



City of St. Catharines

Planning and Development Services  
PO Box 3012, 50 Church Street  
St. Catharines, ON L2R 7C2

Phone: 905-688-5600  
Fax: 905-688-5873  
TTY: 905-688-4TTY (4889)

## **ST. CATHARINES HERITAGE COMMITTEE SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES**

**Meeting of Thursday, October 17, 2013**

**PRESENT:** Evan Acs  
John Bacher  
Gail Benjafield  
John Crawley  
Dennis Gannon  
Calvin Jessome  
Linda Krause  
Chris Loat  
Robin McPherson  
Brian Narhi

**STAFF:** Kate Frankovich, Planning and Development Services  
Judy Pihach, Planning and Development Services  
Jim Riddell, Planning and Development Services  
Britney Williamson, Planning and Development Services

**REGRETS:** Heather Foss  
Marty Mako  
Mathew Siscoe, Councillor  
Paul Vance

**ABSENT:** John Haynes

**PUBLIC:** Ron Berard, Grey Forest Homes  
Patrick Maloney, Sullivan Mahoney LLP

### **1. CALL TO ORDER**

Brian Narhi took the chair and called the meeting to order in Committee Room 1 at - 5:12PM.

### **2. BUSINESS**

**2.1. Notice of Intent to Demolish Property on Register of Non-Designated Properties- Continuation of Discussion**  
**Address: 57 Lakeshore Road**  
**Applicant: Grey Forest Homes Ltd.**  
**File No.: 10.64.28**

At their October 3, 2013 meeting, the SCHC discussed the notice of intent to demolish the dwelling at 57 Lakeshore Road, and passed a motion to work with the owner in an attempt to save the building and incorporate it within the redevelopment scheme. A background report, entitled '*Historical Overview of 57 Lakeshore Road, St. Catharines, Part Lot 18, Concession 1 (Grantham)*, dated September 20, 2013', was prepared by Brian Narhi and distributed and received by the committee at the October 3, 2013 meeting.

A representative from Grey Forest Homes, Ron Berard, was present to answer questions of the committee. His solicitor, Patrick Maloney, made a brief presentation. Comments centred on:

- Lands are not of cultural heritage value
- No historical associations/significance
- Not sufficient evidence to support designation
- Alterations to the building yield any associations void, specifically:
  - North side porch removed
  - Vinyl siding
  - Insulation beneath siding damaged original cladding
  - Asphalt shingles
  - Chimneys in poor condition
- Interior is in state of disrepair, which detracts from historical significance
- Compliance with the Ontario Building Code would require significant work and cost

The floor was then opened to committee members, and questions included:

- Was the entire dwelling resided with vinyl siding?
  - The entire dwelling is clad in vinyl siding and the original remains underneath
- What work is required to bring the dwelling into a habitable condition?
  - Extensive work (interior has mould and foundation needs repair)
- What is the claim that there are no historical associations based on?
  - Report from a Professional Engineer states that the home is uneconomical to repair, and has been altered significantly
- Have estimates been obtained to determine actual cost of repairs?
  - No
- Why has the dwelling been so neglected?
  - Previously owned by the neighbouring church, which did not have the funds to maintain the property.
- What type of insulation was used?
  - Rigid Styrofoam insulation
- What was the roof originally clad with?
  - Wood shingles, now asphalt

Brian Narhi noted that reuse of the house as a unit within the proposed redevelopment could set this complex apart from others in St. Catharines. The dwelling would be a feature within the redevelopment, and could be restored as a

“painted lady”, which is a term used to describe buildings painted in three or more colors that embellish or enhance their architectural details.

It was then,

Moved by: Evan Acs

“That the property at 57 Lakeshore Road be removed from the Municipal Register of Non-designated properties.”

***LOST***

Moved by: Calvin Jessome

“That the St. Catharines Heritage Committee recommend that 57 Lakeshore Road be designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act for reasons set out in the report from Brian Narhi dated September 20, 2013,”

***CARRIED***

*John Bacher arrived at 6:05 pm.*

The committee then reviewed the breakdown of criteria used to determine whether a property is of cultural value of interest (Ontario Regulation 9/06), in order to scope the reasons for designation.

Moved by: Robin McPherson

“That the evaluation criteria for determining cultural heritage value or interest for 57 Lakeshore Road, as revised (Appendix 1), be adopted by the Committee and included in the report to Council.”

### **3. ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further items of business, the meeting adjourned at 6:15 p.m.

The next regular meeting is scheduled for Thursday, November 14, 2013.

Committee members should advise Britney Williamson at 905-688-5601 (Extension 1704) or [brwilliamson@stcatharines.ca](mailto:brwilliamson@stcatharines.ca) if they are unable to attend the meeting or did not receive the item(s) noted in the agenda.

Minutes prepared by:  
Britney Williamson  
Planning and Development Services

G:\Heritage\St. Catharines Heritage Committee\Minutes\Minutes (2013)\SCHC Minutes 10\_17\_13.docx

## **APPENDIX 1- EVALUATION OF CRITERIA FOR DETERMINING CULTURAL HERITAGE VALUE OR INTEREST (O. REG. 9/06)**

- **Design or Physical (Architectural) Value:**

- Built c. 1887-90 by William Nicholson (as residence for Dymoke Kerman)
- Remained virtually unchanged in terms of its style, in terms of the street facing facades and form, excluding materials
- Excellent example of vernacular “Queen Anne” style of house construction popular during the late Victorian period
  - Asymmetrical plan
  - Frame construction
  - Wooden clapboarding, re-clad in vinyl siding, and plain wooden trim
  - Cross gable roof, featuring wooden shingle in the gable ends, providing added texture and visual interest
  - Three large oriel or bay windows on ground floor
  - Window and door openings have not been significantly modified or altered
  - Front (main) porch on the east side:
    - Supported by simple turned posts with decorative brackets and open “trellis” work
    - South facing gable end of the front porch echoed the gable ends of the second floor through the use of decorative shingling

- **Historical or Associative Value:**

- Illustrative of the great period of the 1890s of intensive horticulture in Grantham Township
- Dymoke Kerman and family (lived in the house from 1887-1894) established a greenhouse growing business in Grimsby
  - Kerman Avenue in Grimsby is named after this family
- Alexander Bonar Balfour (lived in the house from 1909-1932; however remained in the family until 1960) was appointed the physician in ordinary to Queen Victoria until 1901, and then her son, King Edward VII, at the Royal Infirmary in Scotland

- **Contextual Value:**

- Example of 19<sup>th</sup> century (Victorian era) farmhouse
- One of two Queen Anne style frame farmhouses in St. Catharines
- Placement near the natural bend in Lakeshore Road marks this house a focal point for anyone passing by