



City of St. Catharines

Planning and Development Services
PO Box 3012, 50 Church Street
St. Catharines, ON L2R 7C2

Phone: 905-688-5600
Fax: 905-688-5873
TTY: 905-688-4TTY (4889)

PORT DALHOUSIE HERITAGE DISTRICT ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Meeting of Thursday, August 29, 2013

PRESENT: John Bacher
David Bergen
Carlos Garcia
Anita Hofmann-Caslin
Norman Rockwell
Jim Rowbottom
Bob Sennett
Holly Washuta
David Webb

STAFF: Jim Riddell, Planning and Development Services
Britney Williamson, Planning and Development Services

REGRETS: Councillor Len Stack

ABSENT: Peter Connolly
David Roberts
Councillor Bruce Williamson

PUBLIC: Frank Basil (1 Lock Street)
David Shihur (6 Simcoe Street)
Vijai Singh (28 Bayview Drive)
Brenda Singh (28 Bayview Drive)
Anthony Meo (17 and 19 Shelley Avenue)
Todd Barber (42 Ann Street)
Diana Continenza (42 Ann Street)

1. CALL TO ORDER

David Webb took the chair and called the meeting to order in Committee Room 1 at 5:00 pm.

2. CONFIRMATION OF PREVIOUS MINUETS

2.1. Thursday, July 25, 2013

Moved by: John Bacher

"That the PDHDAC ratify and adopt the minutes of the PDHDAC meeting held Thursday, July 25, 2013, copies having been previously distributed."

CARRIED

3. BUSINESS

3.1. Heritage Permit Application – continuation of discussion

Address: 1 Lock Street

Proposal: To install a new electronic wall sign on the south elevation

Applicant: Neon By-Onyx Ltd. (Bill Richardson)

File No.: 10.64.144 K4

Following the July 25, 2013 meeting, PDHDAC members visited the sign manufacturers to view the proposed electronic wall sign. The Owner was present to answer questions from the PDHDAC.

Britney Williamson reiterated Sections 4.3.2 and 5.7 of the Guidelines, which are applicable to signage. Comments centred around fit, context of the heritage district, implications of the kinetic aspect of the sign, and lack of control to regulate. Upon discussion, the Committee did not believe the proposal complies with the Guidelines and that approval of such a sign would set an undesirable precedent within the district. Britney noted that although the sign complies with both the City and Regional sign by-laws, the by-laws do not give consideration to location within a heritage district.

It was then,

Moved by: Carlos Garcia

Seconded by: Norm Rockwell

"That the heritage permit for the proposed electronic sign on the south elevation of the existing building at 1 Lock Street be denied."

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

3.2. Heritage Permit Application – continuation of discussion

Address: 6 Simcoe Street

Proposal: To demolish the existing enclosed porch and construct a new open air porch, and to demolish the existing detached garage and construct a new detached garage

Applicant: Emmanuelle Gattuso

File No.: 10.64.144 O4

Following the July 25, 2013 meeting, PDHDAC members visited the property on July 31 at 5:00pm to inspect the existing porch and detached garage proposed

to be demolished. David Webb prepared a summary of his inspection noted, which was circulated to Committee members in advance of the meeting. David Shihur was present to answer questions on behalf of the Owner.

The Committee discussed the proposed demolition of the porch first. Comments centred on dateability of the enclosure, structural condition, and neoclassical design of the existing porch roof in relation to the proposed simplified shed roof. The Committee then rated the porch using the Rating System for Demolition, which resulted in a score of 33.75 out of 100, which means demolition may be considered.

It was then,

Moved by: David Bergen

“That the demolition of the enclosed porch at 6 Simcoe Street may be considered.”

CARRIED

The Committee proceeded to discuss demolition of the detached garage. Comments centred on dateability, and David Webb noted that the garage is likely post WWII, and the poor condition of the existing structure. The Committee then rated the detached garage using the Rating System for Demolition, which resulted in a score of 23 out of 100, which means demolition may be considered.

It was then,

Moved by: David Bergen

“That the demolition of the detached garage at 6 Simcoe Street may be considered.”

CARRIED

The Committee then discussed the proposal to construct a new porch and detached garage in place of the existing. There was discussion about the proposed simplified roof line and Committee members' preference of the existing neoclassical roof. It was also noted that a steeper pitch on the proposed garage roof is preferred.

It was then,

Moved by: Norm Rockwell

“That the heritage permit application to construct a new porch, revised to include a neoclassic roof design in kind with the existing, at 6 Simcoe Street be approved.”

CARRIED

Moved by: Carlos Garcia

“That the heritage permit application to construct a new detached garage at 6 Simcoe Street be approved, and that the Owner is encouraged to revise the design to make the roof higher.”

CARRIED

3.3. Heritage Permit Application – REVISED

Address: 28 Bayview Drive

Proposal: To construct a new two storey dwelling

Applicant: Vijai Singh

File No.: 10.64.144 G4

The application to construct a new two storey dwelling was deferred from the February 28, 2013 PDHDAC meeting pending the Committee of Adjustment decision on the minor variance application. The proposal was revised by the applicant, and variances from the zoning by-law are no longer required. Vijai Singh was present to answer questions about the revised proposal.

Britney Williamson provided a summary of the changes, including a smaller building footprint and attached garage at grade. Britney referenced Section 5.5 and 5.6 of the Guidelines, which set out policies to evaluate proposals for new construction. Comments from the Committee centred on the modern design, which lends itself to the eclectic character of the neighbourhood, conformity of the flat roof to the Guidelines, and the constraints of the lot.

It was then,

Moved by: David Bergen

“That the heritage permit application to construct a new two storey dwelling with attached garage at 28 Bayview Drive be approved.”

CARRIED

Carlos Garcia and John Bacher noted that they were opposed to the motion.

3.4. Heritage Permit Application

Address: 19 Graham Avenue

To construct a new roof atop the existing front porch

Applicant: Todd Hildebrand and Marilyn Mason

File No.: 10.64.144 N4

Application is made to construct a new roof on top of the existing front porch at 19 Graham Avenue. The application was deferred from the July 25, 2013 meeting at the request of the applicant. Section 4.2.6 of the Guidelines details design considerations for entrances. The proposed roof will facilitate the protection and maintenance of the porch and enhance the streetscape presence of the building. Front yard porches are characteristic of the established streetscape on Graham Avenue. After some discussion about the proposed stone skirt, it was then,

Moved by: Carlos Garcia

“That the heritage permit application to construct a new roof on top of the existing porch at 19 Graham Avenue, as illustrated on the plans received in Planning and Development Services on August 7 and 8, 2013, be approved .”

CARRIED

3.5. Heritage Permit Application – Clarification (should be 17 Shelley Avenue)

Address: 19 Shelley Avenue

Proposal: To construct a new 865 ft², 2 storey, single detached dwelling

Applicant: Premier Homes of Niagara (Anthony Meo)

File No.: 10.64.144 J4

At their June 27, 2013 meeting, PDHDAC approved a heritage permit to construct an 865 ft², 2 storey, single detached dwelling at 19 Shelley Avenue. The Owner has since submitted clarification that the application was intended for 17 Shelley Avenue. The plans differ slightly because 17 Shelley Avenue has 30 feet of frontage and 19 Shelley Avenue has 40 feet of frontage.

It was then,

Moved by: John Bacher

“That the heritage permit originally approved for 19 Shelley Avenue (File No. 10.64.144 J4) be revised to 17 Shelley Avenue.”

CARRIED

3.6. Heritage Permit Application

Address: 19 Shelley Avenue

Proposal: To construct a new 850 ft², 2 storey, single detached dwelling

Applicant: Premier Homes of Niagara (Anthony Meo)

File No.: 10.64.144 P4

Application is made for a heritage permit to construct a new 850 ft², two storey, single detached dwelling. The applicant was present to answer questions. The Port Dalhousie Heritage Conservation District Guidelines for Conservation and Change (the "Guidelines") set out policies to evaluate proposals for new construction in Section 5.5 and 5.6.

It was then,

Moved by: David Bergen

"That the heritage permit for the proposed 850 ft², 2 storey, single detached dwelling at 19 Shelley Avenue be approved."

CARRIED

4. NEW/OTHER BUSINESS

There was no new business.

5. INFORMATION/CORRESPONDENCE

5.1. Heritage Permit – Update

Address: 42 Ann Street

Regarding: Front door style, colouration of stone, siding, soffit and fascia/trough, landscaping design

Applicant: Diana Continenza

File No.: 10.64.144 D4

At a special meeting on February 7, 2013, PDHDAC approved a heritage permit application for a new dwelling at 42 Ann Street. At that time, the Committee passed a motion recommending that the Owners soften the privacy wall along the north portion of the west elevation with landscaping or planters. The Owner has since retained Todd Barber (Forest Green Creations Inc.) to design the landscape for the property.

Todd reviewed the proposed changes to the plans, which include a larger front door and smaller transom windows (no changes to the opening size is proposed), landscaping, and stone wall along the front lot line. The stone wall will be 30" high with 30" glass panels on top, and will not block views to the lake from the adjacent parkette. No formal heritage permit approval is required for the stone

wall, which is non-retaining, landscaping or revised door.

It was then,

Moved by: John Bacher

“That the PDHDAC received the update regarding 42 Ann Street for information purposes.”

CARRIED

6. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 6:05 pm.

The next regular meeting is scheduled for Thursday, September 26, 2013 (Pending there is business to discuss).

Committee Members should advise Britney Williamson (905-688-5601 (ext. 1704) or brwilliamson@stcatharines.ca) if they are unable to attend the meeting or did not receive the item(s) noted in the agenda.

Minutes prepared by:
Britney Williamson
Planning and Development Services

G:\Heritage\Port Dalhousie Heritage Committee\Minutes\2013\PDHDAC Minutes 08_29_2013.docx