingles in the gable ends, providing added texture and visual interest to the building. The original clapboard and shingle exterior remains *in situ* beneath the modern vinyl siding. The fenestration in the house features three large oriel or bay windows on the ground floor. The east façade of the house features a main front porch supported by simple turned posts, with decorative support brackets and open trellis work. The south facing gable end of the porch echoes the gable ends of the second floor through the use of decorative shingling. The window and door openings and the overall footprint of the structure have not been significantly modified or altered since the time of construction.

The floor was then opened to committee members, and comments centred on:

- Option of relocating the building or incorporating the house into the redevelopment plan;
- Significance of the landscape and mature trees as an indication of the property's agricultural past;
- Importance of clarifying reasons for designation, if the committee recommends designation.

The committee then rated the property for potential designation under the Ontario Heritage Act, using the Rating System for Built Heritage Resources. The property was assigned a score of 74 out of 100 points, resulting in a Priority 1 building. This means that the building is a High Priority Resource.

It was then,

Moved by: Councillor Mat Siscoe

"That the report prepared by Brian Narhi entitled 'Historical Overview of 57 Lakeshore Road, St. Catharines, Part Lot 18, Concession 1 (Grantham), dated September 20, 2013', be received for information purposes, and

That members of the committee and/or staff meet with the owner to explain the significance of the dwelling and the designation process, and

That staff work with the owner to retain the dwelling, the silver maple tree at the rear of the property, and the oak tree at the front of the property within the redevelopment plan.”

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Staff will meet with the developer, and the committee agreed to hold a special meeting on Thursday, October 17, 2013 at 5pm to continue discussions about designating the property. Heather Foss noted her regrets for the special meeting.

5. NEW BUSINESS

5.1. Plaquing Request for Air Raid Siren in Kernahan Park- Update

Britney advised committee members that the City owns the air raid siren, and a plaque can be installed pending allocation of funds from the committee's 2014 budget.

5.2. Request for Designation

Address: 28 St. Paul Street

Applicant: Maria Sleight

File No.: 10.64.182

The Owner of 28-30 St. Paul Street has requested designation of the property under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act. Robin McPherson volunteered to conduct research and prepare a report for the committee's consideration at the November 14th meeting.

6. INFORMATION/CORRESPONDENCE

6.1. Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport InfoSheet: Municipal Financial Incentives for Heritage Properties

7. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further items of business, the meeting adjourned at 6:30 p.m.

The next regular meeting is scheduled for Thursday, November 14, 2013.

Committee members should advise Britney Williamson at 905-688-5601 (Extension 1704) or brwilliamson@stcatharines.ca if they are unable to attend the meeting or did not receive the item(s) noted in the agenda.

Minutes prepared by:
Britney Williamson
Planning and Development Services

G:\Heritage\St. Catharines Heritage Committee\Minutes\Minutes (2013)\SCHC Minutes 10_03_13.docx



City of St. Catharines

Planning and Development Services
PO Box 3012, 50 Church Street
St. Catharines, ON L2R 7C2

Phone: 905-688-5600
Fax: 905-688-5873
TTY: 905-688-4TTY (4889)

ST. CATHARINES HERITAGE COMMITTEE SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES

Meeting of Thursday, October 17, 2013

PRESENT: Evan Acs
John Bacher
Gail Benjafield
John Crawley
Dennis Gannon
Calvin Jessome
Linda Krause
Chris Loat
Robin McPherson
Brian Narhi

STAFF: Kate Frankovich, Planning and Development Services
Judy Pihach, Planning and Development Services
Jim Riddell, Planning and Development Services
Britney Williamson, Planning and Development Services

REGRETS: Heather Foss
Marty Mako
Mathew Siscoe, Councillor
Paul Vance

ABSENT: John Haynes

PUBLIC: Ron Berard, Grey Forest Homes
Patrick Maloney, Sullivan Mahoney LLP

1. CALL TO ORDER

Brian Narhi took the chair and called the meeting to order in Committee Room 1 at - 5:12PM.

2. BUSINESS

2.1. Notice of Intent to Demolish Property on Register of Non-Designated Properties- Continuation of Discussion
Address: 57 Lakeshore Road
Applicant: Grey Forest Homes Ltd.
File No.: 10.64.28

At their October 3, 2013 meeting, the SCHC discussed the notice of intent to demolish the dwelling at 57 Lakeshore Road, and passed a motion to work with the owner in an attempt to save the building and incorporate it within the redevelopment scheme. A background report, entitled '*Historical Overview of 57 Lakeshore Road, St. Catharines, Part Lot 18, Concession 1 (Grantham)*, dated September 20, 2013', was prepared by Brian Narhi and distributed and received by the committee at the October 3, 2013 meeting.

A representative from Grey Forest Homes, Ron Berard, was present to answer questions of the committee. His solicitor, Patrick Maloney, made a brief presentation. Comments centred on:

- Lands are not of cultural heritage value
- No historical associations/significance
- Not sufficient evidence to support designation
- Alterations to the building yield any associations void, specifically:
 - North side porch removed
 - Vinyl siding
 - Insulation beneath siding damaged original cladding
 - Asphalt shingles
 - Chimneys in poor condition
- Interior is in state of disrepair, which detracts from historical significance
- Compliance with the Ontario Building Code would require significant work and cost

The floor was then opened to committee members, and questions included:

- Was the entire dwelling resided with vinyl siding?
 - The entire dwelling is clad in vinyl siding and the original remains underneath
- What work is required to bring the dwelling into a habitable condition?
 - Extensive work (interior has mould and foundation needs repair)
- What is the claim that there are no historical associations based on?
 - Report from a Professional Engineer states that the home is uneconomical to repair, and has been altered significantly
- Have estimates been obtained to determine actual cost of repairs?
 - No
- Why has the dwelling been so neglected?
 - Previously owned by the neighbouring church, which did not have the funds to maintain the property.
- What type of insulation was used?
 - Rigid Styrofoam insulation
- What was the roof originally clad with?
 - Wood shingles, now asphalt

Brian Narhi noted that reuse of the house as a unit within the proposed redevelopment could set this complex apart from others in St. Catharines. The dwelling would be a feature within the redevelopment, and could be restored as a

“painted lady”, which is a term used to describe buildings painted in three or more colors that embellish or enhance their architectural details.

It was then,

Moved by: Evan Acs

“That the property at 57 Lakeshore Road be removed from the Municipal Register of Non-designated properties.”

LOST

Moved by: Calvin Jessome

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Committee recommend that 57 Lakeshore Road be designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act for reasons set out in the report from Brian Narhi dated September 20, 2013,”

CARRIED

John Bacher arrived at 6:05 pm.

The committee then reviewed the breakdown of criteria used to determine whether a property is of cultural value of interest (Ontario Regulation 9/06), in order to scope the reasons for designation.

Moved by: Robin McPherson

“That the evaluation criteria for determining cultural heritage value or interest for 57 Lakeshore Road, as revised (Appendix 1), be adopted by the Committee and included in the report to Council.”

3. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further items of business, the meeting adjourned at 6:15 p.m.

The next regular meeting is scheduled for Thursday, November 14, 2013.

Committee members should advise Britney Williamson at 905-688-5601 (Extension 1704) or brwilliamson@stcatharines.ca if they are unable to attend the meeting or did not receive the item(s) noted in the agenda.

Minutes prepared by:
Britney Williamson
Planning and Development Services

G:\Heritage\St. Catharines Heritage Committee\Minutes\Minutes (2013)\SCHC Minutes 10_17_13.docx

APPENDIX 1- EVALUATION OF CRITERIA FOR DETERMINING CULTURAL HERITAGE VALUE OR INTEREST (O. REG. 9/06)

- **Design or Physical (Architectural) Value:**

- Built c. 1887-90 by William Nicholson (as residence for Dymoke Kerman)
- Remained virtually unchanged in terms of its style, in terms of the street facing facades and form, excluding materials
- Excellent example of vernacular “Queen Anne” style of house construction popular during the late Victorian period
 - Asymmetrical plan
 - Frame construction
 - Wooden clapboarding, re-clad in vinyl siding, and plain wooden trim
 - Cross gable roof, featuring wooden shingle in the gable ends, providing added texture and visual interest
 - Three large oriel or bay windows on ground floor
 - Window and door openings have not been significantly modified or altered
 - Front (main) porch on the east side:
 - Supported by simple turned posts with decorative brackets and open “trellis” work
 - South facing gable end of the front porch echoed the gable ends of the second floor through the use of decorative shingling

- **Historical or Associative Value:**

- Illustrative of the great period of the 1890s of intensive horticulture in Grantham Township
- Dymoke Kerman and family (lived in the house from 1887-1894) established a greenhouse growing business in Grimsby
 - Kerman Avenue in Grimsby is named after this family
- Alexander Bonar Balfour (lived in the house from 1909-1932; however remained in the family until 1960) was appointed the physician in ordinary to Queen Victoria until 1901, and then her son, King Edward VII, at the Royal Infirmary in Scotland

- **Contextual Value:**

- Example of 19th century (Victorian era) farmhouse
- One of two Queen Anne style frame farmhouses in St. Catharines
- Placement near the natural bend in Lakeshore Road marks this house a focal point for anyone passing by



Mayor's Youth Advisory Committee MINUTES

Wednesday, November 20, 2013
Russell Avenue Community Centre

1. Call to Order at 4:40 pm

2. Roll Call

Present: Adam Vassallo, Alexandria Pozojevic, Bayleigh Wells-Young, Catharine Lockhart, Christine Saleeb, Elizabeth Gross, Eva Wan Yu Ren, Ignatiy Kuznyetsov, Jina Nanayakkara, Madeline Dick, Lori Mambella, Matty Hou, Reid Vassallo, Riley Soldwisch, Tiana Dominick.

Absent: Alexandria Kealey, Annie Hinan, Len Stack, Vincent Atallah

Regrets: Maria Malik, Rafik Werfalli, Victoria Kyskov

3. Quorum Is established as 15 of 20 voting members present.

Motion to approve the agenda

Moved by: Bayleigh Wells-Young

Seconded by: Reid Vasallo

CARRIED.

4. Announcements

None.

5. Conflict Of Interest

None

6. Previous Minutes

Motion to move the previous minutes of November 6th 2013 as corrected and circulated.

Moved by: Christine Saleeb

Seconded by: Ignatiy Kuznyetsov

CARRIED.

7. Delegations

None

8. Reports

a) Executive Reports

-Chairperson

None

-Vice Chairperson

None

-Treasurer

Informed the committee of our 800\$ Raised fundraising last year and the 250\$ gained from the Youth Grant. Our Budget sits at 4,250\$ in total.

-Public Relations

Posters/Flyers to be emailed to those interested. Topics such as Cyber bullying, Suicide in teens, etc.

b) City Council Meeting Updates

-Councillor Stack (Absent)

9. Motions

-MYAC website update. The committee decided to add a group photo and individual headshot photo's with each persons name and high school listed underneath.

Motion to set aside time next meeting to take photo's with the intent to update the website.

Moved: Adam Vassallo

Seconded: Elizabeth Gross

- Schoolapalooza. More information is needed to decide whether or not it would be something the committee would be well suited for.

Motion to continue the research

Moved: Alexandria Pozojevic

Seconded: Reid Vassallo

- Representing MYAC at a local Film Festival

Motion to have Bayleigh Wells-Young research and discuss our involvement.

Moved: Alexandria Pozojevic

Seconded: Eva Ren

10. Discussions

- Changed the Youth Forum draft flyer, and plans for the content. Consensus reached that we will keep the theme for our upcoming forum as Mental Health, and include smaller speakers and stations also based around Mental Health for teens in the community.

-MYAC undertook mandatory training of the AODA and completed the knowledge check sheet

- Discussed the idea of the attendance of some or all of our members at the New Years Family Event on Tuesday December 31st

11. Date Of Next Meeting

Wednesday December 4th 2013, 4:30pm

12. Motion to Adjourn

Motion to adjourn at 5:55

Motioned by: Christine Saleeb

Seconded by: Elizabeth Gross

CARRIED