

# St. Catharines Heritage Permit Advisory Committee

## **Minutes** **Thursday November 24, 2022** **Electronic Participation at 2:30 pm**

### **Members:**

Brian Narhi  
John Crawley  
David Bergen  
John Bacher  
Holly Washuta

### **Regrets:**

Andrew Humeniuk  
Robert De Wolfe

### **Staff Liaison:**

James Neilson, Heritage Planner, Planning and Building Services  
Tami Kitay, Director of Planning and Building Services  
Margaret Josipovic, Manager, Planning and Building Services

### **Council**

Councillor Carlos Garcia

---

#### **1. Call meeting to order (Chair)**

Chair Narhi called the meeting to order at 2:30 p.m.

#### **2. Recognition of Traditional Territories**

Chair Narhi acknowledged that the land on which we gather is the traditional territories of the Haudenosaunee and Anishinaabe peoples, many of whom continue to live and work here today. This territory is covered by the Upper Canada Treaties and is protected by the Dish with One Spoon Wampum agreement. Today this land is home to many First Nations, Metis, and Inuit Peoples – who share the land with us. Acknowledging this reminds us that our great standard of living is directly related to the resources and friendship of Indigenous people over many generations.

#### **3. Additions / Deletions to the Agenda**

**Item 9.2** 26 Salina Street – permit for a window replacement.

#### **4. Motion to approve the agenda**

Moved by: David Bergen

"That the SCHPAC adopt the agenda for this SCHPAC meeting held on November 24, 2022, copies have been previously distributed."

**CARRIED**

**5. Motion to adopt the minutes of the previous meetings**

Moved by: John Crawley

"That the SCHPAC adopt the minutes of the previous meeting on September 29, 2022."

**CARRIED**

**6. Declarations of Interest**

No declarations of interest.

**7. Presentations (Invited Guests)**

1. Regarding Item 9.1  
John and Morna Alhstedt, Owners, 15 Trafalgar Street
2. Regarding Item 9.2  
Tara Feskun, Owner, 26 Salina Street

**8. Business arising from the minutes**

No business arising from the Minutes.

**9. Business**

**9.1 15 Trafalgar Street**

The owners, John and Morna Alhstedt presented the application for a heritage permit for the proposed alterations to the front landscaping. The application is to remove the bushes and shrubs in front of the front door and replace it with a patio with a short, traditional brick and metal fence that is similar to other properties on Yates Street.

David Bergen commented that the low height of the proposed fencing will look nice with the surrounding area.

Tami Kitay, Director of Planning and Building Services advised that due to the corner location of the lot, the brick wall will have to comply with the City's By-law for fencing.

Moved by: David Bergen

"That the SChPAC recommends approval of the proposed application for 15 Trafalgar Street."

**CARRIED**

## **9.2 26 Salina Street**

The owner, Tara Feskun presented the application for window replacement. The application is to preserve the look of the house while needing to replace some windows that are in disrepair. Some windows are missing hardware and do not close properly. The windows on the second and third floor would be replaced, as well as the basement windows. The new windows would look the exact same though in vinyl.

Brian Narhi asked about the overall condition of the windows. The owner said that most of the windows are not functional. Brian said that it would be a shame to throw these windows away even if they are just missing pieces. The owner agreed and stated that they have tried to reach out to find someone to fix the existing windows but have not been able to find anyone to even come to check them out. The owner stated that the old original windows will remain in the house for future use.

David Bergen stated that the old windows should be replaced.

Councillor Garcia asked the owner if they had contacted Crowland Sash and Frame, a window supplier in Welland. The owner shared their experience with that company and noted that they called them numerous times since the Spring but did not receive a callback. Another contractor informed the owner that restoring the original windows would cost significantly more than replacing them.

Moved by: David Bergen

"That the SChPAC recommend approval of the proposed window replacement at 26 Salina Street."

**CARRIED**

## **9.3 Heritage Committee Update**

James Neilson spoke about the province's Bill 23 legislation. Staff recently brought forward a report to Council which was endorsed unanimously. The proposed changes will impact the Ontario Heritage Act including Heritage Registers, Designations, Heritage Districts, adherence to provincial standards and guidelines and regulations. Overall, in the opinions of heritage professionals, these changes will have a negative impact on heritage preservation across the province.

As part of Bill 23, listed properties will only remain on the register for up to two years. If a property is not designated within two years, then it will be removed and not able to be re-added for five years. The existing Register will need to be reviewed and properties re-prioritized to determine which properties should be the focus of designation efforts. Almost two-thirds of the listed properties in St Catharines are within the City's downtown, which is where a lot of the forecasted growth will occur within the next 10 years. James outlined the reasons why a register is good urban planning and what the loss of these buildings from the Register might mean for the future of these buildings. Staff will now need to list and designate properties within 90-days of planning application submissions, which will put a strain on resources and create issues for collaborating with applicants on heritage-related applications.

James noted that a number of the changes were dependent on new regulations which have not been released at this time. These largely pertain to the determining heritage value for Heritage Conservation Districts and amending and repealing HCD Plans. The changes related to heritage districts may actually be positive for the City as the HCDs in St Catharines are quite old and could benefit from updated plans and guidelines.

The Provincial Governments, Ministries, and public bodies will be able to override heritage standards and guidelines if the exemption would advance transit, housing, health, long-term care, or other infrastructure projects. It is not clear at this time how this may affect the City. Additionally, changes are proposed for how archaeology is handled. Previously, it was the responsibility of the Region however, the Region will no longer be part of the planning process. It will now be the responsibility of the City to monitor archaeology though it is not clear how this transition will take place, especially after the Region recently adopted a new Archaeological Management Plan.

As part of the potential next steps, the idea of proposing a Heritage District in the downtown was suggested rather than having to designate the large number of properties individually. This would need the approval of Council. Regarding the proposed Bill 23, there are still many uncertainties and implications that are unknown, though generally this will have a serious negative impact on heritage in the city.

Councilor Garcia asked about the process for creating a downtown heritage district. Margaret Josipovic, Manager of Planning and Building Services

answered the question. We will need to wait to see if the Bill receives royal ascent so we can see what the regulations look like. Once this moves forward, she advised that the Councillor can request a report from staff outlining the timing, the process, and any other details on the budget of what would be required for the study and the implementation.

John Bacher suggested passing a motion endorsing the Heritage Committee's endorsement of a downtown heritage district study.

Brian Narhi asked about the 11,000-dwelling target and whether there was a distinction about the type of units? Margaret Josipovic answered by saying that it is based on the number of units. In the past, the number of units and jobs was calculated and there would be a ratio that you apply to the number of people to a type of unit. The province seems to be moving away from this and did not specify the types of units or bedrooms.

Councilor Garcia asked about the implication of having a heritage conservation district in the downtown as there would need to be defined borders. James Neilson answered by saying that we would have a study area which would be used to help define the eventual district boundary. The heritage conservation district would not just look at properties already on the register but also properties that would need to be protected that are not on the register.

Moved by: John Bacher

"That the SCHPAC receives the information about Bill 23 from James Neilson

And that the SCHPAC supports the recommendation of the SCHAC that the City pursue a heritage conservation district study and plan as a result of the changes to the Ontario Heritage Act proposed under Bill 23."

**CARRIED**

Chair Narhi provided an update for the plans for the Hostetter-Cooke Cemetery. It's a small family burial in Port Weller, which has had its grave markers removed or vandalized over time. The Heritage Advisory Committee is having new granite tombstones cut to identify the burials, with the stones intended to match the design of mid-nineteenth century tombstones. The stone are currently being designed and will hopefully be ready for the Spring. John Bacher suggested doing this for other sites.

Moved by: David Bergen

"That the SCHPAC receives the updated information from Chair Narhi about the Hostetter-Cooke Cemetery."

**CARRIED**

**10. Items of Correspondence**

James Neilson spoke about the upcoming application for 31 Brock Street. Recently there was an application for alterations to the house, which was approved by the Committee, however, upon further investigation into the house, it was determined that there was a lot more damage behind the walls and other areas. As such, the owner is applying for a demolition permit to fix the structural concerns and rebuild according to the previously approved plans. James notified the group that a few members were able to attend a site visit, and that other members are welcome to view the house if requested.

**11. Date of the next meeting**

December 22, 2022, at 2:30 p.m.

**12. Motion to Adjourn**

Moved by: John Bacher

“That the SChPAC meeting be adjourned at 3:26 p.m.

**CARRIED**